Public Relations’ Role within Division III Collegiate Competition: How Should Coaches Focus Their Restricted Resources to Better Use PR?

Jordan Clark-Mand, author
Miles Maguire, journalism, faculty adviser

Jordan Clark-Mand graduated cum laude from UW Oshkosh in May 2010. As a journalism major and English minor, her emphases were in public relations and creative writing. She was nominated scholar-athlete by the Wisconsin Intercollegiate Athletic Conference and also received academic All-America honors in cross country and track. She received the Honors Medallion after completing the requirements of the University Honors Program. This article is based on her Honors thesis.

Miles Maguire is an associate professor in the department of journalism at UW Oshkosh. He is a former newspaper reporter, magazine editor, and publishing executive. He holds a master’s degree in business administration from Loyola College I Maryland, and his research, which has been presented in Asia and Europe as well as North America, focuses on media economics.

Abstract

Any coach would say it is important for an athletic program to present itself well for others, but how many could tell what they do to project their desired image? Through an online survey and interviews with coaches within the Wisconsin Intercollegiate Athletic Conference, I have set out to find the extent formal public relations (PR) techniques are consciously used by coaches in Division III (DIII) athletics and the extent coaches would use PR if they had more resources. Both survey results and interview notes show that coaches’ priorities demonstrate a need for formal PR efforts, that these needs are not always met due to budgets, lack of staff, etc., and that efficient, practical solutions would be welcomed by most DIII coaches. Through information acquired in interviews, as well as sports-oriented articles, this project offers a variety
of practical recommendations coaches (and others) can use to project their desired image with limited resources.

**Introduction and Literature Review**

The father of public relations, Edward Bernays (1947), said that leaders influence their followers and whoever influences the leaders influences all those who follow the leader. Through this thinking, Bernays brought about the modern techniques PR practitioners use today. *Leaders* encompasses many different job titles; one can see how athletic coaches are included—they have strong influence over others. But are coaches thought of as PR practitioners? Do they themselves understand their promotional role? These questions are what I have set out to answer. And while there is little research on the public relations involved in Division III (DIII) collegiate athletics, the need for efficient PR in that division is the highest simply because DIII coaches usually have the fewest resources (staff, budget, etc.) compared to other divisions, which can be seen in budget reports from the Office of Postsecondary Education of the U.S. Department of Education (2009).

The challenge was to determine National Collegiate Athletic Association (NCAA) DIII coaches’ attitudes toward PR within their daily responsibilities and the extent those coaches would use PR if they had more resources (*public relations* are defined as actions “intended to create goodwill for a person or institution”) (Princeton University 2009). With competitive college programs and technology that is constantly improving communication methods, PR can play an unprecedented role in how coaches present their programs to the audiences they wish to influence. It is important for coaches in all divisions to use PR effectively and responsibly.

There is virtually no published research on PR in DIII to use as a guide. Some research on the responsibilities in team marketing and PR behind recruiting has been done with DI
athletic programs (Hatfield, Wrenn, and Bretting 1987; Summers and Morgan 2008) but the differences in resources make it difficult to base my methods off of their results. By comparing the responses of coaches within the Wisconsin Intercollegiate Athletic Conference (WIAC), current attitudes toward PR techniques can be found within the conference and general recommendations can be made to improve the PR used in DIII athletics in the future.

The NCAA encourages athletic programs to commercialize in higher education (Wolverton 2008). According to Wolverton, Myles Brand, the group’s president, said that college sports create revenues up to $10 billion a year and that NCAA universities have an obligation to fend for themselves by using commercial resources to their advantage. Although DIII is usually not thought of as creating revenue in the same way as DI and DII, DIII is not omitted from Brand’s obligations. Money appears to be the driving force in many college-level sports, regardless of the competition level (Hatfield, Wrenn, and Bretting 1987). And budgets toward PR allow athletic staff to show their programs to prospective student-athletes in a much more impressive way (Goss, Jubenville, and Orejan 2006). Many researchers have investigated revenue-oriented PR on a professional level. Major League Baseball sponsors and other sports entities spend funds on cross-promotions (Journal of Sports Management 1992) and cutting-edge mobile technology (Tucker 2008) to keep fans more involved and, in turn, spending more money. Expecting to find professional general managers to be more focused on the hands-on aspects of coaching, like player personnel evaluations, and less on the financial aspects, these researchers have found that general managers have a strong interest in monetary concerns and less-than-expected regard for PR and even coaching experiences and athletic participation. DI athletic directors seem even more focused on the financial aspects of the sports (Hatfield, Wrenn, and Bretting 1987). It is surprising that managers of larger programs, which are often in the
media spotlight, do not make strong PR efforts a priority. However, larger programs, like most DI programs, have more staff to help handle the coaching responsibilities, which could be a reason for the disinterest in PR that Hatfield, Wrenn, and Bretting found among DI athletic directors.

While research reveals money is a priority of larger programs’ coaching staff, it is unclear how coaches of smaller programs, like DIII, view the difference between administrative responsibilities and PR. There are many documents and articles aimed toward helping smaller sports programs especially with PR, which might suggest a need for focusing on PR. In *Curriculum Review* (1992), Wiley Cutts, a principal in Montgomery, Alabama, advises sports program leaders to promote an event’s security, to create a booster club, to offer reserved seating and group discount sales, to celebrate special-themed days, and to have articulate coaches and athletes speak before the public. An article in *Sports Management Digest* (1992) recommends getting corporate sponsorship to help take financial concerns off the minds of coaching staff; that same journal presents the advantages of cross-promotional efforts, especially within spectator sports like baseball. Another article highlighting MLB’s success with cross promotions details how daily activities, like writing out checks with team logos and using credit cards with players pictured on them, can be used to promote a sport (Rein, Kotler, and Shields 2007). In *Public Relations Review* (2008), Jane Summers and Melissa Johnson Morgan pushed for PR practices that allow sports celebrities to show their human side with the hope that fans will curb too-high expectations and scrutiny.

Even sports facilities are a part of the financial burden that pushes PR out of coaches’ priorities. Research on hotel chains has shown that marketing teams and PR practitioners carefully selected images of their facilities for advertising because the images become their hotel
in the minds of potential customers. Hotels with less accommodating facilities avoided using images depicting their shortcomings. (Soubeniotis et al. 2007). *Sports Management Digest* (1990) reflects the concern with physical properties by offering that sports entities promote their facilities’ cleanliness and quality of concessions: the experience of going to a particular sporting event should be promoted.

How does the focus on finances and facilities affect DIII sports? Specifically, how do coaches within the WIAC feel about research findings? A small pilot survey I conducted at UW Oshkosh showed a significant emphasis placed on daily organizational tasks. Money matters, registration, transportation, food, and facilities all demand the head coach’s time, where in larger programs those tasks fall to assistants and other staff. The NCAA sets guidelines and expectations for the programs—not the individual universities. In many ways, the pilot survey reflected the degree to which DIII coaches are expected to be self-sufficient. Coaches viewed PR as 10 percent, at the most, of their overall jobs.

The information gathered in the more extensive survey was designed to help coaches decide if their efforts were efficient and if they were doing enough (or too much) to promote their programs. My findings could help coaches with limited resources to improve their PR efforts in the future.

**Discussion**

In general, I expect DIII coaches to recognize the potential value of PR but to have little opportunity to formally implement PR tactics. My pilot survey showed a great deal of self-sufficiency on the coaches’ part in handling their teams; most indicated that they lacked the resources (time, staff, budget, etc.) to focus on PR. If that is the case throughout the WIAC, this
project will showcase best practices by peer coaches and offer steps to maximize results from limited resources.

To initially find the level of attention already paid to public relations in DIII sports, I used an informal pilot survey. As stated in the working thesis, I found that most coaches valued PR (see fig. 1), but felt their resources were too limited to practice as much PR as they needed.

![Fig. 1. "Public Relations are very Important to my Program"](image)

After the pilot survey, I e-mailed a second, more concise survey to see what extent WIAC coaches currently use PR and what extent they would use it if they had ideal resources (more money, staff, time). This would get coaches to think about their existing attitudes toward PR and what formal PR techniques they use to reach their targeted audiences. In asking about PR being used with ideal resources, I tried to find any unexpected priorities that coaches might have.

Both surveys were modeled after the one used in Hatfield, Wrenn, and Bretting (1987) where statements regarding approximately 10 areas of PR were provided and subjects circled the
level of approval they identified with (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree). The online survey was available for approximately eight weeks.

Lastly, to find more personal and insightful explanations, I conducted short interviews. The questions were carried out via phone and e-mail with coaches at UW Platteville and most volleyball coaches in the WIAC: I contracted 32 coaches and 11 participated in the interviews. The cross-examination, which resulted from talking to coaches from one school and one sport, helped show how programs work with others within their institution and collaboratively across the WIAC. UW Platteville was chosen for its medium undergraduate student body size (relative to the rest of the WIAC), and volleyball was chosen because most universities in the WIAC have full volleyball rosters, which can be compared more easily than teams with varying sizes every season. Questions were modeled after the pilot survey except that coaches were asked to explain their rankings and were able to ask clarification questions.

Conclusion

The survey and interview results were compared to results from programs in all nine colleges of the WIAC. Because the survey was anonymous, program budgets were not compared to one another. My recommendations are general; any budget can adopt them. For reference’s sake, budget information for these public schools is available online at the U.S. Department of Education’s Web site.

The online survey WIAC coaches participated in yielded a response rate of 39.2 percent. The survey was meant to detect overt differences in coaches’ current use of PR compared to their ideal usage.

The survey results revealed coaches’ reflections on their current use of PR. Most areas, like recruiting and fund raising (see figures 2 and 3) were ranked as a high priority. In addition
the survey results in figure 4 shed light on a noticeable percentage of coaches who did not feel supported by universities. Through these figures, coaches have shown that they thought highly of areas like recruiting and fund raising and noticed at least some areas, i.e. overhead support, that could benefit by better PR. In the few minutes coaches gave to thinking about the survey they found an area that needed more attention; this pattern came up again in the survey and within the interviews; it ties into the second and third general trends and will be discussed there.
Fig. 2. "Fundraising is very Important to my Program"

Fig. 3. "Recruiting is very Important to my Program"
Survey participants were also asked how highly they would value PR if they were using ideal resources. Most coaches responded that with a fuller staff and larger budget they would pursue PR practices to promote their programs (see figures 5 through 9). It was interesting that most coaches stated they would pursue aspects like fund raising even when they were asked to think about managing their program with ideal resources (including an ideal budget). Maybe it was the engrained self-sufficiency in DIII coaches I found earlier in the pilot survey or it was the skill of fund raising itself coaches valued, but to prefer to do the funding work themselves, coaches showed a willingness to be left alone, which contradicts their desire for more support. This inclination ties into the second general trend I saw in interviews and will be discussed in that section. Overall, these charts reflect a desire coaches had for more efficient management of PR efforts, especially in how they expressed that they had less-than-desirable support but the charts also hint at an unwillingness coaches had in linking the interdisciplinary nature of PR to
their daily routines, like fund raising. This contradiction is the heart of the project: the sample of coaches, though small, was very similar in how they perceived PR to be an independent area instead of an interdisciplinary tool, especially when it came to answering questions in the interviews.
Fig. 5. "With Unlimited Resources, Public Relations . . ."

Fig. 6. "With Unlimited Resources, Marketing . . ."
Fig. 7. "With Unlimited Resources, Fundraising . . ."

Fig. 8. "With Unlimited Resources, Recruiting . . ."
I asked a sample of coaches, via telephone, to rank audiences and methods (i.e. recruiting and fund raising). Coaches ranked six different audiences that their PR efforts reach on a scale ranging from 1 to 6, 1 being the highest priority. The audience groups included prospective athlete/parent relations, alumni relations, campus relations, community relations, conference relations, and media relations. I asked for examples of how their programs promote good relationships with those audiences. Their answers showed more of the previously mentioned trends I could see within the survey results and helped lead me to come up with a few solutions.

**Recommendations**

In response to the data collected via surveys and interviews, this project offers three general recommendations. Each one is in response to a particular trend visible throughout the results. The recommendations are flexible; they allow the use of limited resources already available, and they can be easily integrated into any budget.
**First Trend**

Half the coaches interviewed did not list prospective athletes and alumni as their top priorities. Prospects and alumni appear to be natural first choices when it comes to building and maintaining a healthy program, yet half the interviewees listed either their universities or their local communities as a top priority instead. Accordingly, many coaches viewed their surroundings as important as their future athletes. If this is true, one can expect to see just as many attempts to involve university and community members with the program as attempts made to involve prospective athletes. Yet in the interviews, only two coaches said faculty and staff were given a discount or incentive for attending sporting events. And besides two or three major events no unity seemed to exist between the programs and their surroundings.

The first recommendation is that coaches should consciously set priorities for their programs and act on those priorities. A program’s promotional efforts should be aimed at the audience a coach considers most important.

In *Advertising and Integrated Brand Promotion* (2009), Thomas O’Guinn recommends that a coach plan out exactly what they deem most significant. Once a coach knows where different PR efforts (recruiting, fund-raising, etc.) fit into his or her program, it is easier to plan how to reach important audiences. The high-priority efforts made must match the audiences deemed most important.

**Second Trend**

Media relations was almost always ranked as the last priority. The reporter-coach relationship came across as one-sided in the interviews with the media always coming to the coaches. Many coaches said they did not put much effort into their relationships with media
outlets. Some expressed apathy toward media entities, saying reporters misrepresented their results. One coach said he would rather be left alone than pursue good relationships with the media. Another coach considered his program to be an “invisible” one, saying the sport itself is the reason there is not much of a relationship between himself and local media—the nature of the sport is not a popular one. While coaches’ efforts made toward the media are consistent with the level of importance they ranked that relationship, it seems unreasonable to harbor poor relations with the media when that relationship could help improve relations with other audiences coaches deemed more important to their program.

The desire for more university support shown in the survey and the contradicting desire to handle aspects of the program like recruiting and fund raising even after a more ideal budget and staff were offered (to which coaches could pay and delegate responsibilities to) touch again on a problem with collaboration coaches seemed to have shown throughout my project.

The second recommendation is to think collaboratively. Many events and entities can benefit from sporting programs working with multiple audiences and delegating responsibilities. Examples of collaboration can be seen in advice coaches themselves offered. For instance, the WIAC hosts a blog (www.host.madison.com) where fans can comment and stay current with most WIAC sports news. UW system schools can use this to highlight their respective sports. Another example is UW Stout’s conference-wide summer volleyball camps. Lastly, most volleyball programs in the WIAC host “Dig for the Cure” matches, which raise money for the Susan G. Komen Fund (In 2008, programs collectively raised more than $17,000).

These examples reflect the benefit of collaboration. The programs are bringing attention to themselves from the media especially, and also bringing attention from new audiences. Whether it is the WIAC’s blog or “Dig for the Cure,” new exposure was created by acting on
behalf of a worthwhile cause (like breast cancer research). While these examples show that some strong PR efforts are being made, most interviewed coaches struggled to rank audiences and to give examples of promotional efforts.

**Third Trend**

Some coaches made strong PR efforts, but regarded their efforts as disjointed from their regular daily lives “at the office.” Many indicated in interviews that their typical days did not involve much PR. Coaches’ thinking that their promotional actions, and, in turn their daily “at the office” efforts to recruit, fund raise and network were not a part of their formal PR efforts requires a new mindset.

The third recommendation is supported by the survey evidence that coaches do not understand that PR is psychologically linked to virtually every effort they deemed important, like recruiting, fund raising and marketing (compare figs. 2, 10 and 3, 7 and 8, 9).
PR must be taken more seriously within coaching programs at the DIII level. Conscious effort must be made to not only align the audiences coaches wish to reach with the methods they think are best, but to understand the impact they wield as leaders within those audiences. Understanding that PR and collaboration are unavoidable when managing a successful program will help streamline good efforts and eliminate poor ones.

As Bernays suggested, PR is a kind of persuasion tool able to be utilized in various situations. But to use PR, coaches need to understand human nature and consciously decide who they want to aim their efforts toward.


Gender Quotas: The Right Idea for Argentina, a Good Idea for Latin America

Amy Gearhart, author
Dr. Druscilla Scribner, Political Science, faculty adviser

Amy Gearhart is a political science and religious studies double major. Her academic interests revolve around the roles that women play in politics and religion in an increasingly interconnected world. This research project began in a comparative Latin American politics course and was concluded in a women’s studies course. Amy is active in local politics, having served as a member of the Winnebago County Board. She is planning on pursuing a master’s degree in political science.

Dr. Druscilla Scribner is assistant professor of political science. She received her Ph.D. from the University of California San Diego in 2004. She joined the UW Oshkosh faculty in 2005. Dr. Scribner’s teaching and research interests include gender and politics, Latin American politics, and comparative law.

Abstract

The recent election cycles of Latin American parliaments have seen an increased women’s representation in some states and a stalemate or even reduction in others. Argentina consistently has among the highest legislative representation for women in the world. Under what conditions do women achieve high rates of legislative representation? I will approach this question by assessing the leading theories, using comparative regional data, and analyzing the successful implementation of the Ley de Cupos in Argentina. I argue that the closed list proportional representation system in which the Argentine enforced quota structure exists is the most effective condition for women to obtain high levels of legislative positions.
Introduction

Laura Chinchilla’s recent victory in the Costa Rican presidential election marks the fifth woman elected to executive office in Latin American history. This caught the world’s attention as an assertion of the great strides women have made in a region where some women did not obtain suffrage until 1967 (IPU 2005). Although some states are doing well in increasing female representation in government, others have done and continue to do poorly. Under what conditions do women attain high levels of legislative representation? Finding the answer to this question can help create domestic policies with the goal of creating substantial improvement in women’s legislative representation.

Female participation in government tripled in Latin America between the years of 1990 and 2007, despite the drastic underrepresentation of women in some states (Htun 2005, 113). Argentina is the leader among Latin American states for female representation and will serve as the case study in this paper to identify positive factors and conditions for progress. I assert that an enforced quota system within a closed-list proportional representation electoral structure is the best condition to foster female participation.

It is important to note here that this is not an evaluation of substantive representation; I am looking purely at descriptive representation of the number of women in legislative positions. Substantive representation may be defined as “advocating the interest and issues of a group; for women, ensure that politicians speak for and act to support women’s issues” (Paxton and Hughes 2007, 375). Previous research, particularly the work by Arturo Vega and Juanita M. Firestone (1995), has concluded, however, that when women are in legislature, they tend to introduce more
women-related legislation. This would include bills with a health, youth, and reproductive rights focus.

The literature has predominantly focused on the type of electoral system and the use of quotas without addressing the importance of enforcement mechanisms. The intellectual contribution of this paper is the focus on sub-quota level changes, particularly enforcement mechanisms that make quotas effective. I will review competing theories, analyze comparative data, present a case study of Argentina, and conclude by discussing some of the lessons learned.

**Literature Review**

The three leading approaches that identify conditions for women’s representation rates are political, socioeconomic, and cultural factors. Wilma Rule has characterized these theories collectively as “narrow gender roles, restrictive religious doctrines, unequal laws and education, discriminatory socioeconomic conditions, male-biased party leaders or other political elites and some voters, and ‘women-unfriendly’ election systems. [Such barriers are] typically interrelated and mutually reinforcing” (1994, 26). Here, I will unpack these political, socioeconomic, and cultural factors and analyze quota systems to identify the specific conditions created by each that hamper or promote female representation in legislatures.

**Political Conditions: Democracy**

The political culture of a state can have a significant impact on female participation in legislatures, while political ideology has been offered as one determinate factor for the likelihood that a woman would be listed on a party’s electoral ticket. Pippa Norris (1993) has argued that in terms of “candidate recruitment social democrat and green parties are far more likely to believe
intervention in the recruitment process is necessary and appropriate” and that women’s participation will increase as a result of that intervention (320). It is important to note, as Miki Caul has, that the “left/right ideological continuum may be too simple to capture how ideology affects women’s representation” (2010, 160). States with strong green and center-left parties do not necessarily have more women elected, as seen in Bolivia’s case. Although one of the most politically “left” of the Latin American states, it has lower female representation than Mexico, which is considered more politically centrist (IPU 2010). However, “it is not sufficient to have a democratic system, or even a democratic tradition, to guarantee better opportunities for women” because there are many examples of states that have democratic systems with underrepresentation of women (Preschard 2002, 5).

**Political Conditions: Electoral Systems**

Political institutions, specifically electoral systems, may also hold significant influence. Electoral systems are the rules by which votes are cast and translated into seats in the legislature. The main types of electoral systems are proportional representation (PR), single member district plurality (SMD), and mixed systems. Andrew Reynolds (1999) notes that “electoral systems have most often been cited as the key determining factor in the number of women elected to legislative office” (554). In PR systems, multimember districts are utilized, voters cast their ballots for parties rather than candidates, and seats in the legislature are distributed according to the percentage of the vote each party receives. The use of PR and multimember districts is “better for women because they can get on a party’s ballot without displacing a male” (Paxton and Hughes 2007, 139). In an SMD system, like that used in the United States, when women have to compete against men to become candidates, women are often disadvantaged because
“parties are more reluctant to field a woman as their only candidate for a particular seat” (Tinker 2007, 1). Reynolds concludes that list-proportional representation is the most “women-friendly” electoral system. In PR systems, the party’s candidate list can be open to voters or closed. Closed list is a type of PR in which parties create lists of candidates and voters have no influence on the order in which candidates on the party’s ballot are elected. Open party lists give the constituency at least some influence on the order of candidates elected (Paxton and Hughes 2007, 141). In a closed list system, the order of candidates on the list is determined internally by the party. In this way, if the party places female candidates in high positions on the list, those women will have a greater likelihood of gaining a seat. In an open list system, voters rank order the candidate list, which is often less favorable to women (Preschard 2002). Therefore, a closed list PR system in which a political party supports gender diversity would have a positive impact on electing women to office.

**Socioeconomic Conditions**

Another theory suggests that states with low socioeconomic development particularly harm a woman’s chances of being voted into office. As Reynolds (1999) notes, “most politicians, male and female, come from a pool of citizens who are highly educated, have professional jobs, and have access to the resources of public life” (550). Therefore, if the gender disparity between literacy and college graduation rates is high, women will be at a disadvantage in their pursuit for office. It follows that the more developed a state is, the more likely female candidates will emerge. Reynolds (1999) concludes that “when the dominate social culture precludes young women from enjoying a full education and socializes them from birth into roles that are removed from the world of public decision making, then the pool of likely women politicians is
substantially reduced” (550). This, however, does not suggest that women will be elected, just that there would be more potential female candidates.

**Cultural Conditions**

Cultural factors—related to socioeconomic factors—often limit a woman’s ability to run for and win office. Among these factors, patriarchal societies and narrow gender roles, religious inclinations of the state, and the presence of female activists are specifically associated with considerations for a woman’s successful bid for office. Patriarchy, the dominance of men in a family or society, is “imbued with some degree of cultural negativity toward the presence of women in high political office” (Reynolds 1999, 550). In general, cultures that have unfriendly gender norms for women tend not to elect many women to office (Baldez 1997). As stated by Jacqueline Preschard, “societies more open to gender equity in the social, cultural and educational realms are better positioned for women to be able to compete effectively to accede to public office, in both the legislative and executive branches” (2002, 5). States with dominant religious institutions that promote patriarchy tend to translate that gender norm into low rates of legislative representation for women. Therefore, “in the countries with a tradition of separation between church and state, such as Mexico, Costa Rica, and Cuba, there is greater recognition of women’s right to participation on an equal footing” (Preschard 2002, 5).

The presence of female activists is a positive factor for female representation. As noted by Caul, “women’s participation inside the party as party activists at the local level, as organizers of the intraparty women’s groups, and as internal officeholders should buoy women’s power in the party. This power should increase women’s opportunities and resources to lobby for further support of women as candidates for parliament” (2010, 160). Having women rallying together
can create a strong base of support for candidates and bring attention to political parties and the government about the underrepresentation of women. In the United States, women’s groups such as Emerge and EMILY’s List actively seek out and promote women candidates while working with specific political parties.

**Legislative Quotas**

Quota systems are an affirmative action program that establishes place regulations in order for women to have a better chance of obtaining office. Legislative quotas require political parties to include a specific percentage of female candidates on ballots in order for the ballot to be recognized for elections (Tinker 2007, 4). Pamela Paxton and Melanie Hughes (2007) note that “several governments and parties have adopted what can be termed double quotas, which combine a traditional quota with rules about the order of male and female candidates on electoral lists, called placement mandates” (160). Placement mandates are an attempt to address parties that put women on the ballot primarily in races they are not likely to win or in alternative and vice-presidential positions that will not result in many women elected, if any. Drude Dahlerup and Lenita Freidenvall argue that “quota provisions, properly implemented, do obstruct and overcome some of the most crucial barriers for women’s equal political representation” (2003, 13). Quota systems, properly enforced by the state, create the best condition for women to gain representation in legislatures. Sanctions for noncompliance with quotas and placement mandates can vary. Paxton and Hughes contend that “the most effective sanctions require that the electoral commission reject electoral lists that fail to comply with quota regulations whereas monetary sanctions are often less successful at motivating compliance” (2007, 163). Therefore, I argue that this condition, above all others, is the most determining factor for women’s participation rates in
Latin America. Districts that have quotas with strong enforcement have often seen female representation more than double (Dahlerup and Freidenvall 2005). Next, an introduction of comparative representation rates and quota systems of Latin American states will demonstrate this claim followed by a case study of Argentina, a state in which women have excelled in leadership roles in a relatively short amount of time because of the implementation of quota laws.

**Comparative Data: Latin America**

Stark differences exist in female legislative representation rates among the states of Latin America (IPU 2010). States such as Argentina, Ecuador, and Costa Rica have all substantially increased female participation in the last 10 years while Paraguay and Brazil have not.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Legislative Body</th>
<th>% Women (before law)</th>
<th>% Women (after law)</th>
<th>Change (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>Chamber</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>Chamber</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Chamber</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>Unicameral</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominican Republic</td>
<td>Chamber</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>Unicameral</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Chamber</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>Unicameral</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraguay</td>
<td>Chamber</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>Unicameral</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although most states have quota systems in place, the legitimacy of these quotas depend on the government’s ability and willingness to enforce them. As evidenced by table 1, although the average increase in quota representation was 10 percent, some states did poorly in comparison to others. Paraguay even lost women’s seats in the Senate.

In Brazil, although an electoral quota is mandated by law, women still make up less than 10 percent of those elected to the legislative chamber. The law states that parties must reserve 30 percent of candidate slots for women but does not require that parties actually fill these slots (Araújo 2003, 9). Mala N. Htun explains that “since parties may postulate 50 percent more candidates than seats being contested in a district, a party may, in practice, field a full slate without including any women” (2005, 118).

Another state that has not had significant returns of quota implementation is the Dominican Republic. In the late 1990s the Dominican Republic first implemented quota systems and continued to edit the law until 2004. Although an initial jump in representation was achieved, a change to the law in 2004 hampered its effectiveness because “electoral law changes at that time both reduced the magnitude of larger electoral districts and changed elections from closed list to open list proportional representation” (Kelly 2006, 9).

As evident in both the cases of Brazil and the Dominican Republic, the specifics of the law greatly determine its overall effectiveness. Quotas work best in closed list PR systems where the law contains an enforced placement mandate for female candidates. The Argentinean Ley de Cupos, or quota law, has institutionalized change for women and made Argentina a pioneer in gender parity among Latin American states.

Case Study
Argentina’s female representation rate in the 1980s was dismal. With less than five percent of the legislature occupied by women, the national government recognized the need for action. A move for “parity democracy” by feminists helped push a 30 percent quota system to be passed in 1991, resulting in Argentina becoming the first Latin American state to adopt an electoral quota law known as the Ley de Cupos (Carrió 2005). As explained by Mark P. Jones, “the use of a gender quota law is found to have had a significant positive impact on the percentage of women elected to the Argentine legislature” (1998, 19). As of April 2010, women currently occupy 39 percent of the combined Argentinean legislature, nearly one-third more than is mandated by the quota system (IPU 2010). The success that Argentina has achieved was not immediate.

As demonstrated in table 2, because of the staggered election system, in which only half of the lower chamber turns over every two years, it took Argentina four years for the quota to be properly implemented in the lower chamber known as the Chamber of Deputies. It took 10 full years for its complete implementation in the Senate (Lubertino 2003). Two determinate factors

**Table 2  Number of Women Legislators in Both Chambers, 1983–2003**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1983</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1995</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputies</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senators</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>6.52</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* In terms of the Senate, the rules on the women’s quota were not applied until 2001, when the provisions of the constitutional amendment that provided for the direct and simultaneous election of three senators per district entered into force.

for Argentina’s success have been the combined uses of a closed PR list and an enforcement mechanism used by the state to ensure party compliance.

Firstly, the reason for Argentina’s success with the Ley de Cupos is the specific form of electoral quota system used. As noted by Preschard, “establishing a certain percentage does not mean that women candidates are actually in a position to translate the percentage of candidates into a similar percentage of seats” (2002, 3). As mentioned before, PR is a type of voting system that allocates a percentage of the vote cast for a political party with equivalent representation in order for minority parties to have some share of the representation. PR systems “do on average have nearly twice as many women members of parliament as plurality-majority systems” (Reynolds 1998, 559). It has been suggested by many—and demonstrated in table 3—that a combined quota and PR system produces the best opportunity for women in legislatures (Preschard 2002; Tinker 2004; Carrió 2005).

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>women in parliaments (%)</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quota, PR</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quota, No PR</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Quota, PR</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Quota, No PR</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The party list system, a form of PR, has rules that determine which candidates fill the seats won by each party during a general election (Schmidt 2003, 2). Party list systems use either a closed or open list voting structure. As Gregory D. Schmidt explains, “most list systems are closed: voters choose only among alternative lists, not among individual candidates. In contrast, open list systems allow or require voters to cast ballots for specific candidates. Seats are allocated among the parties based on their respective shares of the vote, but distributed among the candidates of each party on the basis of the ballots that each one receives” (2003, 2). Women in Latin America have found greatest success in elections with closed lists, while Argentinean women have found particular success in their lista sábana (closed list ballots) combined with a PR system (Carrió 2005, 169).

The second and most distinguishing factor in Argentina’s application of quotas has been the “rigorous” enforcement mechanism derived to ensure party compliance (Schmidt 2003, 8). If a political party does not follow Article 60 of the National Electoral Code that states that their list must have a minimum of 30 percent female candidates “in such positions that they have a chance of getting elected,” then the list will not be recognized for voting (Carrió 2005, 60). The Argentinean law does not have the same loopholes that political parties in Brazil use and, therefore, has stronger enforcement and better results.

Argentina has been dubbed the “pioneer country” because of its successful implementation of quota laws (Carrió 2005, 170). The attainment of 30 percent and higher gender parity has shown not only Latin America, but also the international community, how far its legislature has come since the Ley de Cupos was implemented in 1983. Argentina is currently 11th in the world for women’s representation in parliament (IPU 2010) and should be viewed by other states that are trying to obtain more equal representation as an effective model to explore.
**Discussion and Concluding Remarks**

Cultural, political, and socioeconomic factors certainly influence women’s access to office. What I have argued here is that the presence of a party quota system, specifically one within a closed list PR electoral structure with strong enforcements mechanisms, has the ability to trump these other factors. Identifying the aspects of the Argentine quota system that have been successful can prompt other states to create laws in order to pursue similar results.

Opponents of quotas have claimed that enacting these laws mean that parties will have to scramble to fill spots resorting to unqualified women who are incapable of stepping outside of their party’s shadow to find their own voices. Another concern has been that parties will simply add the minimum possible number of women to the ballot and try to find any method possible to cheat the system. Not only has the Argentine legislature successfully obtained its quota since its implementation in 1993, it has also exceeded it (IPU 2010). Lastly, opponents have argued that simply changing to a closed list PR system without quotas would be a better alternative and would not undermine a party’s authority to choose the best candidate possible. As table 3 demonstrates, the combination of both a quota and PR system is the most supportive of women’s representation.

This research could be fruitfully extended in a number of directions. A cross-regional comparison is required to better sort out the influences of culture, region, and ideology on women’s representation. For example, Finland and Denmark enjoy unparalleled representation of women (40 percent and higher) despite the absence of quota laws (IPU 2010). Regional influence and the presence of influential national and international women’s organizations would
be other factors to evaluate in further research. This paper has identified key components of
Argentina’s success, but other states and regions may have substantially different circumstances.

**Bibliography**

Araújo, Clara. “Quotas for Women in the Brazilian Legislative System.” Paper presented at the

Baldez, Lisa. “Elected Bodies: The Gender Quota Law for Legislative Candidates in Mexico.”
*Legislative Studies Quarterly* 29, no. 2 (2004): 231–58.

Caul, Miki. “Women’s Representation in Parliament: The Role of Political Parties.” In *Women,
Gender and Politics*, edited by Mona Lena Krook and Sarah Childs, 160–68. New York:

Carrió, Elisa María. “Argentina: A New Look at the Challenges of Women’s Participation in the

Dahlerup, Drude, and Lenita Freidenvall. “Quotas as a ‘Fast Track’ to Equal Political
Representation for Women: Why Scandinavia is No Longer the Model.” *International

Htun, Mala N. “Women, Political Parties and Electoral Systems in Latin America.” In *Women in
Parliament: Beyond Numbers, a New Edition*, edited by Julie Ballington and Azza

IPU. “A World Chronology of the Recognition of Women’s Rights to Vote and to Stand for

(accessed May 22, 2010).

Jones, Mark P. “Gender Quotas, Electoral Laws, and the Election of Women: Lessons from the

Kelly, Jana Morgan. “Gender Gaps in the Dominican Republic, 1994–2004: Two Steps Forward,
One Step Back?” Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Latin American Studies

Lubertino, María José. “Pioneering Quotas: The Argentine Experience and Beyond.” Paper

Norris, Pippa. “Conclusions: Comparing Legislative Recruitment,” in *Gender and Party Politics*,


Studying Complex Star-Forming Fields: Rosette Nebula and Monoceros Loop

Chris Hathaway and Anthony Kuchera, co-authors
Dr. Nadia Kaltcheva, Physics and Astronomy, faculty adviser

Christopher Hathaway obtained a B.S. in physics in 2007 and is currently pursuing his masters in physics education at UW Oshkosh. He collaborated with Dr. Nadia Kaltcheva on his senior research project and presented their findings at the American Astronomical Society meeting (2008), the Celebration of Scholarship at UW Oshkosh (2009), and the National Conference on Undergraduate Research in La Crosse, Wisconsin (2009).

Anthony Kuchera graduated from UW Oshkosh in May 2008 with a B.S. in physics. He collaborated with Dr. Kaltcheva from fall 2006 through graduation. He presented his astronomy-related research at the Posters in the Rotunda (2007 and 2008), the Wisconsin Space Conference (2007), the UW System Symposium for Undergraduate Research and Creative Activity (2007 and 2008), and the American Astronomical Society’s 211th meeting (2008). In December 2009 he earned an M.S. in physics from Florida State University where he is currently working toward a Ph.D. in experimental nuclear physics.

Dr. Nadia Kaltcheva is a professor of physics and astronomy. She received her Ph.D. from the University of Sofia in Bulgaria. She joined the UW Oshkosh Physics and Astronomy Department in 2001. Her research interests are in the field of stellar photometry and its application to the study of Galactic star-forming fields and the spiral structure of the Milky Way.

Abstract

An investigation that presents a new analysis of the structure of the Northern Monoceros field was recently completed at the Department of Physics and Astronomy at UW Oshkosh. Northern Monoceros is arguably the most complex star-forming region in
the Perseus section of the Milky Way. The area harbors a huge collection of recently born massive stars. It also contains some of the most spectacular features of interstellar matter known to date.

The method of investigation chosen for this study is called uvbyβ photometry. This is a sophisticated astronomical technique that enables the derivation of stellar physical parameters with high precision. The photometry-derived quantities were used to obtain reliable homogeneous distances to groups and layers of stars located toward Monoceros. Our study provides an updated working model of the central part of the field up to a distance of 6500 light years and also gives us a better understanding of its overall properties. This survey has laid the basis to further investigate the connection between the young stellar population in Monoceros and its associated interstellar material in order to cast light on some aspects of star formation.

**Significance of the Monoceros Star-forming Field**

One of the major, most extensively studied star-forming fields in our Galaxy is found toward the constellation Monoceros. It is located in the Northern sky, lies toward the outer parts of the Galaxy, and is thought to be part of the Perseus spiral arm of the Milky Way. It is one of the least obscured by interstellar dust regions in the Galactic plane, thus offering excellent observational opportunities to study star formation at a large distance.

Monoceros is rich in massive, recently born stars, found both in compact stellar clusters and loose, gravitationally unbound stellar associations. Based on previous investigations, it seems that it has a complex structure with several groups and layers
projected along the line of sight. The area is dominated by the Rosette Nebula—a large low-density cloud of glowing ionized hydrogen in which star formation has recently taken place. The young massive stars recently formed within Rosette emit vast amounts of ultraviolet light, ionizing and heating the gas surrounding them. The Rosette Nebula is located near one end of a giant molecular cloud (Rosette Molecular Cloud)—a place of ongoing star formation. The Monoceros Loop (a circular optical nebulosity in the vicinity of the Rosette Nebula) is thought to be a supernova remnant (the final product of the evolution of a very massive star).

Rosette Nebula and the Monoceros Loop are thought to be spatially connected to the stars of the large Mon OB2 association (Ruprecht 1966)—an extended loose group of massive, recently born stars. About 5° north of Rosetta, the young open cluster NGC 2264 and the more compact Mon OB1 association seem to be spatially connected to the diffuse Cone Nebula (Herbst 1980). The positional coincidence of stars of the Mon OB2 association with the Monoceros Loop suggests that the star formation in this region was induced or sped up by the passage of a supernova shock wave through the clumpy interstellar medium (Singh and Naranan 1979). Such triggering of star formation is a key idea in the contemporary star-formation theory leading astronomers to constantly look for observational evidence. Star formation appears to be clumped into a hierarchy of structures, from small stellar clusters to giant star-forming complexes. The interplay between gravity and supersonic turbulence is a critical factor in this process. The formation of stars is closely linked to the properties of their parental clouds of interstellar matter. The spatial distribution of the members of an embedded cluster or association may hold important clues about the formation mechanism and initial conditions in the
parental molecular cloud. On the other hand, once formed, the young massive stars (known as OB stars) may play a constructive or a destructive role in the process of star formation. Even a single OB star has a profound influence on the surrounding interstellar matter. Its radiation and energetic wind could evaporate nearby clouds and terminate the star-forming processes. Alternatively, the radiation pressure from an OB star may also prompt the collapse of the molecular cloud which otherwise may not contract spontaneously. Such a triggering process may act over a very large distance, implying possible self-sustaining formation of stars.

In light of the growing importance of Northern Monoceros in the study of star formation, precise distances to the apparent structures of young stars in the field are important for a variety of reasons. Reliable distances allow us to pinpoint the precise location of the clusters and associations, thereby allowing us to better understand the star-forming history of the region. Precise distances also allow us to better understand their connection and influence on the surrounding interstellar gas and dust, thus shedding light on the process of triggered formation of new stars for this particular field.

**Method**

Studying the Galactic star-forming fields is a complex experiment. These fields are the building blocks of the Milky Way’s spiral arms. Because the Sun is positioned deep inside the Milky Way, the Galactic spiral arms look strung out to us along the line of sight, leading to superposition and mixing of star-forming fields in the sky. To uncover the structure of the star-forming fields, the distances to the OB stars have to be determined and the locations mapped. The OB stars are short-lived (20 million years)
objects of a highly peculiar nature and are thus difficult to study. However, the structure and overall characteristics of the Galactic star-forming fields are entirely based on distance determinations of such stars.

Stellar distance is the most important parameter in astronomy. It is also the most difficult one to obtain. The direct method to find stellar distances is the method of stellar parallax, based on the revolution of the Earth around the Sun. Unfortunately, from the surface of the Earth, parallaxes of stars located even in the nearest star-forming fields cannot be obtained—the stars are too far away and parallaxes cannot be measured. Other approaches are the indirect photometric and spectroscopic methods, where the stellar light is measured and used to obtain physical stellar parameters (such as temperature, total energy emitted, etc.) that can yield stellar distance. The most widely used photometries are the UBV and uvbyβ systems. The uvbyβ photometry provides precise distances, but observations are needed in six intermediate-band filters. This makes the task more difficult to achieve. The UBV photometry is easier to obtain, but the precision in the distances it yields is not always sufficient. In both systems, calibrations need to be established based on stars with direct (parallax) distances. Recently, using data from space (ESA 1997), it was possible to test these calibrations and establish which of them are reliable (Kaltcheva and Knude 1998; Wegner 2007; Kaltcheva and Makarov 2007).

**Our Study**

Here we present a thorough photometric investigation of Northern Monoceros utilizing uvbyβ data. The field we studied (12° by 12°) is centered on the Rosette Nebula. We used all recently born stars with uvbyβ photometric data presently available through
astronomical databases (Hauck and Mermilliod 1998; Kaltcheva, Olsen, and Clausen 1999). Our sample was at least 90% complete for stars brighter than 9.2 magnitudes and allowed us to delineate the structure of the central part of the field up to a distance of 6500 light years (2000 pc). The parsec, or pc, was our chosen unit of distance throughout this study and is equivalent to how far light travels in 3.26 years.

Results

In the overall photometric investigation of star-forming fields, several consecutive steps were performed. First, data were collated for as many OB stars as possible. Then, based on this data, the influence of the interstellar dust on the light from the stars was estimated and corrected to obtain the true stellar colors. From this point the field could be studied via photometric diagrams, which cast light on the stellar content of the field in general. The true stellar colors brought information about stellar physics and provides (via calibrations, based on well-studied samples of nearby stars) stellar temperature, chemical composition, age, and, most importantly, intrinsic stellar brightness. A comparison of the intrinsic stellar brightness to apparent brightness allowed us to obtain the stellar distance. Having the distance, together with the stellar coordinates, allowed the structure of the field under investigation to be mapped in two and three dimensions.

From the uvbyβ photometric data we calculated precise distances and estimations of the extinction of stellar light due to the interstellar dust for the stars included in our sample. These parameters made it possible to reveal various groups of stars within the field of study.
The Monoceros OB2 Association

The stars in our sample are dominated by the Mon OB2 association. This association has been extensively studied by a number of authors and is considered to cover a large area of the sky toward the Rosette Nebula and Monoceros Loop. This area also contains a large number of young open clusters. The extensive investigation by Turner (1976) concluded that three groups of stars of differing ages are present in this association. The stars of the open cluster NGC 2244, as well as most stars in the Rosette Nebula, make up the youngest group, while the oldest stars are found mostly at the periphery of the association. Turner listed 48 stars as members of the Mon OB2 association and, based on spectroscopic calibrations and UBV photometry, derived the distance of 1590 pc, which is the currently accepted distance to this association. Most of the stars previously assigned to Mon OB2 were included in our sample. Based on the precise photometric distances for the individual stars we derived, we found that these stars are spread out between 1 and 3 kpc (1 kpc = 1000 pc). We suggest that they do not belong to a single OB association, which is expected to be more compact in terms of distances to individual stars.

We investigated how stars of different intrinsic brightness are distributed across the field. The intrinsic brightness is a measure of the total amount of energy produced by a star per unit time. We found that the intrinsically bright stars are restricted between a Galactic latitude of -3° and 1°. We conclude that two groups of massive stars were present in our sample: a compact group of 12 stars at a distance of 1.26 kpc located toward the Monoceros Loop and a layer spread out between 1.5 and 3 kpc. When
projected in the sky, the massive stars of the layer are spread all over the field, indicating a large apparent depth of this star-forming region.

OB associations can also be detected kinematically as their internal velocity dispersion is usually small. To further confirm our findings, we searched the astronomical databases for radial velocity measurements. We found that most of the stars at 1.26 kpc had radial velocity measurements with a mean value of 26.3 km/s and a standard deviation of 9.8 km/s—just slightly larger than the radial velocity dispersion limit for an OB association (Mathieu 1986). Thus, the available radial velocities support the existence of a compact group of young stars at 1.26 kpc spatially correlated with the Monoceros Loop and Rosette Nebula.

**The Open Clusters NGC 2264 and NGC 2244**

Open clusters are compact groups of stars that often form within the boundaries of the OB associations. NGC 2244 and NGC 2264 are the most prominent clusters spatially connected to Mon OB2 and Mon OB1, respectively. Due to a high number of peculiar and binary stars and an additional complication of high, non-uniform extinction in Northern Monoceros, the study of these clusters has been difficult and the distances existing in the literature for NGC 2264 and NGC 2244 have varied substantially (Peréz, Thé, and Westerlund 1987).

Our sample included the brightest stars in both clusters, and we presented the first distance estimations for them based on photometric uvbyβ data. We found indications that, within the errors of the survey, the range in the derived photometric distances was larger than the expected range for compact groups. Thus, subgroups were separated
within the clusters. Additional inspection of the photometric diagrams related to stellar physical parameters indicated that the stellar content of the possible subgroups is similar. At the same time, the photometric diagrams related to stellar distance further supported the notion of subgroups at different distances. This finding of subgroups within the clusters, however, requires further confirmation. The photometric distances can be strongly affected by a variety of factors: unresolved binaries, peculiar interstellar extinction, stellar emission, and inhomogeneous photometric data. Because of this, we also provided distance estimates to NGC 2264 and NGC 2244, treating them as groups of stars at the same distance. Our estimates of $833 \pm 38$ pc and $1585 \pm 323$ pc, respectively, agree very well with the median value of the distances to these clusters existing in the literature to this point.

**Conclusions**

Precise uvbyβ stellar distances and reddening have been obtained for a sample of 209 recently born stars in a $12^\circ \times 12^\circ$ field in Northern Monoceros. The photometry-derived parameters allowed us to obtain homogeneous distances to groups and layers of stars in this field out to a distance of 2 kpc. We presented new distance estimates for the young open clusters NGC 2244 and NGC 2264 and suggested a presence of possible subgroups in both of them. Our word did not reveal the classical Mon OB2 at 1.6 kpc. We suggested that a relatively compact group of massive stars at 1.26 kpc can be distinguished close to NGC 2244 and spatially correlated with the Monoceros Loop and Rosette Nebula. This finding is supported by radial velocity measurements found in the literature. A layer of massive stars between 1.5 and 3 kpc can also be detected, averaging
a distance of about 2.15 kpc. Our results provide the basis to further investigate the connection between the prominent stellar groupings and the structures of interstellar matter for this important star-forming region.

**Acknowledgements**

Support for this research was provided by the National Science Foundation grant AST-0708950. N.K. acknowledges support from the SNC Endowed Professorship. A Wisconsin Space Grant Consortium undergraduate research award (A.K.) and two Wisconsin Space Grant Consortium scholarships (A.K. and C.H.) are also acknowledged. This research has made use of the SIMBAD database, operated at CDS, Strasbourg, France.

This research was recently published (Kaltcheva, Kuchera, and Hathaway 2010) in the refereed international journal *Astronomische Nachrichten* (Wiley InterScience). Some preliminary results were published in the *Proceedings of the Wisconsin Space Conference* (Kuchera, Kaltcheva, and Hathaway 2007).

**Bibliography**


Lou Gehrig’s “Farewell to Baseball” Address: Setting the Stage for a Genre

Garret Pelischek, author
Dr. Carmen Heider, communication, faculty adviser

Garret Pelischek graduated from UW Oshkosh in May 2010 with a degree in speech communication. In spring 2010 for an upper-level rhetorical criticism course, he wrote a generic rhetorical criticism paper based on a speech by Lou Gehrig. Garret has always been interested in the study of rhetoric, but his love for baseball and how rhetoric is used in sports furthered his interest and was the main reason for the topic of this paper.

Dr. Carmen Heider is an associate professor of communication and women’s studies, and she received her Ph.D. from Penn State University. She began teaching at UW Oshkosh in 2000. Her research interests focus on the intersections of rhetoric and gender in relation to women’s rights activism and women in prison.

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to look more critically at Lou Gehrig’s “Farewell to Baseball” address. I ask whether a genre exists for sports retirement speeches by discovering common characteristics within this text and two additional sports retirement texts. The results of the generic criticism showed that there were similarities among speeches and that a genre for sports retirement speeches does exist and contains three characteristics: importance of family, message of hope, and positive outlook. I argue that Gehrig’s speech initiated the genre and also set the stage for future speeches that share the same characteristics.

Introduction

On July 4, 1939, Lou Gehrig delivered his “Farewell to Baseball” address in Yankee Stadium in New York. The speech was written to explain why Gehrig had to leave the game of baseball due to a then-unknown illness. Gehrig used this speech to persuade people that illness was not a reason to give up on life but instead to keep fighting.
This text is important to analyze for three reasons. First, the “Farewell to Baseball” address warrants special attention because it has had a significant impact on all American sports, the medical field, and people’s outlook on life. This speech became popular because Gehrig was an outstanding baseball player who played for the popular New York Yankees. Gehrig’s status in pop culture along with his illness invited people to see him as no longer just a hero on the baseball field, but an everyday man. At the time, Gehrig’s illness was still unknown, which made the speech even more powerful. Even though he was left in a world of ambiguity about his health and his life, in his speech he sounded like he was the luckiest man. Second, this speech warrants critical attention because in America we have always valued and admired professional athletes. This speech also initiated much research and many foundations for what is now known as amyotrophic lateral sclerosis (ALS), and is also called “Lou Gehrig’s Disease.” Finally, this speech warrants attention because it has impacted many people’s attitudes when struck with illness or other problems. The speech persuades people to stay positive and focus on what is truly important.

Through the lens of generic descriptive criticism, I examined three speeches to see whether a genre exists among sports retirement speeches. Sonja Foss stated that generic criticism is “rooted in the assumption that certain types of situations provoke similar needs and expectations in audiences and thus call for particular kinds of rhetoric.” From this framework one can then determine if a genre exists. Genre, according to Foss, “is the term used to refer to a distinct group, type, class, or category of artifacts that share important characteristics that differentiate it from other groups. . . . I explored this by observing similarities in rhetorical responses to particular situations, collecting speeches that occurred in similar situations, analyzing those speeches to discover similar characteristics, and formulating the organizing
principle of the genre” (2009, 137-42). Moreover, Kathleen Hall Jamieson stated that “Existence of standard forms of address guarantees a sense of continuity. A genre perpetuates a distinguishable . . . rhetoric by creating expectations which any future . . . spokesmen feel obligated to fulfill” (1973, 165).

I argue that Gehrig set the stage for sports retirement speeches, and, by analyzing two additional speeches, I demonstrate that a sports retirement genre does exist. The situational, substantive and stylistic characteristics of the speeches suggest that the organizing principle of the genre is one of perspective through tragedy. The genre of sports retirement speeches stems from when sports figures are forced to leave the game they love not by choice, but because of circumstances out of their control. The perspective through tragedy can be formed from a career-ending injury or illness.

The paper proceeds as follows: first I provide a brief overview of Gehrig’s background, and then I discuss the rhetorical situation which Lloyd Bitzer describes as “From day to day, year to year, comparable situations occur, prompting comparable responses; hence rhetorical forms are born and a special vocabulary, grammar, and style are established” (Foss 2009, 138). Next, I analyze the speech through the framework of generic criticism. Finally, I conclude with a discussion of the implications of my analysis.

**Background**

Gehrig was born on June 19, 1903, in New York City. He was the son of German immigrants Christina and Heinrich Gehrig. As a young man, Gehrig enjoyed playing several sports and in 1921 he went to Columbia University on a football scholarship to pursue a degree in engineering. He then got into more competitive baseball in 1923 when he played for the Columbia Nine. Gehrig caught the attention of professional baseball scouts and was quickly
offered a deal to sign with the New York Yankees in 1923. He played one and a half seasons in
the minor leagues before being brought up to the Yankees’ roster to play first base in 1925 where
he stayed for more than 13 years (Rip Van Winkle Foundation 2009).

Over the course of his career in professional baseball, Gehrig gained a reputation as a
dependable player who could produce big numbers for his team. While Gehrig played, he had a
streak of 2,130 consecutive games. He managed to maintain that streak while suffering from
many injuries during his career including a broken thumb, broken toe, and back spasms. His style
of play and endurance earned him the nickname “Iron Horse” (Rip Van Winkle Foundation
2009). Gehrig had many productive years and was a great baseball player by most people’s
standards. However, since he played for the New York Yankees, some of his accomplishments
were overshadowed by other great players like Babe Ruth. But Gehrig won his fair share of
championships and awards and set many records. He had an exceptional baseball career with the
New York Yankees.

In 1938, Gehrig became weak and sick, and his streak of consecutive games played was
in jeopardy. At first doctors could not figure out what was making him ill, but finally doctors at
the Mayo Clinic diagnosed Gehrig with a rare form of degenerative disease: ALS, which is now
called Lou Gehrig’s disease. Gehrig was missed by many people in the baseball world and to
honor him he was the first athlete to have his jersey retired. The New York Yankees retired his
number four jersey in 1939, and Gehrig was inducted into the Baseball Hall of Fame in that same
year (Rip Van Winkle Foundation 2009).

All of these events led Gehrig to deliver his “Farewell to Baseball” address on July 4,
1939 (Rip Van Winkle Foundation 2009). By 1939, Gehrig was a well-established professional
baseball player. People at this time best knew Gehrig for his baseball accomplishments and for
being a public figure in New York City. However, the most significant aspects of his public persona were his reputation as a hard worker and being dependable and durable. Gehrig was almost a superhuman sports figure who seemed like nothing could bring him down, whether it was injuries or other problems. He was seen as a hero and a respectable person whom people admired. His public persona at the time was comparable to that of a Cal Ripken Jr. or a Brett Favre. Just like those two athletes, because of their great play and durability, he was seen as a man who could handle anything on or off the playing field. Gehrig’s public persona is what made this speech powerful to his audience. He addressed the one thing that he could not overcome and was preventing him from continuing to play baseball.

Gehrig was not trained in rhetoric; he studied engineering at Columbia University. However, his fame, along with his thoughtful words, is what makes this speech important, relevant, and worthy of critique. He has had other quotes, books, and sayings that have been passed on, but this is the text that is truly representative of Lou Gehrig. The “Farewell to Baseball” speech mirrors his attitude and career. He was known as a player and person who could fight through injuries and still come out and play skillfully. When Gehrig delivered that speech, he made it known that this disease was something he was going to fight and he would not let it stop him from enjoying life. The speech encompasses his baseball career, what others thought of him, and how he addressed real-life issues.

**Rhetorical Situation**

The rhetorical situation can be defined as a “complex of persons, events, objects, and relations presenting an actual or potential exigence which can be completely or partially removed if discourse, introduced into the situation, can so constrain human decision or action as to bring about significant modification of the exigence” (Bitzer 1999, 220). The rhetorical situation
addresses three different questions. First, why was this speech given at this particular time? Next, what were the demands of this time period that influenced creation of the speech? Finally, for whom was this speech designed? According to Jamieson, “perception of the proper response to an unprecedented rhetorical situation grows not merely from the situation but also from antecedent rhetorical forms” (1973, 163). This is important for generic criticism because the possibilities and limitations that Gehrig faced and how he chose his words in turn became the constraints that athletes after him faced, which then shaped their retirement speeches.

There are three reasons that this speech came to be: the importance of Major League Baseball (MLB) in the 1930s, Gehrig’s pop culture status, and the need for an explanation about the change in his life. Baseball is known as “America’s national pastime,” and this is because baseball and patriotism were closely connected in the 1930s. This is due in part to the timing of the season; the middle of the baseball season coincides with the Fourth of July. Baseball was a popular sport in the 1930s, and many people were following the games and its players. As sports writer Craig Muder stated, “the game provides fireworks in the sky and for the soul” (2009, 16). Also, in 1939 the United States was on the brink of World War II, and many people used the same type of vocabulary associated with soldiers to describe ballplayers. When this speech is reviewed it is discussed in that way: “The 61,808 fans at Yankee Stadium that day paid tribute to Gehrig, as did his Yankee teammates and friends, thanking him for his dignity and service—two causes our country respects and embraces. . . . People in the stands and across the country saw in him some of the best qualities of themselves: gratefulness and modesty, perseverance and perspective” (Muder 2009, 16–18). The associations with the baseball season and patriotism, along with the impending war were all factors in choosing July 4, 1939, as the day for Gehrig’s speech.
Gehrig’s status in pop culture is another reason why he gave the speech at that particular time. Because baseball was a popular sport in the 1930s, Gehrig was a well-known public figure, and was no longer able to play so he chose to address the fans and the media about the end of his career. The main reason Gehrig had to stop playing was due to his illness, and this was another motivation for the speech. Most people had not known the severity of his illness. The speech addressed his illness and gave the fans an explanation as to why he could no longer play, along with a farewell.

There were also constraints that shaped this rhetorical text. These constraints include what can and cannot be said in sports speeches but also deal with cultural values, politics, and images. Many sports speeches seem candid and emotional when given, especially after retirement, and Gehrig’s speech was no different. The constraints of including emotion, a sense of fondness looking back, and the ability to look to the future shaped sports speeches not only in the 1930s, but also today. However, I believe at the time Gehrig retired the biggest constraint had to do with events that occurred in the United States. The Great Depression of the 1930s changed the culture and values of the United States. Hard work, thriftiness, and having perspective were all things that became important to Americans in the 1930s. These values emerged because of the great economic decline. Between 1929 and 1932 the income of the average American family was reduced by 40 percent, from $2,300 to $1,500 per year. Instead of advancement; survival became key (Sutton 1999). Gehrig could not have given a speech looking for sympathy. The entire country had been suffering, and people did not want to be told that they should feel sorry for a professional athlete who made more money than the average person. Instead, due to the constraints at the time, he delivered a speech filled with hope and perspective on life. The speech
would not have been as well-recognized if Gehrig’s perspective on life had been different. Gehrig (1939) focused on the positive and continually repeated that he was lucky.

Gehrig’s speech was designed with a specific audience in mind—an audience that had grown up with the game of baseball. The immediate audience would have been the fans not only at the ball park, but all baseball fans at that time. Sports, especially in the 1930s, were male-dominated and more than 75 percent of the fans were white; the immediate audience was limited in relation to gender and race (U.S. Census Bureau 1930). The speech was also responded to by the mass media, by reporters and journalists both regionally and nationally. Even though the audience started small and was demographically limited, it has grown and expanded along with the game of baseball. A big stepping stone to making that happen was when Jackie Robinson broke the color barrier in 1947, becoming the first African American professional baseball player (Estate of Jackie Robinson 2007). Today, 39.6 percent of Major League players are people of color—27 percent Latino, 10.2 percent African American and 2.4 percent Asian. Half of all MLB teams have at least one woman in a vice president position (Lapchick 2009). The audience for Gehrig’s speech has grown because the game of baseball has become more diverse and universal.

Overall, the rhetorical situation is dependent on urgency, constraints, and the audience. Gehrig’s “Farewell to Baseball” address was shaped by all three of these elements. The connection between patriotism and baseball, along with the public image and story about his disease, helped determine why and when the speech was delivered. Also, the condition of the United States was a crucial constraint influencing how he structured his speech and chose his words. The audiences that were addressed with this speech were an important part of the rhetorical situation not only when it was made, but also today.
**Analysis**

**Situational Elements**

Sports speeches address different views on sports and life. There are sports speeches from players, coaches, owners, and even fans. The content of those speeches can change depending on the sport. However, despite the range of speech topics and speakers there are certain situations in sports that warrant specific rhetorical responses. The similarity that I found is that when most sports figures are faced with adversity, they respond in the form of a speech. The adversity can be a loss of a game or an injury, but it can also be a personal issue like a transgression, illness, or national tragedy. Speeches are likely when sports figures are forced to leave the game they love not by choice but because of circumstances out of their control.

**Collection of Texts**

The texts that I chose are three sports speeches: Gehrig’s “Farewell to Baseball” address, Jimmy Valvano’s “Don’t Give Up—Don’t Ever Give Up” speech given at the Excellence in Sports Performance Yearly Awards (ESPY Awards) when battling cancer, and Kevin Everett’s speech given after a career-ending neck injury on the football field. Valvano was the North Carolina State basketball coach and won the national title in 1983. After coaching he was an analyst for ESPN and was diagnosed with bone cancer. He delivered his speech in 1993 at the ESPY Awards when he accepted the Arthur Ashe Courage and Humanitarian Award; Valvano died later that year. Everett was a young National Football League player for the Buffalo Bills. On opening day in 2007, he was injured during a kick off. He injured his neck and feared he would never walk again. He was told he could no longer play football, but he has recovered better than most expected and was walking by December 2007. I examined the retirement speeches of these three athletes to see whether a genre exists because of the similar
Substantive and Stylistic Elements

I analyzed three retirement speeches to see whether they share common characteristics that comprise a genre, and I will demonstrate that a genre of sports retirement speeches does exist. The first common characteristic is the importance of family, and making a connection between the sport and the circumstances of retirement with the family of the speaker. The next characteristic is delivering a message of hope. This characteristic focuses on how hope is given to the audience even though it is a sad time for the speaker. The final element is that the speakers have a positive outlook in their speeches—even though they can no longer be part of the sport they love.

Importance of Family

The importance of family is evident in all three speeches. Gehrig addressed this in his speech when he talked about his mother-in-law, his parents, and his wife. In his speech he said, “When you have a wonderful mother-in-law who takes sides with you in squabbles with her own daughter—that’s something. When you have a father and a mother who work all their lives so you can have an education and build your body—it’s a blessing. When you have a wife who has been a tower of strength and shown more courage than you dreamed existed—that’s the finest I know” (Gehrig 1939). This quote shows that Gehrig is a man who has placed his family high on his list of priorities.

Valvano also spoke about his family and how they helped him emotionally and gave him courage. He gave names and was specific when mentioning his family. Valvano stated, “As Dick said, I’m a very emotional and passionate man. I can’t help it. That’s being the son of Rocco and Angelina Valvano. It comes with the territory. I talked about my family, my family’s so
important. People think I have courage. The courage in my family are my wife Pam, my three daughters, here, Nicole, Jamie, LeeAnn, my mom, who’s right here too” (Valvano 1993). Valvano not only mentioned his family but wanted them to be recognized by name so people knew who they were and how special they were to him.

Everett also addressed the topic of family when he talked about how his family was more worried about him then he ever could have been about himself. In his speech he said, “I was amazed and excited but my family was more screaming and crying, that was the thing that moved me” (Everett 2008). Everett was appreciative of the concern and care his family gave him, and it was meaningful for him to have his family with him during this struggle.

Message of Hope

The message of hope is something that is common in all three speeches as well. Each speech touches on hope because of the situation that each of the speakers was experiencing. They all were facing sadness and adversity, yet they were hopeful and optimistic instead of dwelling on the past. Gehrig referred to hope at the end of his speech when he said, “So, I close in saying that I might have been given a bad break, but I’ve got an awful lot to live for” (Gehrig 1939). This quote shows that Gehrig was not going to let his disease control his life but instead would focus on what he had in life that could continue to make him happy.

Valvano spoke extensively on this message of hope. He stated, “Don’t give up, don’t ever give up. That’s what I’m going to try to do every minute that I have left. I will thank God for the day and the moment I have; cancer can take away all my physical abilities. It cannot touch my mind, it cannot touch my heart and it cannot touch my soul. And those three things are going to carry on forever” (Valvano 1993). Furthermore, Valvano not only told people to be hopeful and not to give up but he also told how this could be done. He said, “To me, there are three things we
all should do every day. We should do this every day of our lives. Number one is laugh. You should laugh every day. Number two is think. You should spend some time in thought. Number three is, you should have your emotions moved to tears, could be happiness or joy. But think about it. If you laugh, you think, and you cry, that’s a full day. That’s a heck of a day. You do that seven days a week, you’re going to have something special” (Valvano 1993). Valvano showed that facing cancer could take away his job in sports but could not take away his joy in life.

Everett had his own message of hope. He talked about hope in a similar way as Valvano with the “never give up” mentality. Everett said, “I will not give up because I am a strong person and I will not settle for less and expect the best out of myself and I will not lose” (2008). Although Everett was not facing death, having to learn to walk again was not going to be something that would deter him from living life to the fullest.

Positive Outlook

All of these speeches also share the characteristic of the rhetoricians having a positive outlook about the adversities they were facing. They realized that they had the good fortune to be involved in professional sports and they had opportunities that most people did not have. Gehrig stated this idea at the beginning of his speech. He said, “Fans, for the past two weeks you have been reading about a bad break I got. Yet today I consider myself the luckiest man on the face of the earth” (Gehrig 1939). This shows that Gehrig had a selfless perspective on his life and his current situation.

Valvano was also not looking for sympathy when he told how he responded when people wanted to feel sorry for him. He said, “People ask me all the time about how you go through your life and how’s your day, and nothing is changed for me” (Valvano 1993). He also told a
story about giving his first speech as a coach and how he struggled. This showed he could make fun of himself and that others should laugh with him.

Everett had the same mentality when he chose his words. He said that he “was not hooked on the negative side and always looking ahead and saying I am not going to let this slow me down” (Everett 2008).

**Conclusion**

I have argued that a genre for sports retirement speeches exists and that there are three shared characteristics in this genre: importance of family, message of hope and a positive outlook. The analysis demonstrates that Gehrig’s “Farewell to Baseball” address set the stage for sports retirement speeches. This study shows that the characteristics and rhetorical choices Gehrig made are still influencing other sports figures when they find themselves having to leave the game they love. The paper also shows how society values sports and how fans want to hear what sports figures say even after they stop playing or coaching. Our society loves to hear a feel-good story and relishes the chance to show empathy toward someone, especially when that person is humble and not looking for sympathy. Gehrig’s “Farewell to Baseball” address is the original retirement speech that created the genre of sports retirement speeches. It continues to be remembered as one of the most famous sports speeches.

**Bibliography**


Social Networking Sites: A Branding Strategy for Local Television Stations

Kari Cassidy, author
Dr. Tang Tang, communication, faculty adviser

Kari Cassidy is a senior at UW Oshkosh majoring in radio-TV-film with a minor in journalism. Her research interests include television programming and promotion, and local station management. She is active in Titan TV and UWO National Broadcasting Society.

Dr. Tang Tang, who recently resigned from UW Oshkosh, was an assistant professor in communication, and received her Ph.D. from Ohio University. Her research interests include audience behavior in new media environments, media management, and the personality attributes that predict success in the creative industries.

Abstract

This paper represents findings from a content analysis study of 54 local television stations in Wisconsin, Illinois, and Minnesota and their use of social networking sites. The sample consisted of all major network television stations: ABC, NBC, CBS, FOX, and the CW. The study found that more than 50% of local television stations in the Midwest use Facebook as a helpful tool for their station and that 64% focus on news. This study discusses how local
television stations have turned to other forms of promotion in social networking sites, like Facebook, to showcase their station, newscasts, sports, weather, and on-air talent. I also explored the potential impact these sites will have on the television industry. The results point to a new trend in the industry.

**Introduction**

Promotional strategies have a significant impact on local television stations, and the main goal of any promotion technique is to create an identity or image for the station; a positive image means positive audience feedback. Without promotions, a local television station has no identity to attract loyal audience members. Since affiliates do not focus much of their attention on promotional efforts for local programming like morning and evening newscasts, the executive boards at local stations need to maintain promotional efforts for key audiences. As local executives see the rapid increase of social networking sites and the vital role they play in the daily lives of the average American, the decision has been made to use this technology in promotional ways for television stations.

The development of social networking is emerging faster than any technology ever has, as researchers have found that one of the fastest growing areas of the World Wide Web is social networking sites (Trusov, Bucklin, and Pauwels 2009). Facebook is the most popular social networking site, having 400 million active users. Those with Facebook profiles spend an average of 20 minutes per day on the site, and more than half of them return daily (Park, Kee, and Valenzuela 2009). Of those 400 million users, more than 500 billion minutes per month are spent on Facebook (Facebook 2010). These social networking sites have become a popular tool for connecting people all over the world. Namsu Park, Kerk Kee, and Sebastian Valenzuela explained that “because of this application’s ability to recruit members and spread messages
easily through social networking, diverse political, social, and other special-interest organizations are creating online groups and utilizing the useful and fan enhancements of Facebook groups” (2009, 729). Many businesses have already turned to these sites to connect with clients because, with social networking sites attracting more users, Facebook has become an area of interest in the media industry for the purpose of cross-promotion. This study aims to examine local television stations’ adoption of social networking sites.

**Literature Review**

**Social Networking**

During the past few years, social networking has impacted our society—for personal use, for business use, and for pure entertainment. Michael Trusov, Randolph Bucklin, and Koen Pauwels (2009) observed social media as a word-of-mouth tool and saw how these sites provide easy ways for current users to invite others to join a network. Their findings suggested that word-of-mouth communication is vital for firms seeking to acquire new customers and that word-of-mouth can have a greater effect than traditional marketing activities.

Park, Kee, and Valenzuela (2009) studied how users were becoming immersed into social networking environments. Their research showed the potential of social networking sites as an emerging, yet powerful tool for drawing the attention of young adults to societal concerns and uniting the young generation as active participants in society. Adam Acar (2008) also observed online social networking behavior, particularly Facebook use, and he demonstrated the impact of social networking sites. He suggested that they are a place to establish a “network of connections” to others (63). Amanda Lenhart, Kristen Purcell, and Aaron Smith (2010) studied social media and mobile internet use among teens and young adults. The study included
important statistics about Facebook becoming the most popular social networking site among teens and even adults.

**Television Promotion**

Promotion is an important part of any business, especially within the media industry, as it serves as a connector between the industry and audiences. Susan Eastman and Gregory Newton (1999) found that on-air promotional strategies are important for networks to attract audiences. With the development of more and more competition every day, promotion has become more important than ever. In their book *Media Promotion and Market for Broadcasting, Cable and the Internet*, Susan Eastman, Douglas Ferguson, and Robert Klein (2006) introduced important promotional strategies for radio, cable, and local television. Some important promotional strategies include realizing that not everything can be promoted and focusing on different types of promotion such as public service announcements.

Adam Armbruster (2008) clarified the importance of social networks for local stations and the need to maintain focus on audience engagement. His interview with Daniel Miller, executive vice president of Neighborhood American, a leader in social media management, shows how and why local stations should use social networking sites. Armbruster’s interview concluded that the most important aspect of social networking is audience engagement.

The previous studies mentioned provided valuable insight into television station promotion and social media promotion use; however, few studied social networks as a promotion strategy for television stations. Thus, this study examines the use of social networks—particularly Facebook—in local television stations. I looked at the topics and content covered by the television stations on their pages, the structural features used by television stations on their
pages, and the similarities and differences of social networking use among television stations of different affiliates, states, and market size.

**Methodology**

This study examined the use of social networking sites by local television stations in Wisconsin, Illinois, and Minnesota during the months of April and May 2010. A content analysis of 54 local Midwest television stations was conducted in small, medium, and large markets.

**Content Analysis**

Of the 54 stations that were analyzed, there were 14 ABC affiliates, 13 NBC affiliates, 12 CBS affiliates, 11 FOX affiliates, and 4 CW affiliates. Twenty-seven stations were from Wisconsin, 10 stations were from Minnesota, and 17 stations were from Illinois. The study examined 9 stations in large markets, 20 in medium markets, and 25 in small markets.

This process was completed by examining each station’s Web site and determining if it had a Facebook or Twitter link present. Twitter is a social networking and micro blogging site, but focuses more on text-based posts up to 140 characters. The focus of the study was particularly on Facebook, and I conducted an in-depth content analysis for those that had Facebook. The study focused only on Facebook because it is the number one social networking site.

**Coding**

I analyzed the content provided on each station’s Facebook page, coding them for (a) affiliate, (b) city location, (c) promotion (Facebook and Twitter), (d) news (local, national, or
Results

This study found that of the 54 stations examined in the content analysis 77.8% had a Facebook account and 22.2% did not. Additionally, 75.9% had a Twitter account, while 24.1% did not. Many stations utilized multiple social networking sites, as 66.7% had both Facebook and Twitter (see table 1). Results for this study are divided into three sections: topic and content, structural features, and differences.

Table 1 Local TV stations’ social network use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Networks</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freq.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>77.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>75.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Topic and Content

I found that the main focus of all local television stations’ Facebook pages was to promote news, specifically local news (see table 2). Local news was the most popular, but some
pages also provided national and world news. Stations seemed less interested in providing weather content with some not having any weather. Of those pages that did have weather they provided radar, temperatures, or an extended forecast. In addition, sports had low coverage on the pages, which was primarily simple sports updates.

Table 2 Topic and content covered by local TV stations’ social network sites

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic and Content</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freq.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Freq.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>64.8%</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>35.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local News</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>62.3%</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>37.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National News</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>39.6%</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>60.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World News</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>92.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weather</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>35.8%</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>64.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radar</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>90.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extended Forecast</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>88.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>26.4%</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>73.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-air Talent</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>92.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Crew</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>98.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additional content on television stations’ Facebook sites were on-air talent and station crew information, but they were present on few pages. On-air talent information was only available on 7.5% of the pages and other station crew information on 1.9% of the pages. The lack of coverage of on-air talent could be because many on-air talents have their own Facebook page aside from the individual stations. The study also found that some stations provided basic
information on their Facebook pages. According to my study, 69% of stations have their address listed, 30% have a phone number, 17% have business hours, 17% have their station slogan, and 15% provided station history or background on their pages.

**Structural Features**

Through this study, I found that many of the stations’ Facebook pages were similar in structure but varied with the amount of interactivity. The number of stations that included internal links was more than double the number that included external links (see table 3). External links were focused on Twitter (26.4%) and YouTube (11.3%).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structural Features</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Yes %</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internal Links</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>73.6%</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>26.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Links</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>28.3%</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>71.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photos</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>66.0%</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>34.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Videos</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>58.5%</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>41.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Events</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>17.0%</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>64.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network Show Promotion</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>84.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contests</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>90.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Schedule and Promotion</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>92.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>60.4%</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>39.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>52.8%</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>47.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The special features that were present on many of the Facebook pages consisted of photos, videos, contests, and events. More than 66% of stations had photos on their pages either added by the station or by fans, and 58.5% of pages had videos, which were specifically for Facebook or based on recent news stories. Other special features available on station pages were events, network show promotion, contests, and local schedule and show promotion. Blogs and “search” options were not an available feature on any of these pages.

Audience engagement is also an important feature of social networking sites. I found that more than half of the pages included an area for feedback from fans, which shows the impact that a site like Facebook is having on audiences. One of the main goals of a social networking site is networking and connecting with others. Of the 54 stations, 66% had some form of fan interaction from commenting to communicating with other fans. That statistic follows along with discussion as 52.8% of pages had either a discussion tab or interaction among fans.

To understand the amount of interactivity on each page, the number of fans was recorded for all 54 stations. The number of fans ranged from 0 to 8,637, with an average of 1,892 per station. The more active, up-to-date pages recorded a much higher number of fans than those pages that were out-of-date or inactive. CBS and NBC affiliates had the highest number of fans with an average of 2,351 and 2,316, respectively. ABC and FOX followed with an average of 1,884 and 1,462 fans. CW recorded the lowest with 389 fans. On average, a station in large markets had 2,007 fans; a station in medium markets had 2,619 fans; and a station in small markets had 1,095 fans.

**Differences**
This study examined the differences among affiliates, states, and station market size. A significant difference was found in discussion among different affiliates. CBS had the highest amount of discussion, followed by NBC, ABC, FOX and CW with no discussion (see table 4).

Table 4 Differences in social network use among stations of different affiliates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Affiliates</th>
<th>Discussion</th>
<th>No Discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Freq.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBS</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>75.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBC</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>69.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>58.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOX</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>27.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CW</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$x^2 = 7.86; p = .020$

A significant difference in the use of Twitter among stations was found in the three states (see table 5). Results showed that with Facebook, Wisconsin stations were more likely to use Twitter, followed by Minnesota and Illinois. Among the three states, a significant difference was found in the coverage of weather. Wisconsin stations provided the most weather, followed by Illinois. Minnesota stations had no weather coverage.

Table 5 Differences in social network use among stations in different states

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Differences</th>
<th>Wisconsin</th>
<th>Illinois</th>
<th>Minnesota</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$x^2$
The study found many differences among stations of different market size. The most significant difference was found between a station’s market size and Facebook usage (see table 6). Medium markets had the largest number of stations with Facebook, followed by large markets and small markets. A considerable difference was found in the coverage of news. Small market stations did not focus as much attention on news as the medium markets and large markets did. There was a sizable difference among coverage of weather. Of the three market sizes, medium market stations’ pages contained weather 65% of the time, while large markets and small markets were much lower. The number of internal links differed by market size. Medium and large markets emphasized internal links, while small market stations did not. The same differences and statistics were recorded for links to stations’ Web sites.

Table 6 Differences in social network use among stations of different market size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Differences</th>
<th>Small</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Large</th>
<th>$\chi^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Facebook</td>
<td>58.3% 41.7%</td>
<td>95.0% 5.0%</td>
<td>88.9% 11.1%</td>
<td>9.20**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News Coverage</td>
<td>43.5% 56.5%</td>
<td>85.0% 15.0%</td>
<td>77.8% 22.2%</td>
<td>8.89*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weather Coverage</td>
<td>13.0% 87.0%</td>
<td>65.0% 35.0%</td>
<td>33.3% 66.7%</td>
<td>12.50**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Links</td>
<td>56.5% 43.5%</td>
<td>90.0% 10.0%</td>
<td>77.8% 22.2%</td>
<td>6.22*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fan Interaction</td>
<td>43.5% 56.5%</td>
<td>85.0% 15.0%</td>
<td>77.8% 22.2%</td>
<td>8.89*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>39.1% 60.9%</td>
<td>75.0% 25.0%</td>
<td>72.8% 27.2%</td>
<td>7.21*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* $p \leq .05$; ** $p \leq .01$
A significant difference was recorded with fan interaction. Small markets recorded the least amount of fan interaction with only 43.5%, while large markets and medium markets found fan interaction important. A difference was seen in terms of comments and photos. Large markets had the largest number of comments with 77.8%, followed by medium markets with 75% and small markets with 39.1%. Small market stations had the lowest percentage of Facebook pages with photos, while large market and medium market stations had a significant amount of photos for fans. A difference was also found in videos on the pages. Medium markets focused on videos most frequently, followed by large markets and small markets.

Discussion

This study examined how local television stations use social networking sites for promotion through a content analysis of 54 stations in the Midwest. This is among one of the first studies focusing on the relationship between local television stations and social networking sites as promotional tools. By demonstrating the effectiveness of social networking for television stations, the findings are important for local executives, news directors, and on-air talents.

My analysis found 77.8% of stations had a Facebook page, which suggests that social networking has become an important tool for local television stations to conduct cross media promotion, build a community, and receive audience feedback. With more than 400 million Facebook users on the site for an average of 20 minutes a day, stations have ample time to attract fans to their site; however, efforts from the whole station need to be implemented for the overall
use of the social networking site to be useful for audiences. Focusing on audience engagement is the key, as people will spend time on sites that deliver a perceived value, where they feel their participation can make a difference, or where there is a personalized entertainment, branding, and advertising experience (Armbruster 2008). If stations make their Facebook pages more interactive, fans are more likely to join so they can provide suggestions.

One interesting finding in this study is the differences among stations of different market size. The study suggests that medium markets put a lot of effort into their social networking sites with 95% of the stations utilizing a Facebook page. Overall, this could suggest that medium markets focus more on their audiences and want them to have access to content at all times. Medium markets want to feel connected to their audiences, and, with social networking sites, they can have real interaction with audiences; however, large markets also paid attention to their social networking promotion, though not as much as medium markets. This suggests that large markets focus more of their attention on serious promotions, like commercials and billboards, because they have more money and employees to run such campaigns. Findings on small markets show that they do not put a lot of effort into social media promotion. Many smaller markets have cut back on the number of employees they have by making one person take on multiple jobs, resulting in fewer employees completing extra projects. Additionally, small markets were the lowest in all categories from news to fan interaction. This study could help small markets realize the impact that Facebook is having on the industry and the benefits it has brought to medium and large markets.

When comparing networks, the CW and FOX had a different approach in terms of the focus of their Facebook pages. Results showed that the CW and FOX provided 15.1% of network show promotions. Many network show promotions were displayed on their Facebook
pages, like “Watch American Idol Tonight at 8,” and not as much promotion was provided about local programming. The CW also focused on network show promotions, mostly because the CW usually does not put much emphasis on local news programming.

Many stations provided photos and videos on their pages; however, some made their videos specifically for Facebook fans. WMTV, an NBC affiliate in Madison, posted personal videos from the morning show anchors promoting the next day’s show. Because audience engagement is an important aspect of social networking, these personal videos demonstrated WMTV’s consideration for its television audiences and fans on Facebook. If stations have enough time to add personal videos, it may be a great way to attract more fans. WKOW-TV was another station that focused on their audience engagement, as employees were asking questions and looking for feedback from fans. Through these interactions, WKOW discovers what their audience wants to see on their daily newscasts.

Cross promotion was another aspect that this study discovered. The cross promotion effect reminds audiences about the station and what it has to offer. Even with Facebook as its own promotional tool, stations still focused on their traditional Web site. More than half of the Facebook pages provided internal links to the station’s Web site or the station’s Twitter page.

While this study provided important insight, there are still limitations. The sample size used for this study was rather small, consisting of 54 stations from three states. This study was not aimed to provide an accurate picture of social networking among local television stations but only an overview of the industry trend. In addition, the study did not examine the stations’ Facebook pages that asked for a friend request. For those that asked for a friend request, I could not review any information provided on the station’s page. Another limitation was the focus on content and not audience perception. Therefore, future studies in this area should include a
national study of local television stations in the United States and their use of social networking sites for a larger sample size. Additionally, future studies should include a focus group regarding how people feel about using social networking sites as a promotional tool.

Despite the limitations, this study suggests that Facebook and other social networking sites are becoming the next big promotional tool that local television stations utilize. Many local television stations in Wisconsin, Illinois, and Minnesota have already implemented social media into their promotional efforts. The study shows that social networking sites can be effective regarding engagement between audiences and stations and—if used correctly—can be beneficial to television stations. With these new technologies, local television audiences have multiple ways to obtain information about their local news stations from station Web sites, Facebook, and Twitter. This research contributes to the promotional efforts of local television stations in the three Midwestern states and provides information to local television stations about the benefits of social networking.
Bibliography


Healing the Feminine Mind/Body Split through Spiritual Performance

Chelsea Ruff, author
Dr. Jordan Landry, English, faculty adviser

Chelsea Ruff will graduate in December 2010, after completing her student teaching placement, with a major in secondary education English and a minor in English as a second language. This paper was written for her English 481 course.

Dr. Jordan Landry joined the Department of English at UW Oshkosh in 2000 after earning her Ph.D. from the University of Colorado at Boulder. She teaches ethnic, women’s, queer, and environmental literatures.

Abstract

In Nalo Hopkinson’s novels Brown Girl in the Ring and Midnight Robber, the female protagonists, Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan, are forced by the patriarchy to live in uncivilized areas. The danger of living in such areas requires these protagonists to work much harder to satisfy their physical needs, including food, water, and safety. Because these protagonists must spend the majority of their time satisfying their physical needs, their mental halves suffer from neglect, creating a mind/body split. The protagonists in these two novels attempt to heal their mind/body splits with the help of spirit guides. Both Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan take on the identity of their spirit guides through their performances of dances and speeches. This adoption of the spirit guides’ identities helps to heal the mind/body split, which then allows characters to rise above the reach of the
oppressive patriarchy, a government controlled by men, and subsequently become empowered.

**Introduction**

“Feminine experience is often one in which mind and body, mind and matter, are joined and, jointly, are ripped off.”¹ This quote by Muriel Dimen claims that feminine experiences can result in a split between the mind and body. In *Brown Girl in the Ring* and *Midnight Robber*, this experience of the mind/body split is a strictly feminine one because the mind/body splits occur when the female protagonists are forced to reside in unsuitable living conditions created by the patriarchy. In both of Nalo Hopkinson’s texts, the oppressive male characters are responsible for the horrendous environments the female protagonists are living in. In *Brown Girl in the Ring*, Rudy, a crime lord, has complete control of the now-decayed city of Toronto and through his actions and the actions of his hired thugs, he continuously pushes the city further and further from its happy past. In *Midnight Robber*, Tan-Tan’s father, Anthony, forces Tan-Tan to go into exile with him when Anthony kills a man. The location they are exiled to is very different from the civilized world Tan-Tan is used to, and the home atmosphere created by Anthony when he beats and rapes Tan-Tan makes her environment even more uncivilized. The environments created in the novels by Rudy and Anthony are called literary dystopias, which can also be thought of as anti-utopias, or the opposite of paradise.

Dystopias in novels often function as a way to draw attention to an imbalance in the world—a disunity and an un-wholeness—and it is this un-wholeness that can lead to a
mind/body split in the female characters. Individuals living in dystopias often reside in third-world conditions, making the simple acts of finding food and water or ensuring physical safety incredibly difficult. Because individuals living in dystopias have to work hard to satisfy their physiological needs, the harmony between their minds and bodies begins to suffer. When individuals are forced by their situations to choose to accommodate either the needs of their body or the needs of their mind, as Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan are both forced to do in Hopkinson’s novels, a disconnect or a split between these two aspects is created because only one need is being satisfied. Deborah Harter argues that in Hopkinson’s novels, “this promotion of the part in fantastic narrative would seem also to reflect a quest for unity in a world whose wholeness has been lost to view.”

In these two novels, Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan are indeed on a “quest for unity,” trying to simultaneously meet their physical needs as well as their mental needs in order to reconnect their minds and bodies, which have been disconnected due to the environments created by the patriarchy. They are able to do this with the help of spirit guides with whom they merge through dance and speech.

In Brown Girl in the Ring and Midnight Robber, religion plays a large role in the reunification of the protagonists’ physical and mental halves. Karen McCarthy Brown asserts that African religions, including Haitian vodou, work past “‘the mind/body splitting’ that has characterized Western thought.” Brown proposes that it is necessary to remedy the mind/body split, and that using religion is one possible solution. This is exactly the path that Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan choose to follow through their use of spirit guides, who operate as god-like entities for the protagonists.
Through the use of spirit guides, with Esu-Legbara acting as spirit guide for Ti-Jeanne and the Robber Queen acting as spirit guide for Tan-Tan, the female protagonists become empowered. Claude F. Jacobs explains that “spirit guides are . . . symbols of protest and empowerment for the largely low-income and working-class female[s].” In Hopkinson’s novels, the Robber Queen and Esu-Legbara follow Jacobs’ definition by allowing the female protagonists outlets for protest and opportunities for empowerment. Without the aid of their spirit guides, it would be more difficult for Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan to protest injustices and attain empowerment. Also, Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan can both be classified as low-income and working-class, hence their need for empowerment. The path to empowerment for these two protagonists can be found in their performances throughout the novels; the performances directly connect them to their spirit guides and reconnect their minds to their bodies. Ti-Jeanne forms these connections through dancing, while Tan-Tan gives speeches.

Barbara Frey Waxman examines the role of dance in multiple works by African American female writers. While all the authors mentioned in her article use the act of dancing in unique ways, they have many similarities that can be carried over to the works of Hopkinson, who is also an African American female writer. One characteristic of dance that is often referred to in African American women’s writing is “dance’s ability to heal the mind/body split.” The actions of Hopkinson’s female protagonists support the healing capacity of dance and music.

I am also carrying over Waxman’s assertions about dance to the performance of speeches because “like spoken or written discourse, it [music] can act as a medium to represent thoughts, transmit ideas, and incite reactions.” Given the similarities between
the uses of speech and music and the similarities between the purpose of Ti-Jeanne’s
dances and Tan-Tan’s speeches, any point made about dance in Waxman’s article can
also be applied to speech performances. I will present information that proves there exists
a very noticeable mind/body split in the female protagonists of these two novels. I will
also show that the female protagonists mend this split through performances that allow
them to form a connection with their spirit guides, who function as the protagonists’
religious icons.

**Brown Girl in the Ring**

Hopkinson’s *Brown Girl in the Ring* follows the experiences of Ti-Jeanne, a
young single mother with great spiritual abilities. Ti-Jeanne lives in the crumbling city of
Toronto, which is controlled by a crime lord named Rudy. At first Ti-Jeanne is afraid of
her powers, which appear in the form of uninvited visions, because her mother went mad
and disappeared after seeing similar visions. This fear helps to further the split between
Ti-Jeanne’s mind and body. As the novel continues, Ti-Jeanne, learns how to better
control her powers with the help of her grandmother, Mami, a respected spiritual leader
in the community. By the end of the novel, Ti-Jeanne is able to control both her mind and
body and use this newly-acquired control to harness her spiritual powers and defeat
Rudy.

   In *Brown Girl in the Ring*, Ti-Jeanne is often unable to control her own mind; she
sees visions of people dying, and they frighten her because she does not understand their
origins or meanings. Her mind acts as a medium through which the spirits (namely Esu-
Legbara) attempt to speak to her, but Ti-Jeanne’s lack of understanding of what is being
expressed inside her mind creates a disconnect between her mind and body. Only Ti-Jeanne’s body is under her control at this point in the novel. Dancing or wordplay on dancing that makes references to dances historically done by the god Esu-Legbara is what leads Ti-Jeanne toward the synchronization of her body and mind.

Hopkinson answered a question about her hobbies in an interview with Gregory Rutledge, saying “I like dancing for fun.” Like Hopkinson, Esu-Legbara, a major character in Brown Girl in the Ring, also enjoys dancing. According to Henry Louis Gates, “Esu [-Legbara] is also a highly accomplished dancer.” In Brown Girl in the Ring, Esu-Legbara acts as Ti-Jeanne’s spiritual guide. Once Esu-Legbara’s affinity for dancing is understood, readers will notice a variety of wordplays on the word “dance,” throughout the novel. This play leads the reader to make multiple connections between Esu-Legbara and the character of Ti-Jeanne. Gates makes the assertion that when Esu-Legbara dances, it is a ritualistic “dance of generation, of creation, [or] of translation.”

Every wordplay on the word “dance” that Hopkinson uses can be classified as related to the dances of generation, creation, or translation, directly connecting Hopkinson’s writing to the legends of Esu-Legbara. When Ti-Jeanne comes to an understanding of the connection between herself and Esu-Legbara, the result is a healing of the mind/body split and a regaining of identity, which ultimately leads to her empowerment. Due to the similarity of the meaning of generation and creation, I will refer to these dances as a single dance, simply referred to as the generation/creation dance.

Hopkinson describes Ti-Jeanne’s visions saying “childhood songs…replayed in her mind, and dancing to their music were images.” Later in the book, Ti-Jeanne discovers these visions are a gift from the spirit, Esu-Legbara, who operates as a
messenger and interpreter of “the gods to man.”¹¹ The “dancing” of the images in her visions is a depiction of the dance of translation done by Esu-Legbara. Through Ti-Jeanne’s visions, Esu-Legbara is translating to her the “will of the gods.”¹¹ In this case, the will of the gods is the death(s) of the individuals she sees in her visions. These visions illustrate a mind/body split because Ti-Jeanne does not understand these visions and cannot control them, making her body the only thing she can truly control at the beginning of the novel. This mention of dance, the dancing visions, does not operate as a healing agent of the mind/body split at this point in the novel. It is not until later, when Ti-Jeanne realizes it is better to use her visions, than to fear them, and begins to harness her spiritual powers that her dancing visions can be interpreted as healing agents.

Another example of the dance of translation is found in the mention of Mami’s tarot cards, which are decorated with “pictures of men and women dancing in colourful, oversized Carnival costumes.”¹² Tarot cards are used to interpret the will of the gods, which means the Mami’s dancing cards that Ti-Jeanne uses in this scene are another representation of Esu-Legbara’s translation dance. This specific mention of dance works to heal the mind/body split. At this point in the novel, Ti-Jeanne has been informed by Mami, her grandmother, that her visions do not mean she’s crazy; instead they are “a gift from God Father. Is a good thing, not a evil thing.”¹³ This knowledge allows Ti-Jeanne to be unafraid of her visions and potential spiritual powers. The tarot cards, a physical representation of her visions, provide a way for Ti-Jeanne to reconnect her mind and body. The working together of her mind and body in a translation dance brings Ti-Jeanne closer to the god Esu-Legbara. This translation dance also results in a reconnection of her mental and physical halves, bringing her closer to her ultimate goal of obtaining power.
Later in the novel, Mami expects “Ti-Jeanne to dance to her tune or find somewhere else to live.” Ti-Jeanne does not dance to Mami’s tune; instead she creates her own tune. She threatens Mami’s control by illustrating that she is willing to leave Mami’s home before conceding to her demands. “She [Ti-Jeanne] stood up and marched toward the front door, Baby on her hip, Tony following uncertainly after her.” Mami is forced to give up some of her power in order to keep Ti-Jeanne from leaving, which Mami does by asking Ti-Jeanne to stay. Ti-Jeanne also demands that Mami must try to help Tony (Ti-Jeanne’s love interest) if she wants Ti-Jeanne to stay: “If I stay, Mami, you have to talk to Tony.” Her demand illustrates an attitude of independence in Ti-Jeanne, an attitude that was not present in her prior interactions with Mami. This reference to dance mirrors Esu-Legbara’s dance of generation/creation. By dancing to her own tune, Ti-Jeanne is exhibiting independence, which results in the generation of a new relationship between Mami and Ti-Jeanne. “Something had changed between them. They were two women now, no longer an adult and a child.” This generation/creation dance illustrates a connection between Ti-Jeanne’s mental desires and her physical actions. Throughout the novel, Ti-Jeanne’s narrative often suggests that she disagrees with Mami’s lifestyle and her religious practices, referring to Mami’s beliefs as “that duppy business” and “old-time nonsense.” Yet this is the first occasion in which Ti-Jeanne physically stands up to her grandmother rather than silently disagreeing with her. Ti-Jeanne’s act of independence shows a collaboration of her mind and body; the belief of her mind is brought to a physical realization through her show of independence, continuing the healing of her mind/body split.
However, the major turning point in the healing of Ti-Jeanne’s mind/body split occurs during Mami’s ritualistic ceremony when Ti-Jeanne becomes a vessel for the spirit of Esu-Legbara. “She [Ti-Jeanne] rose smoothly to her feet and began to dance with an eerie, stalking motion that made her legs seem longer than they were.” It is only after being physically embodied by the spirit of Esu-Legbara that Ti-Jeanne’s spiritual center becomes truly controllable. This specific dance operates as both a translation dance and a generation/creation dance for Ti-Jeanne. It is a translation dance because Esu-Legbara is expressing the will of the gods to Mami through Ti-Jeanne’s body; he is telling her exactly what Ti-Jeanne and Tony must do in order to leave town without being seen. It is also a generation/creation dance, because this is the instance that leads to a close spiritual relationship between Esu-Legbara and Ti-Jeanne. Recognition of this spiritual relationship helps Ti-Jeanne understand the specific origin of her visions and leads her to a realization of her spiritual potential. After this possession by Esu-Legbara, Mami explains to Ti-Jeanne the true meaning of her powers: “It mean you could ease people passing, light the way for them. For them to cross over from this world or the next.”

When Ti-Jeanne realizes that her mental half is not something to be feared but something to be used and channeled, she is able to retake control of her mind, healing her mind/body split.

Evidence of Ti-Jeanne’s healed mind/body split can be found at the end of the novel when Ti-Jeanne is able to use her newly controllable mind to defeat Rudy. The power that Ti-Jeanne’s wholeness has created is illustrated when she calls to the spirits and to the souls of those that Rudy murdered to help her kill him. The spirits and souls
answer her call: “Rudy screamed as the weight of every murder he had done fell on him.”

Waxman proposes that the “reintegration of body with mind is central to women’s empowerment.”\textsuperscript{21} Esu-Legbara’s possession of Ti-Jeanne during their dance is what leads to the reintegration of Ti-Jeanne’s body and mind. This is apparent when the reader realizes that before Esu-Legbara possessed Ti-Jeanne’s body and forced her to dance, she had no control over her spiritual powers or her mind. Had she not been forced to dance by Esu-Legbara and as a consequence synchronized her mind and body, she would not have been able to ask eight spirits and countless souls to help her defeat Rudy and his henchmen. Therefore, Ti-Jeanne’s defeat of Rudy relied entirely on Esu-Legbara’s decision to possess her and dance through her.

The instances that connect Ti-Jeanne to dancing can be interpreted as dances resulting in a translation of the gods’ will or dances resulting in the creation/generation of new relationships. These dances progressively bring Ti-Jeanne to a closer relationship with Esu-Legbara, which helps her better understand the mental part of her identity. This understanding enables Ti-Jeanne to regain control of her mind, and once both her mind and body are under her control, Ti-Jeanne is given the opportunity to realize her full spiritual potential. Ti-Jeanne acts upon that potential at the end of the novel when she defeats Rudy and the final result is the empowerment of Ti-Jeanne. I have explained the mind/body split, religious performances, and consequent empowerment of Ti-Jeanne; I will be examining the same aspects in Hopkinson’s character Tan-Tan from \textit{Midnight Robber}. 
Midnight Robber

*Midnight Robber* recounts the experiences of Tan-Tan, a young woman who was exiled with her father at a young age. She is continuously raped and beaten by her father while growing up, but reaches her breaking point on her sixteenth birthday. She finds courage by taking on the identity of the Robber Queen spirit and kills her father in self-defense. After killing her father, Tan-Tan flees her town and lives in the wilderness with a tribe of bird and lizard creatures called douens. As the novel continues, Tan-Tan strengthens her relationship with the Robber Queen identity to allow herself an outlet for expression that would otherwise have been denied because she is wanted by the authorities for the murder of her father. As the novel progresses, Tan-Tan is able to use her newfound courage to heal her mind/body split by defeating the bad Tan-Tan, the mental remnant of her father’s abuse.

Tan-Tan, the female protagonist of *Midnight Robber*, pretends she is the Robber Queen. The Robber Queen has not historically been a religious figure, but rather a source of entertainment. The Robber Queen is a female depiction of the Midnight Robber, a traditional Mardi Gras figure. However, in *Midnight Robber*, the Robber Queen appears as a god-like entity for Tan-Tan. As Hopkinson said in an interview with Diane Glave, “In *Midnight Robber* I haven’t given an overt form of religion to the world I created. But I did build in spiritual beliefs.”^22^ For Tan-Tan, the Robber Queen is the only spiritual entity in whom she strongly believes, and Tan-Tan chooses to form a connection with her in order to make use of the Robber Queen’s identity. This supports the assertion made by Gale Jackson, which claims that the tendency of African performances to place emphasis on individuals “becoming gods [themselves]” comes from the Yoruba culture.^23^
Becoming a god, like the Robber Queen, is exactly what Tan-Tan does throughout *Midnight Robber*.

The creation of Tan-Tan’s mind/body split occurs on her ninth birthday when her father rapes her for the first time. She is forced to divide her identity to reconcile the perceived division of her father’s identity: “Daddy’s hands were hurting, even though his mouth smiled at her like the old Daddy, the one from before the shift tower [a form of travel] took them. Daddy was two daddies. She felt her own self split in two to try to understand, to accommodate them both.”

At this point obtainment of wholeness becomes more difficult because now there are two mental entities vying for the use of Tan-Tan’s body rather than just one. This struggle is created because Tan-Tan’s strongest relationship is with her father; he is the only connection she has with her past life, the life she led before she and her father were forced into exile. When her father, the person she loves most, begins to hurt her, Tan-Tan just cannot understand: “Why was Daddy doing this to her? Tan-Tan couldn’t get away, couldn’t understand.”

To keep her father in the esteemed position he held before he raped her, Tan-Tan divides her father into “old [good] Antonio” and “bad Antonio.” In order to keep from feeling that she deserves Antonio’s abuse, Tan-Tan divides herself into Good Tan-Tan and Bad Tan-Tan. It is only the Bad Tan-Tan who deserves Antonio’s cruelty, which allows Tan-Tan to escape the abuse through Good Tan-Tan, or the Robber Queen. Tan-Tan chooses to take on the identity of the Robber Queen in addition to her original identity to deal with the traumatic experience of her incestuous rape: “She wasn’t Tan-Tan, the bad Tan-Tan. She was Tan-Tan the Robber Queen…and strong men does tremble in their boots when she pass by. Nothing bad does ever happen to Tan-Tan the Robber Queen. Nothing can’t hurt she.”
This situation creates the identity conflict that Tan-Tan must work to remedy throughout the rest of the novel. As Tan-Tan continues to deal with distressing experiences, she always turns to the persona of the Robber Queen to solve any issues. Tan-Tan does this because she has no reason to believe her own personality is strong enough to solve anything, since her own personality could not keep her father from raping her.

Tan-Tan’s choice to identify with the Robber Queen comes from a memory from her childhood. On one occasion, when Tan-Tan was young girl, she stood up to her father: “the time when she’d been playing Robber Queen in the julie-mango tree and talking back so breezily to Daddy.” In addition to “talking back” to her father, Tan-Tan disobeys her father’s order to “stay up there [in the julie-mango tree].” Tan-Tan recognizes that the first time she ever stood up to her father was when she dressed and acted like the Robber Queen. This experience operates as the major factor in Tan-Tan’s decision to take on the Robber Queen’s identity. By embodying the Robber Queen, Tan-Tan is mentally rejecting her father’s actions. When she is being raped, she goes to a place in her mind where she cannot be hurt, a place where she can be the Robber Queen.

As the novel continues, Tan-Tan’s Robber Queen embodiment progresses from a mental act to a physical one. At the age of 16, Tan-Tan is beaten and raped again, but this time she takes a more active role as the Robber Queen: “It couldn’t have been she. It must have been the Robber Queen who pulled out the knife. Antonio raised up to shove into the person on the bed again. It must have been the Robber Queen, the outlaw woman, who quick like a snake got the knife braced at her breastbone just as Antonio slammed his heavy body right onto the blade.” This situation, just like the earlier rape scene, results in the assumption of the Robber Queen identity to be in control once more.
The end result of this assumption of identity is a transcendence of her own identity to the identity of the Robber Queen. This transcendence of identity allows Tan-Tan to bring about an end to her father’s continuous raping, letting her once more control her own body.

After murdering her father in self-defense, fear of persecution forces Tan-Tan to leave her home. She has no other option but to live with the douens, where the lack of human language and contact begins to affect Tan-Tan. The only outlet that will allow Tan-Tan to once again use human language is the performance of rhetoric under the disguise of the Robber Queen. As Tan-Tan shares her Robber Queen identity with others, the entity she embodies begins to more closely reflect the traditional figure of the Midnight Robber. The traditional Midnight Robber “functions as a social and political critic, humorist, and educator in the manner of the calypsonians [musicians of the Afro-Caribbean style of music, calypso]” through the art of oratory performances or speeches.²⁸ Tan-Tan’s increasing embodiment of the Robber Queen is apparent in her actions, but more specifically within her oratory performances.

The first time Tan-Tan performs as the Robber Queen in front of an audience, she criticizes flawed relationships between humans. Tan-Tan finds inspiration for her speech when she sees a mother beating her grown son. The reason this evoked such strong feelings is because of her own experiences of being beaten by her father. In traditional Mardi Gras songs, similar to Tan-Tan’s speeches, “strong feelings rise spontaneously into improvised lyrics.”²⁹ Kathryn VanSpanckeren proposes that improvised lyrics, which have historically been a part of Mardi Gras performances, allow individuals to freely express themselves. For example, Tan-Tan expresses herself by saying “I shamed to be of
your kind… You treat he worse than dog, yet he loves you like hog love mud… Me tell you, don’t hurt your son no more. Me will know. Me, Tan-Tan, the Robber Queen.”

Tan-Tan uses her Robber Queen identity as a means of moral expression because it provides her with a sense of anonymity. When an audience sees Tan-Tan as the Robber Queen, no one sees her past. When Tan-Tan is the Robber Queen, she feels no guilt and no shame. She does not hear the Bad Tan-Tan inside her head, constantly criticizing her, saying things like: “[you] only good for dead” or “you is a wicked crosses for people to bear.” The Robber Queen identity silences the Bad Tan-Tan, leaving Tan-Tan as the Robber Queen free to fight injustice. When Tan-Tan again confronts humans about the wrongs they are committing, she physically assaults a bar owner who has been giving his customers watered down drinks while charging them for strong drinks. Here, the “strong feelings” that give way to Tan-Tan’s improvised lyrics come from her experiences of being exploited by her father and her desire to stop exploitation wherever she can. She forces the bar owner to drink multiple buckets of water as punishment and warns him “When them ask you who bring about your ruination this day, tell them Tan-Tan the Robber Queen… if you start watering your drinks again, you won’t see me, but I go know.”

In both of these situations, Tan-Tan, as the Robber Queen, acts as an advocate for social change, informing and warning individuals of the wrongs they are committing. Performing as the Robber Queen reconnects Tan-Tan’s mental and physical parts: “She [Tan-Tan] realised what she had to do to quiet the inner voice that never ceased. Bad Tan-Tan had given her peace for a while when she intervened on the behalf of the abused son.” Tan-Tan comes to the understanding that only aiding others can silence her ever-
critical mental half, the Bad Tan-Tan. Therefore, in order to reconnect her mind and body, Tan-Tan must continue to use her body to express the identity of the Robber Queen, or the Good Tan-Tan. This is the only course of action that can keep her two halves acting in harmony without any interference from the Bad Tan-Tan.

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, both Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan undergo significant transformations throughout Hopkinson’s novels. These transformations occur because these two female protagonists are attempting to heal mind/body splits that occur as a result of residing in environments created by the patriarchy. Living in such conditions can be incredibly harmful but, fortunately, both Ti-Jeanne and Tan-Tan are able to heal the discord between their minds and bodies. Ti-Jeanne heals her mind/body split through dancing, which acts as a way to form a spiritual relationship with Esu-Legbara. Similarly, Tan-Tan heals her mind/body split by giving speeches under the identity of the Robber Queen. In both of these characters, the healing of their mind/body splits occurs with the help of their spiritual guides through ritualistic performances, which ultimately leads to a realization of empowerment.
Notes

6. Ibid., 91.
13. Ibid., 47.
14. Ibid., 57.
15. Ibid., 58.
16. Ibid., 62.
17. Ibid., 36–37.
18. Ibid., 94.
19. Ibid., 103.
20. Ibid., 226.
24. Hopkinson, Midnight Robber, 140.
25. Ibid., 31.
26. Ibid., 14.
27. Ibid., 168.
30. Hopkinson, Midnight Robber, 244–45.
31. Ibid., 193 and 214.
32. Ibid., 254.
33. Ibid., 248.
Bibliography


Maggi Cage’s 1985 “Bread and Roses” Press Conference: A Rhetorical Response to Abortion Clinic Violence

Lesley Shreves, author
Dr. Carmen Heider, Communication and Women’s Studies, faculty adviser

Lesley Shreves graduated cum laude from UW Oshkosh in May 2010 with a degree in speech communication and Spanish. This paper originated in a rhetoric seminar on the women’s movement in the United States. Lesley has always been interested in the study of communication and how audiences affect the design of texts. She plans to work with AmeriCorps and teach English in Mexico.

Dr. Carmen Heider is an associate professor in communication and women’s studies, and she received her Ph.D. from Penn State University. She began teaching at UW Oshkosh in 2000. Her research interests focus on the intersections of rhetoric and gender in relation to women’s rights activism and women in prison.

Abstract

Few people know that Appleton, Wisconsin, was a focal point of the abortion controversy in the 1980s. I conducted a rhetorical analysis of Dr. Maggi Cage’s press conference titled “Bread and Roses” held January 22, 1985. This text was in direct response to the violence at the Fox Valley Reproductive Health Care Center in Appleton. In an interview with Maggi Cage, former executive director of the center, on March 23, 2010, Cage stated that the protesting at the clinic was so intense she was advised to get a gun. She said she received a death threat every week, “it sort of just came with the territory.” It is unclear whether this document, called a press conference, was televised, used as a manuscript for a speech at an event, or whether it was used as a print publication. The only information available about “Bread and Roses” is the actual publication which I retrieved from Maggi Cage’s archives in Polk Library.
This text demonstrates how activists can respond to situations that are highly controversial and what rhetorical strategies can be implemented when meeting the demands of multiple audiences. Cage focused on religious extremist groups who used violent rhetoric and argued that such rhetoric made actual acts of violence more likely. Her audience shaped the rhetoric she used, especially in relation to God and religion. She had to meet the demands of multiple audiences in her press conference by responding to the acts of “terrorism” at the clinic. She denounced those who pursued illegal acts and showed appreciation for those who protested using legal means.

Introduction

Dr. Maggi Cage, an avid pro-choice advocate, attended the University of Wisconsin Madison and opened an abortion clinic in 1977 in Appleton, Wisconsin. Her views on abortion were impacted by her own experiences; she became pregnant when abortion was still illegal in Wisconsin. She had an abortion performed by a doctor who was prosecuted for performing illegal abortions, though the charges were later dismissed. Cage held a press conference on January 22, 1985, titled “Bread and Roses” that addressed the issues of freedom of speech and the role that violent rhetoric can play in facilitating acts of violence. This document was in direct response to the firebombing that occurred at the Fox Valley Reproductive Health Care Center in Appleton. Cage addressed the harassment and other illegal acts that occurred at the center. Her press conference was heavily concentrated on how a small number of individuals belonging to religious groups used harassment and intimidation tactics that violated patients’ rights, while other religious groups offered help and support to the clinic. Abortion clinic violence was a nationwide problem in the 1980s. According to David Nice, 30 abortion clinic bombings
occurred between May 29, 1982, and January 1, 1985, across the United States, which excluded the actual bombing that Cage referred to in her text.\(^4\)

I will further explore the topics of free speech, abortion, religion, and violence through a rhetorical analysis of Cage’s text “Bread and Roses.” I will preview the context for the text, conduct a rhetorical analysis of “Bread and Roses,” and argue that this text demonstrates how activists can respond to situations that are highly controversial and what rhetorical strategies can be implemented when meeting the demands of multiple audiences.

**Background and Context**

Cage was best known by the public for supporting women’s reproductive rights and the rights of the LGBTQ community. Thus, she was seen as controversial—even radical—for her ideas about women’s rights by more conservative people. She was well-known throughout the state and invited to speak at many pro-choice and women’s rights rallies, conferences, and meetings.\(^5\)

The audience for “Bread and Roses” included a vast majority of people with many different views on religion and abortion. The audience included people who had been sabotaging the clinic, the people who helped the clinic succeed and those who protested at the clinic legally, as she spoke very highly of legal protesters. The audience would receive the message immediately if it was delivered at a public event. Also, since it was a press conference, her text was most likely published in the newspaper and her speech may have been aired on a local news channel or a public television station. However, as previously stated the method of delivery remains unclear. The demographics of the audience was potentially people of all ages, ethnicities, genders, and religious backgrounds residing in the Fox Valley area.
The major constraints that helped shape the design of this text were the anti-abortion movement, the backlash toward feminist ideas, questioning the normal gender roles of women in our society, and violence in abortion clinics. Since this text was written after the ruling of *Roe v. Wade*, the issues Cage focused on were social as she attempted to change the general public’s attitudes and beliefs toward abortion. They were also political, in that legislation was passed in every state determining what was required for women to receive abortions. For example, some states require written consent of a parent or guardian if the patient is younger than eighteen years of age. Anti-abortion sentiment was prevalent throughout America in the 1970s and 1980s.

Rhetorician Celeste Condit identified six stages in abortion rhetoric: the professional stage, the narrative stage, the ideographic argument, the ideograph of choice, the normalization struggle, and the stalemate. According to Celeste Condit, “Pro-life advocates maintained a steady effort to limit the times, places, finances, and conditions under which an abortion could be performed. Thus, by 1977, the sixth stage of the argument, the stalemate, had occurred.” The stalemate made it impossible for pro-choice advocates and pro-life advocates to take further action on the issue of abortion. Communication had, for the most part, come to a standstill where no novel arguments were made for proponents on either side of the issue. Abortion was legalized, but since so many restrictions still existed, women were not completely free to choose what they wanted to do with their bodies. For this reason, many women were treated with hostility when deciding that an abortion was the right course of action. Condit discussed the rhetorical implications this stalemate had on women and society: “Many abortions were conducted legally each year, but social attitudes against abortion and in favor of nurturing had been retained, so that abortion had not generally become the birth control method of choice…. The rhetorical balance thus materially protected women from hundreds of thousands of dangerous illegal
abortions, while discouraging many hundreds of thousands of preventable fetus killings. It did not satisfy all participants, but it met some of the needs of all.”

This compromise reinforced women’s traditional gender roles, enforcing the idea that they should still play the nurturing and caring role. But abortion was now legal, meeting the needs of abortion advocates. However, abortion was still accompanied by a negative social stigma that discouraged women from having them.

Historian Linda Gordon explained that prominent religious leaders in the 1970s and 1980s discussed their concerns about what abortion and contraception meant in relation to women: “a license to sexual promiscuity, a reproduction control method that would allow women to have nonmarital and even multiple sexual partners without the restraint of childbearing.” This brought into question the morals of women who considered abortion a method of birth control and went through with the procedure. Using this reasoning, if women were not promiscuous, Americans would not have to worry about women having abortions. Anti-abortion views were also closely associated with the gender roles women in American society were supposed to hold. Should women possess the right to terminate a pregnancy if they are not ready to have a child? According to Gordon, “Abortion became for its opponents a powerful anti-motherhood symbol, indeed, the antithesis of motherliness.”

Women were seen in a loving, caring, and nurturing role, and women receiving abortions were perceived by many to be quite the opposite—hateful, uncaring, and neglectful women who did not wish to be mothers. Society had preconceived notions about what all women who got abortions were like. It was easier to combine all women who had abortions into a specific category than allow these women to define their experiences for themselves.
In a study conducted by Anne Shaw and Alane Spinney on violence in abortion clinics in Milwaukee, the religious fundamentalists they observed protesting outside abortion clinics would not engage in dialogue with the patients. As Shaw and Spinney stated, “in most of these encounters there is no attempt at conversation with the patient. Patients who attempt to explain their decision or discuss extenuating circumstances are met with standard responses: ‘You don’t have to kill your baby.’” These kinds of repetitive phrases did not initiate an opportunity for civic dialogue to occur between two individuals who held opposing viewpoints. Civic dialogue works toward some sort of common understanding in an environment that is open to all viewpoints even though they may not be held by the majority. Discussion is focused on allowing all participants to contribute to better the circumstances of their own world. Instead, this discouraged dialogue because there was no empathy or attempts to meet in the middle on these issues. When individuals interacted only with people who held their same principles and ideas, the likelihood of engaging in meaningful dialogue that created change and promoted tolerance and acceptance of others was highly unlikely. This study differs from Cage’s response to the fire bombing because she encouraged legal protest and a free flow of ideas. As long as the protesters did not commit or condone acts of “terrorism” she encouraged the right of all to practice free speech.

The anti-abortion movement was connected to the anti-feminist movement. Feminism, women’s rights, and reproductive rights seemed to be interrelated issues. Obviously, there were people who took the pro-life or pro-choice stance, but the division went much further than that. One of the divisions among pro-life advocates was the use of violence against abortion clinics. This was another constraint that helped shape Cage’s press conference. While most Christian anti-abortion advocates were against the use of violence, a select few advocated this type of
protest. According to Gordon, “abortion rights advocates charged that the rhetoric condemning abortion as murder contributed directly to the violence and allowed assassins to consider themselves as agents of holy work—the essence of terrorism.”¹¹ These “acts of terrorism” were committed on abortion clinics throughout the United States, and the issue of free speech in relation to scare tactics, harassment, and embarrassment was called into question by many abortion advocates. Condit said this about Christians who believed the use of violence was tolerable: “one of the dominant features of this Christian, patriotic, familial value set was a view of women as subordinate and passive, primarily designed for child-rearing.”¹² This view of women did not encourage a decision-making process or assessment of whether the woman was ready to have a child, since this established their purpose in life was to have children. Cage addressed specific issues that were politically, socially, and culturally relevant during the 1980s. Her word choice and message was shaped by her audience, as was true of most rhetors speaking about highly charged topics.

**Rhetorical Analysis**

The text by Cage titled “Bread and Roses” was unique because it outlined problems occurring at the clinic in Appleton, that also required national attention. Cage began the press conference by talking about what acts of violence had occurred at the clinic since it opened: “We have reported 14 episodes of trespassing, several cases of vandalism, instances of disorderly conduct, and assault.”¹³ She said the issues were mainly caused by a select few individuals from certain religious groups. The evidence she used related directly to her experiences at the clinic. According to Cage, “a small band of misguided individuals whose leader claims a ‘vision from God’ have waged a futile campaign against the clinic and our patients.”¹⁴ Cage clarified that she
was not attacking religion or anyone who simply was not pro-choice, but instead a smaller group of religious fundamentalists who used illegal tactics. She also stated that their attempt to stop abortions was not only against the law, but ineffective. In addition, she used emotional appeals to describe the pain that the staff and patients of the clinic had faced and characterized the patients as victims. Describing direct instances of being threatened or harassed allowed the audience to visualize the staff as victims. According to Cage, “patients at the clinic have been yelled at through bull horns, frightened by false information on picket signs concerning abortion, had a late term fetus waved in their face, and all under the pretense of God and free speech.”

Cage does not specify whether the late term fetus was a visual or an actual late term fetus, but one would imagine it was a visual. Actions like this made the religious group appear fanatical. It is important to note the subtle use of the word “pretense.” This signified the charade that the religious group was using God and freedom of speech to justify their actions. Cage claimed that God would not advocate such actions. Cage stated, “I do not know the god that mandates terrorism.” Terrorism was a loaded word, and this sentence firmly demonstrated the extreme opposition between the terms “God” and “terrorism.” Many people would equate God with compassion, while terrorism implied acts of violence. Putting these opposing terms together proved Cage’s claim that the groups who acted in this manner were adding to the violence in the world, as well as being framed as terrorists—at least implicitly.

Cage clearly stated the differences between the two religious groups that protested at the clinic. A group of Catholics picketed at the clinic and prayed the rosary. This group did not violate the civil rights of patients or staff at the clinic. According to Cage, “those individuals truly understood their right to free speech as they never transgressed the law.” The use of the word “transgressed” was thought-provoking; transgressions were talked about when violating
law as well as in relation to religious matters such as the Ten Commandments. This word permeated both the secular and spiritual worlds that Cage seemed to be referring to. She claimed that there was a monumental difference between the Catholic group that came to the clinic and the religious group that committed crimes and violated their right to free speech. Cage stated that “the blatant contrast between these two groups can only lead one to conclude that the current activities at the clinic are terrorism—pure and simple.” The assumed comparison that arose was that anti-abortion fanatics were terrorists. Cage spelled out the differences in the ways these two groups acted toward patients and workers to justify her implicit characterization of them as terrorists. The word “terrorism” was used once again as a pejorative term to gain the attention of the audience, but also to call the act of violence what it legally was. The violent protesters used violence and intimation to attempt to change the ruling on abortion. This image of violent anti-abortion advocates as terrorists was extremely forceful, and this may have invoked anger in the audience because they had to reflect on the women who coped with the situation every day.

Cage magnified the issue of violence at abortion clinics by showing how this type of backlash was occurring across the country. She directly tied violent actions to the violent rhetoric used by pro-life extremists. Cage explained, “Then, when the worst happens—a bombing—the anti-abortion fanatics side-step the real issue of their responsibility for making it happen. You hear the rhetoric about being opposed to violence, but yet they continue to commit less dramatic acts of violence in front of clinics and thus continue to make other bombings likely.” Cage argued (through cause-effect reasoning) that when pro-life supporters committed smaller crimes, they were opening the door for worse crimes to be committed at the clinics. Thus, she was leading her audience to believe that some pro-life advocates condone these violent actions. The violence occurred because religious groups did not speak out against this kind of treatment
toward women. If rhetoric that promoted violence or dehumanized a victim was used, it was
much easier to justify violence. Cage used proximity to enhance her point when placing
“bombing” and “anti-abortion fanatics” close to each other. This conveyed the relationship and
interconnectedness of the action and the people.

She also talked about the Christian and Jewish people who helped the staff and patients at
the clinic in a number of ways. She was attempting to appeal to the audience through religious
affiliation. She praised these two groups for their support at the clinic with the hopes of gaining
further assistance and acceptance from religious groups whether they were for or against
legalized abortion. In a phone interview on March 23, 2010, Cage said the Catholics who came
to the clinic helped the women clarify their values and did a great service to the women.20 They
helped pregnant women choose the best option for them, and seemed to possess certain
fundamental values that made them able to do so. According to Cage, “they come forward to
demonstrate love, compassion, and tolerance, for these are the true visions of God’s love and
democratic ideals.”21 Cage also used the term “God” with frequency throughout the text. She
intertwined religion and politics when talking about “God’s love and democratic ideals.” She
also said that people who were willing to come forward and support these women have a number
of enduring qualities, implying that clinic picketers who condone and commit violent acts against
women do not possess these same enduring qualities.

Cage concluded the text by referring to the famous ruling that legalized abortion, *Roe v.
Wade*; “On this the twelfth anniversary of *Roe v. Wade*, I call upon those who oppose abortion to
work through lawful means, rather than resorting to terrorism.”22 Cage magnified the importance
of her words by referring to the legalization of abortion that occurred 12 years earlier. She
concluded by again referencing terrorism to make certain her audience understood the severity of this action.

The ideological assumption throughout the text was that women have the right to choose if they want to have a child, and that they should not be persecuted, judged, or harmed by anyone for their choice. Women who were persecuted for choosing to have abortions were, as Cage suggests, the victims of terrorism. The issue of free speech was in question because free speech would not include the harassment and torment a number of patients experienced at the clinic. Throughout the text, Cage served the interests of the patients and staff of the abortion clinic, pro-choice advocates, the Catholics who prayed the rosary, and the Christian and Jewish people who supported the clinic. The interests of pro-life supporters who condone the use of violence against women were not served as they were understood to be terrorists and supporters of terrorism because they took no steps to stop the acts of violence. Certain religious groups were praised for their work at the clinic and Cage only condemned a handful of individuals. She attempted to show that God would not support these actions and that some religious sects were violating major principles that God and religion stood for. The concept of free speech was tied into the text, as was the opinion that lawful free speech does not include violence.

Cage stated that a small number of individuals used violent or immoral tactics against women in the name of God and free speech. Cage presented her opinions clearly stating that all were entitled to their opinion; however, once the patients and staff felt victimized or threatened by the presence of religious groups, the groups’ freedom of speech was revoked. Women should have the right to choose whether or not they want to have a baby without feeling endangered by their decision.
Conclusion

Audience analysis affects the way rhetors create and deliver their speeches. In “Bread and Roses,” Cage’s wording was more conservative than that of previous texts that addressed like-minded people. In previous a previous speech titled “Esprit de Corps,” Cage referred to “women’s libbers, fags, dykes, abortionists, peaceniks and solar powered free thinking liberals,” but those terms had negative connotations. In “Bread and Roses” she attempted not to offend her audience yet still make her point that violence against women seeking abortions was not an act of free speech but an act of terrorism. Today, 25 years later, there are still violations of patients’ and workers’ rights in abortion clinics, usually by religious fundamentalist groups. Cage’s text remains relevant to our society, as we are still in verbal and physical conflicts over the issues she highlighted in her text.

Cage discussed the issues of intolerance regarding a woman’s right to choose whether or not to have an abortion. She centered her statement on the element of freedom of speech and how religious groups did not have the right to use violent rhetoric, claiming God as their guiding force. In a study conducted in 2009 by the Pew Research Center, 47 percent of Americans were in favor of legalized abortion and 44 percent were against it. The nation remains at odds on the issue of abortion 37 years after the passage of Roe v. Wade.

The audience for Cage’s press conference affected the way she shaped her text and how she presented her ideas. Cage used religion to appeal to multiple audiences by denouncing the small religious extremist group who condoned violence, but still spoke about God as loving and compassionate. She did not want to completely condemn God and religion, as she would lose the Christian and Jewish audience who had previously supported her work at the clinic. She talked about religion in different ways, almost paradoxically, to accommodate for multiple audiences.
with various interpretations of the influence God and religion had on their lives. Picketing at the clinic was acceptable as long as the protesters did not overstep their boundaries. But where were the boundaries, and what actions were upheld by free speech and what actions were not? In Cage’s opinion, anyone who threatened, intimidated or harmed patients at the clinic was not expressing an opinion through free speech, but instead committing an act of terrorism.

Condit and Gordon argued that the rhetoric surrounding abortion had maintained the status quo regarding women’s gender roles in society. Choice was devalued and this led to prejudice, discrimination, injustice, and even acts of violence toward people who did not accept the traditional values that American society typically supported, particularly those regarding family and motherhood. Her text endorsed the right to free speech as long as the rights of the patients and clinic workers were not being compromised. Thus, violent anti-abortion protesters were not practicing free speech. Cage focused positively on the Christian and Jewish groups who came to the clinic. She attempted to highlight the non-violent protesters and how their efforts at the clinic were completely acceptable. She obviously discussed the group of individuals who participated in the fire-bombing, but her positive focus on the Christian and Jewish supporters invited an optimistic response. Her audience could appreciate that Cage did not condemn all anti-abortion activists and she actually encouraged all protesters to lawfully work for political change. This invited the audience to see that Cage was not simply attacking all parties who were pro-life. She did not respond to the fire-bombing at the clinic with a hostile and close-minded opinion that protesting at clinics should be completely off-limits. Instead, she remained tolerant and accepting of protesters and the ability to voice one’s opinion. This is an insightful way to respond as both parties may have something to learn from each other if open dialogue was initiated in a face-to-face setting. By advocating non-violent protest, Cage promoted a climate of support for people
on both sides of the abortion argument and simultaneously met the demands of multiple audiences.

**Notes**

3. Ibid.
5. Maggi Cage, Archives and Area Research Center, M96-001:2, UW Oshkosh Polk Library.
9. Ibid, 305.
14. Ibid.
15. Ibid.
16. Ibid.
17. Ibid.
18. Ibid.
19. Ibid.

20. Cage interview.


22. Ibid.

23. See, for example, Cage’s “Esprit de Corps.”


Bibliography


Cage, Maggi. Papers. UW Oshkosh Polk Library.


James Madison: A Tale of Two Presidencies

Derek Daron, author
Dr. David J. Siemers, Political Science, faculty adviser

Derek Daron graduated from UW Oshkosh in May 2010 with a degree in political science. He plans to attend Marquette Law School in September 2011.

Dr. David J. Siemers is a professor in the Department of Political Science. He received his Ph.D. from UW Madison and has taught at UW Oshkosh since 2001. Siemers’ most recent book is Presidents and Political Thought, published by the University of Missouri Press.

Abstract

James Madison was one of the most influential figures in American politics and is known for his role in the ratification of the Constitution, but he is relatively unknown for his role as president. This essay reevaluates Madison’s performance as president by closely examining the actions he took, his rationale for taking those actions, and the consequences that resulted. I conclude that, despite his above-average ratings in presidential studies, the decisions Madison made were flawed and almost resulted in disastrous outcomes for the nation.

Introduction
James Madison (1751–1836), one of the nation’s founders, is well known for his role in helping to draft the Constitution of the United States. He served as a member of the first four Congresses from 1789 to 1797 and as secretary of state to Thomas Jefferson from 1801 until 1809. From 1809 to 1817 he served two terms as the fourth president of the United States following Jefferson, and he led the United States against Britain in the War of 1812 (Padover 1953; Wills 2002).

Despite his prominence in the founding of the nation, Madison’s presidency is relatively unknown. A recent Siena Research Institute (SRI) poll ranked Madison as the sixth greatest president in the history of the nation based on 20 categories including intelligence, leadership ability, and relationship with Congress (Kelly and Lonnstrom 2010). In addition, the best-known polls of presidential performance, which were started in 1948 by Arthur Schlesinger Sr., have mostly ranked him as “near-great” (Schlesinger 1997). Although he was given very favorable ratings in these studies, Madison was a president who made many problematic decisions in various aspects of the office.

The purpose of this essay is to re-examine the Madison presidency by assessing his performance in office and long-term influence on American politics, as well as to contrast my findings with polls of presidential performance such as those by the SRI and Schlesinger. I argue that Madison’s first six years as president were nothing short of a failure due to his misguided policies and strict adherence to a problematic political theory. The American people, however, overcame those flawed policies and claimed an unlikely victory in the War of 1812, which made Madison’s final two years very successful. First, I establish criteria for determining what makes for good presidential performance by adopting the works of presidential scholars. Next, I evaluate Madison’s presidency in the first six years of his administration and then in the final
two years as it relates to each of those criteria. Finally, I discuss the greatness of the Madison presidency.

**Identifying Greatness**

In judging an office as unique as the presidency, it is difficult to define greatness. Even the worst presidents were able to establish some measure of political success simply by being elected because it established legitimacy for the president as the leader of his political party. From that point, however, there are many differences in the leadership styles of each president. For example, some presidents such as Madison and Jefferson were legislative supremacists who believed that the real power of the government rested with Congress, not the president. In contrast, presidents like Andrew Jackson and Franklin Roosevelt established active roles for the executive office to use Congress as a political ally with which to gain power and influence policy (Landy and Milkis 2000).

Despite the immense differences in the way presidents have approached the office, any great president must be successful at influencing legislation and creating policy precedent. This can be done through a combination of constitutional powers such as the presidential veto or the State of the Union address, listed in Article II of the Constitution. Although the presidential veto was originally only used on bills the president deemed unconstitutional, “veto bargaining” has become an important tool for the president in the legislative process (Cameron 2000). While using influence in legislation as a criterion for greatness puts presidents like Madison with legislative-centric ideologies at a disadvantage, there are other ways to set policy precedent such as issuing executive orders, making proclamations, or persuading the people to influence their representatives in Congress (Neustadt 1955).
Another criterion for presidential greatness is the state of the nation before and after a president’s term. A great president must be able to manage both big and small issues on a daily basis in order to assure that the business of the nation runs smoothly. For many presidents, luck is a factor. George W. Bush gained a great amount of favor with the American public for his handling of the attacks on September 11, 2001, an event which was both unexpected and out of his control. While many issues may arise daily, a great president must manage those issues so that the nation is more prosperous socially, economically, and politically than the one that was inherited at the start of the term.

Marc Landy and Sidney M. Milkis propose that a great president is one who successfully leads his political party and undertakes a “conservative revolution” in which the Constitution or Declaration of Independence are reinterpreted to encompass a new liberal meaning (2000, 198). While I do not believe that a great president has to necessarily undertake a revolutionary reinterpretation of the Constitution, this theory is indicative of another quality of a great president: the power to appeal to “the better angels of our nature” (Nicolay and Hay 1905, 7). On this topic, Landy and Milkis say that “the president’s task is not only to arouse public opinion but also to lead it toward the type of reform most compatible with fundamental constitutional principles” (2000, 234). In other words, a great president will be someone of great moral and constitutional principle who is able to educate and persuade the American public toward those principles. For example, Abraham Lincoln’s conservative revolution, which ended slavery and was epitomized by the Emancipation Proclamation, gave a new meaning to the most famous words of the Declaration, in which “all Men are created equal.”

According to Samuel Kernell (1997), the aforementioned power to persuade the people (or “going public”) assists presidents during periods of divided government. Because presidents
operate outside of Congress, they frequently feel more able to influence public opinion than congressional opinion. No matter the audience, a great president must be able to achieve responsible policy goals that are often unpopular by using his reputation and powers of persuasion.

A final criterion for presidential greatness which is of particular importance to Madison is the ability of a president to solve his biggest issue (Renshon 1998). It is naive to expect that every great president was always a strong leader who always had the right policy and was all-around perfect. A great president will not necessarily get everything right, but he should at least be able to manage the small issues that come up during the course of his presidency, and conquer the biggest issue outright. Madison’s biggest issue was the conflict with Britain and France and the War of 1812.

In sum, the five qualities I have selected for determining presidential greatness include the ability to obtain the office and establish legitimacy among the political party, the ability to influence legislative policy, the power to persuade Congress and the people to engage in responsible and morally sound policy-making, the ability to successfully navigate every-day issues so that the nation will have improved over the length of the term, and, finally, the ability to conquer the biggest problem the president faced.

*Madison Evaluated: 1809–1815*

**The Election of 1808 and Madison’s Presidential Legitimacy**

As the “father” of the Constitution, the secretary of state to President Jefferson, and the co-founder of the Republican Party, Madison had to do little to establish his claim to the presidency. In fact, Madison’s biggest potential challenger in the election of 1808, Aaron Burr,
had been destroyed politically by his own ambition eight years earlier when he ran against
Jefferson. When the results of that election showed a tie between Burr and Jefferson, Burr broke
his earlier promise to stand aside in the event of a tie, and continued to fight for the office. The
result was a bitter battle between Jefferson and Burr, in which Jefferson’s eventual victory led to
Burr’s loss of status within the Republican Party (Rutland 1990). The defeat of Burr, his
subsequent removal from the vice presidency after four years, and the tradition of the secretary
of state rising to the presidency meant that Madison was the most obvious choice for the
Republican nomination. Congressional Republicans who were disgruntled with Jefferson tried to
keep Madison from getting the nomination, but their choice of James Monroe mustered almost
no strength. The resulting election between Madison and Federalist Charles Pinckney was more
of a slaughter than a battle, as a strongly Republican electorate handed Madison the presidency
(Rutland 1990).

As president, however, Madison’s easy ride to the presidency created problems within
the Republican Party in Congress. A group of anti-Jefferson Republicans in the Senate, known as
the Invincibles, was never satisfied with Madison’s election and feared that he would be a vessel
for a presidency run by Jefferson. The first conflict between Madison and the Invincibles set the
stage for the next six years. This conflict was the appointment of Madison’s most trusted advisor,
Albert Gallatin, to the Cabinet as secretary of state. The Invincibles disliked Gallatin, “who was
far too clever (and foreign-born to boot) to admire their schemes for patronage and power”
(Rutland 1990, 16). Everyone in Washington at that time knew that if Gallatin became secretary
of state he would hold an enormous amount of power in the party and would be in line for the
presidency. However, rather than standing as the figurehead of the Republican Party and battling
the Senate over the nomination, Madison gave in to the Invincibles, placing Gallatin in the
position of secretary of the treasury. In the end, Madison was forced “to pay a high price so that he might begin his presidency in calm waters” (Rutland 1990, 17). This decision would come back to haunt him, as his attempt at moderation resulted in a Cabinet filled with incompetence.

In addition to the creation of a weak Cabinet, the Invincibles held the swing votes on many of Madison’s initiatives during his first six years as president. The Invincibles and their anti-Jefferson allies in Congress would defeat measures such as additional appropriations for the army and navy just before the War of 1812, the foundation of a national bank which would have been used to pay for the same war, and crucial foreign policy legislation (Siemers 2009). While hindsight in policy is 20/20, perhaps if Madison had better established his legitimacy in Congress and in his party, his rate of success in the war and in his presidency would have been higher. Surely Madison is not completely to blame for the opposing factions within the Republican Party; after all, the Invincibles were anti-Jefferson and had written off Madison before he took the oath of office. He did not, however, strengthen his legitimacy as the head of the Republican Party in his first few years as president. His desire to come into office with a clean slate by pandering to the interests of a minority in his party resulted in a weak Cabinet and an opposing faction that was made more powerful by Madison’s willingness to acquiesce.

**Influencing Legislative Policy**

While Madison’s Cabinet and his control over his party were weak, his ability to influence legislation was perhaps worse. At the root of this problem was Madison’s ideal that Congress was the predominant branch in lawmaking and that the president was simply there to carry out the orders of the legislative branch. Madison’s devotion to those principles meant that he would often have to carry out foreign policy legislation that he did not support based on
Article I, Section VIII which gave Congress the power to “regulate Commerce with foreign Nations.” Of course, the Federalists and rival Republicans had no misgivings about forcing Madison into such a foreign policy conundrum. Before the War of 1812, the Federalists and the Invincibles formed a ragtag coalition to defeat Macon’s Bill No. 1, a piece of legislation aimed at reigniting trade with Britain by making transactions using American ships only. This bill would have countered British attacks on American vessels by essentially forcing Britain to choose between impressment and trade. Instead, the coalition created and passed Macon’s Bill No. 2, which allowed either France or Britain the chance to trade with the United States again, so long as they stopped harassing American trade vessels on the Atlantic. Napoleon jumped on the opportunity to draw the United States into conflict with Britain by promising to release the American vessels he had captured, thereby forcing the United States to cease trade with Britain (Rutland 1990; Siemers 2009). Madison was forced by his own convictions to uphold Macon’s Bill No. 2, and he issued a presidential proclamation stating that France had “ceased…to violate the neutral commerce of the United States” and that “all restrictions imposed by [Macon’s Bill No. 2] shall cease and be discontinued in relation to France” (Madison 1810, 1).

This legislation had some negative effects on the United States. First, it raised tensions between Britain and the United States to a whole new level. Britain had clearly been the intended beneficiary of Macon’s Bill No. 2, but Napoleon’s clever maneuvering left the United States and France in a trade alliance that neither of them particularly wanted. Second, the act effectually did nothing to ease the economic strain on American exporters because any ships coming to and from France would be stopped by the Royal Navy, the undisputed power of the seas (Siemers 2009). Finally, to add injury to insult, Napoleon went back on his word to Madison and began to sell the seized American ships docked in French ports, “with the proceeds (estimated at $6
millions) marked for Napoleon’s treasury” (Rutland 1990, 65). In the end, Madison was left with a useless treaty with the French and a foreign crisis on the brink of war with the British.

Could Madison have prevented the end result? Perhaps. His political ideal to remain out of the legislative process during Macon’s Bill No. 1 surely cost the bill votes that were vital to its passage, and his refusal to speak against Macon’s Bill No. 2 surely made its passage inevitable. Aside from his self-imposed limitations, Madison’s idea that only unconstitutional laws should fall under presidential veto meant that he would not even consider vetoing the second bill because above all things, he was a defender of the Constitution (Siemers 2009). Since Congress had the sole power to regulate foreign commerce, Madison continued the precedent and would not interfere with a bill that did not clearly violate the Constitution.

In sum, Madison almost completely removed himself from the legislative process because of both his legislative-centric and Constitutional ideals. He was a failure at influencing legislative policy in his first six years, though not for lack of desire to do so. Restricting his input on both Macon bills was the most noticeable instance of his hands-off approach to lawmaking, and it resulted in a failed policy for which he took much of the blame. His inaction allowed that failed policy to further hurt British-U.S. relations, even though he knew that it was seriously flawed (Siemers 2009).

**Power to Persuade**

Instead of being able to persuade the people of the United States or their representatives in Congress, Madison gave in to the demands of his constituents at large and to the members of Congress. The main instance in which Madison was unable to persuade the public came during the war. After Madison stood by idly while Congress went to war, he was unable to unite the
nation against Britain. The result was a fracture so large that at one point during the war, Britain actually offered the New England states a deal if they would secede from the union. While this fracture was caused more by Federalist dissention than by the president’s actions, Madison was rendered almost helpless in persuading New England to help in the war effort (Rutland 1990). Troop support from those states would have been vital to the attack on Canada and may have led to a quicker and less costly end to the war.

Madison was also unable to persuade the Southern and Western states to stand down on the foreign policy which had led to the war in the first place. As the demand for war increased, Madison was faced with a choice between either sticking to his largely unsuccessful embargo policy or going against his Republican Party ideals and declaring war to protect the sovereignty of the nation. With public pressure mounting, Madison and Congress gave in to hawks from the Western and Southern states just as businesses in Britain were beginning to feel the pinch of the embargo (Rutland 1990). While Madison surely could not have known what was happening across the Atlantic, hindsight indicates that if Madison had been able to convince the public to refrain from war, the embargo policy might have eventually succeeded and war might have been avoided altogether.

Overall, Madison found himself unable to alter public or Congressional opinion. Despite having the masses behind his war effort, his lack of personal control in the face of British insult, coupled with his inability to calm Southern and Western tempers, led to a devastating war that looked bleak in the opening weeks of 1815.

**Improving the Well-being of the Union**
There is little argument that the United States was in peril during the winter of 1814–1815. The government buildings of the capital had been burned to the ground the previous August, a full British blockade had devastated the economic prosperity of 1807, and a foreign army had not only stopped the American attack on Canada but had also crossed into the borders of the nation with little resistance (Rutland 1990). As commander and chief, was it Madison’s fault?

To say that Madison was not a military leader is an understatement. He was surely at least a little familiar with the practices of the American Revolution, but he held the conventional view that war was a gentleman’s game (Rutland 1990; Siemers 2009). He had no experience in leading strategic movements or planning attacks, and he deferred those duties to generals who turned out to be fairly incompetent. As a result, Madison’s constitutional duty as commander in chief was executed poorly and with horrible consequences. As a new nation embarking on its first real war, the United States found out midway through that it lacked the leadership necessary to plan and coordinate a battle. Madison’s generals launched expeditions against British-controlled Canada only to have them fall apart with little or no fighting. The best example is that of General William Hull, who led a force to Fort Detroit in an attempt to defend it against a force of British and Native American soldiers but instead surrendered without any bloodshed (Rutland 1990).

The economic situation of the United States was also much worse in the winter of 1814–1815. “Mr. Madison’s War” had frozen all legal Atlantic trade and had caused a build-up of exports in New England ports that had no potential buyers. The growing American economy, which had reached its peak in 1807 under Jefferson, had become stagnant with no foreign consumers. Furthermore, the political party that Jefferson and Madison had created had become
a highly factionalized entity that gave the president repeated nightmares (Landy and Milkis 2000). His Cabinet had been filled with incompetent men coming and going, and even his trusted advisor Gallatin was in Ghent in 1814–1815 trying to negotiate a peace with Britain that seemed destined to fail. And, of course, there was the possible secession of the New England states, which Britain had been trying to coerce since the start of the blockade (Rutland 1990). Overall, Madison’s nation at the beginning of 1815 was far worse than the one he inherited in March 1809.

Conquering the Major Issue: The War of 1812

The War of 1812 had taken its toll on the United States by the end of 1814. The most humiliating event of the war, the burning of Washington D.C., had just taken place, and the militia that Madison had hoped would defend the nation ended up running in the opposite direction at the first sign of the Redcoats. Peace talks with Britain returned somewhat insulting and less-than-ideal results. As a whole, the nation and its fourth president had been completely unprepared for war, and, with the fall of Napoleon, it looked as though it might cost America dearly when Britain turned its full attention across the Atlantic. The bare-bones government that Madison and Jefferson had created resulted in a nation that was economically strong but militarily incapable of securing those economic gains. In two phases of the war, the events leading up to it and the fighting of the war itself, Madison had failed at both foreseeing and coping with the problems of a new nation. Robert Allen Rutland (1990) sums up the overall failure of the first six years of the Madison administration well: “Madison’s ignorance of military strategy, his total dependence on generals who had not heard a shot fired in anger for over a generation, and his willingness to go along with public opinion rather than shape it all suggest
that Madison had no firm policy that made the war inevitable. Instead, Madison fell into a trap shaped by British inflexibility, pressures from public opinion, and his own gullibility” (110).

_Madison Evaluated: 1815–1817_

Despite the darkness that had overtaken the nation in late 1814, the road ahead was paved with gold. A few strategic American victories in Baltimore and the surrounding areas in early 1815 seemed to convince the British that a war against the United States was going to be both difficult and non-beneficial. Furthermore, British business owners had finally convinced the Parliament that American goods were needed and that trade should be resumed (Rutland 1990).

As the pieces fell apart for the British, they began to fall into place for Madison. The taste of victory near Baltimore and the fall of the British navy on the Great Lakes seemed to leave Americans with a hunger to win the war. Was Madison hiding a secret knack for foreign affairs?

It is hard to find evidence that Madison had any successful policy regarding the end of the war. His plan to starve British businesses by withholding American goods had been a dismal failure in 1807 and 1809. Once the British blockade began, Madison’s Embargo Policy became redundant because the blockade ended any possibility of trade between the two nations. It was at that point that British business owners begged Parliament to end the war and re-establish trade with the United States, and all over Britain the anti-war sentiment grew (Rutland 1990). In essence, the success of the British navy was the cause of Britain’s defeat in 1815, not Madison.

The arrogance of British negotiators at the bargaining tables in Ghent also hurt their own cause. Rather than offering the United States a fair peace, Britain approached the negotiations as a conquering nation making demands of the conquered (Rutland 1990). After the United States had persevered for more than two years, American negotiators would have been foolish to accept
such ridiculous terms. Once the tide of the war began to turn, the British were unwilling to continue without American goods, and they were forced to give in to many demands at the negotiating table. Once again, the British hurt their own cause more than the Americans did.

As the war ended, the political tides within the United States made a sudden shift in Madison’s favor. The news of the positive terms of the peace treaty at Ghent, along with General Andrew Jackson’s historic victory over the British at New Orleans two weeks later had the dual effect of making Madison look like a genius and the New England Federalists look like traitors. Once again, Madison’s opponents had dug their own graves. The result was the end of the Federalists and the ushering in of the Era of Good Feelings, an eight-year span in which the Republican Party was the only political party with power in the nation. Jefferson’s party had ended all parties, at least for the time being.

Madison’s biggest issue had been conquered, though little of it had to do with his actions. In essence, Madison had ridden a wave of faulty policy, poor governmental ideals, and divisive party organization and came out with a lucky victory. Once the war was over, the rest of Madison’s legacy fell into place. The political suicide of the Federalist Party gave him instant legitimacy and influence in Congress, public opinion was behind whatever decision he made, and the day-to-day domestic governing could finally begin, free of the threat of European powers. Most importantly, Madison’s unlikely victory over the greatest navy in the world gave the United States worldwide legitimacy overnight. America was no longer known as a former British colony, but rather as a truly sovereign state that had defeated the most powerful nation in the world. The final christening of the United States as a world power came in Madison’s penultimate State of the Union address, in which he reported that the United States had defeated Algiers, or “someone their own size” (Rutland 1990, 192).
In the last two years of his presidency, Madison built a legacy that survives today. He continued the expansionist tendencies that he had supported in Federalist No. 10 and added to his earlier acquisition of the Louisiana Territory by finally annexing West Florida from Spanish rule and encouraging settlement of the Indiana territory, gained via the Battle of Tippecanoe. He also proposed a project to improve the roads and canals to the West, opening up more land to U.S. citizens (Madison 1815; Rutland 1990). His final State of the Union message addressed the need for a uniform currency, a national bank, an improved judicial system, a reduced army in times of peace, and a strong navy to protect American shipping interests abroad (Madison 1816).

Perhaps the most important contribution Madison made to the foreign policy legacy of the United States was the lesson that he learned during the War of 1812. His experience reminded future presidents about the benefits of being separated from European conflict by the Atlantic Ocean, a benefit first acknowledged by George Washington. In short, so long as American ships could protect their interests at sea, there was no need to get involved in European conflicts. This isolationist ideology kept the United States out of major European wars for almost an entire century.

**Conclusion: Ranking the Madison Presidency**

Judging Madison’s greatness among presidents is unique. It is difficult to find another president who had experienced so much failure followed by so much success. If we base his success off of snapshots of the nation in 1809 and again in 1817, the Madison presidency was without question one of the most important. However, if we examine his entire presidency closely and base his greatness on the five criteria listed earlier, it is difficult to consider him
better than average. His only true success was in his biggest issue, the War of 1812, and even that success came as a result of the perseverance of the American people and not as a result of Madison’s presidential expertise. From this unlikely victory, Madison was handed legitimacy and power within his party, allowing him to better persuade and influence Congress. With the power of Congress behind him, he was able to present a united regime to the people and run the day-to-day functions of government. In the end, Madison satisfied all the requirements for greatness, but in many ways it was in spite of his decisions, not because of them.

I believe that this study has contrasted so greatly with the SRI and Schlesinger polls because it is difficult to give presidents a fair and consistent rating. Although the office of president is the most well-known position in the nation, there are no uniform criteria for judging presidential performance. While some may judge Madison’s presidency as near-great for all that it accomplished, others who closely examine the rationale and background behind each decision, as I have done here, may hesitate to give him such favorable ratings.
Bibliography


Plato, the Other, and the Freedom to Love

Steven Mischler, author
Dr. Larry Herzberg, Philosophy, faculty adviser

Steven Mischler will graduate from UW Oshkosh in May 2011 with a degree in philosophy. His research began as a paper assigned in History of Ancient Philosophy. It was later adapted and submitted to the Wisconsin Philosophical Association where it was part of a series of undergraduate presentations. Steve is a member of the Philosophy Club, and he plans to pursue a Ph.D. in philosophy.

Dr. Larry Herzberg is a professor of philosophy who earned his Ph.D. from UCLA in 2003. Shortly after, began teaching at UW Oshkosh. His research is focused on psychological and epistemological issues relating to emotion.

Abstract

Plato’s Symposium is divided into several speeches; two, by Aristophanes and Socrates, are considered here. These classic views on love extend into the modern era by way of philosophers such as Jean-Paul Sartre and Bertrand Russell. This essay examines their views and argues that modern ideas about love are similar to classic ideas on the topic. The main topics discussed relate to the identity struggle lovers engage in and the way in which love can inspire the intellect.
Love is a gateway to knowledge. This, I believe, is one of the central ideas of Plato’s *Symposium*. Influential philosophers of the twentieth century have reached similar conclusions. For instance, Bertrand Russell holds that love is something that can lead to surges in creativity and works to enhance one’s knowledge. Similarly, Jean-Paul Sartre describes how, in love, the self must cope with the identity of other beings and how these beings can give us insights and knowledge about ourselves. The aim of this essay is to analyze each philosopher’s conception of love and to see how they cohere with one another, showing that ideas about love are reoccurring throughout history.

In Plato’s dialogue, seven prominent citizens of ancient Athens gather together for an evening of festivities. As the night progresses the group decides to eulogize the Greek god of passionate love, Eros. Aristophanes presents a poetically driven speech that employs mythology to articulate his particular view of love. He focuses on an idea of wholeness—that those who are in love sense a longing for their partner (which is also described as a desire to join or merge with their partner). Although Socrates expresses his ideas about love less poetically than Aristophanes, they both agree that love is more than bodily lust. Rather, love expands the possibilities of being human; a lover is capable of doing things that those who are not in love cannot hope to do. I argue below that Russell’s view of love is remarkably similar to Socrates’, and that Sartre’s is also similar to Aristophanes’. In fact, all four treatments of love work together to form a cohesive view.

Aristophanes begins by saying that in order to understand his view, the others in attendance “must first understand human nature and its afflictions.” Love, he explains, began
when three types of human beings existed: a female type, a male type, and a type that contained the essence of both the male and female forms. No matter the gender of these prehistoric humans, their forms were different from the form of the modern human being. These creatures had two of every appendage a contemporary human has—four legs, four arms, two heads, two sets of genitalia, etc. To move they would curl up into a spherical form and roll. This version of the human was considerably powerful and, at one point, attempted to defeat the gods. This, of course, was something the gods would not allow, and Zeus ordered that every human was to be cleaved in half, giving humans their current form.  

In this split form people had feelings of incompleteness. What was once a wholly complete union was merely half that; humans felt a desire to be whole. Aristophanes suggests that eros (the drive) is “inborn” within humans, and that Eros (the god) is the “bringer-together of their [human’s] ancient nature, who tries to make one out of two.” Aristophanes also explains that because humans originally had three forms (male, female, and the combination of the two), complete wholeness presented itself in the same forms: male-male, female-female, and male-female.

The notion of incompleteness and a desire to be whole are relatable to Sartre’s view of the Other (Sartre’s term for other people) and of love. In *Being and Nothingness*, Sartre theorizes about what it means to be a human being, what it means to exist in the presence of other human beings, and what it means to interact with the Other via love. According to Sartre, the self is both a conscious entity and a physical body. Theoretically, the self can exist without ever coming in contact with any other object (be it a person or some other thing). But, in order to adequately conceptualize one’s existence, a being must come in contact with other things. The Other, therefore, is needed to form a conceptualization of what it means to be an individual human,
which Sartre expresses by saying, “I need the Other in order to realize fully all the structures of my being.” Without the Other we are incomplete, just as Aristophanes suggests we are if we cannot find our other half.

Admittedly, there is a slight difference in the ways in which Aristophanes and Sartre address the idea of human incompleteness. Aristophanes (and by extension, Plato) had no conception of the way Sartre would come to define the self, as a product of the beings interacting with it. And, Sartre’s notion of incompleteness is broader than what the quest for love might suggest by itself. But the similarities become more apparent as Sartre begins to focus on what love means for a being.

The being-in-love’s ultimate goal is to completely merge with their lover. The reason for this has to do with the quest for self-identity. As Sartre puts it, “the Other holds a secret—the secret of what I am.” Lovers hold each other’s essences; the secrets of both of their existences are within each other. Recall here that the Other provides a self with the means to conceptualize a human identity. The project of the lover is to possess the lover, to consume the Other into their own being, becoming complete. Thus, when a being loves, it wishes to break the mental and physical barriers between the self and the Other, becoming a singular entity.

This notion is very similar to Aristophanes’. Two humans long for completeness; unfortunately both views conclude that such a unity is impossible. Aristophanes suggests that, given the choice to merge with our true beloved, there is not a person who would refuse; it is our true nature. What keeps us from doing this is our standing with the gods, who fear our wholeness. Aristophanes suggests that if we were ever to reconcile with the gods it may be possible for us to obtain a sense of completeness. He leaves us with the sense that we have the potential to alter the minds of the gods. By contrast, Sartre argues that we could never actually
unite with the Other. If such a process were possible and we were able to merge with the one we loved, we would destroy the individual that resides in each of our bodies. A unity with the Other would result in “the disappearance of otherness in the Other.” If the Other as such cannot exist, then the self has no way in which it can define its own existence. Thus, a negative progression would occur, wherein united lovers (becoming one entity) would hope to define themselves by incorporating more Others into their being until every person had become absorbed. Such a complete merger would leave no Other to provide any sort of meaning for this being’s identity.

Another problem with love, according to Sartre, is that the individual willingly gives tries up his own freedom for the Other. When people enter into love relationships, they objectify themselves. Those seeking love work to make themselves desirable in the eyes of their beloveds—that is, to turn themselves into whatever their beloveds want them to be. Thus, Sartre’s view of love asserts that there is a delicate, perhaps impossible balance to love. On some level, lovers relinquish portions of their freedom as they objectify themselves for their beloveds. However, mere objects cannot provide lovers with what they need from each other; freedom is the essence of being human. So the matter of love boils down to choice, freedom, and responsibility, as it often does for Sartre and his existentialist cohort. To engage in a meaningful relationship, lovers and beloveds must work together to ensure that they maintain their freedom.

Aristophanes suggests that there are three kinds of love one might partake in, all of which are based on gender. As mentioned above, the prehistoric humans that challenged the gods had existed in three distinct genders: male, female, and androgynous. A perfect union for the now-separated humans would imply that one would pair up with a person who came from a similar gendered pre-human (and specifically, the one in which they were cut from). In his own treatment of these genders, Aristophanes, interestingly, seems to use the mythological tale as a
means to critique his culture. Of the three kinds of love, the type in which males have been split from an entirely male entity are clearly Aristophanes’ preference. Aristophanes criticizes the androgynous (male + female) or common type of relationship because it produces many adulterers and adulteresses. However, he describes the behavior of two males loving one another as manly; the males engaged in this kind of love are the manliest. The relationship he is envisioning at this point is between a man and a boy. In a defensive tone, he claims that the manliness of such a relationship is evident given the sort of things the man and the boy become involved in (politics, for example). Aristophanes goes on to say, “When they are fully grown men, they are pederasts and naturally pay no attention to marriage and procreation, but are compelled to do so by the law; whereas they would be content to live unmarried with one another.” On this account, the best possible love is pederasty (a love shared between a young boy and an older man) seemingly because this type of love goes beyond the lust of the body. Aristophanes claims that the soul has a different agenda than the physical body; souls want something different from sexual intercourse, but Aristophanes is unsure of what, exactly, that entails.

It is important to note that part of Aristophanes’ agenda is to promote pederasty as an acceptable practice. Aristophanes envisions the best loving relationship as a mentorship, where a mentor (an older man) engages a student (a young boy) both intellectually and physically. This practice may seem strange or even offensive to the modern reader, most likely due to issues of consent. How can a young boy freely and responsibly consent to being in a loving relationship with an older man? To understand Aristophanes’ view as charitably as possible, we need to stress that at the core of the relationship is intellectual companionship. Two people who are each other’s previously missing halves cultivate their friendship and pursue intellectual growth. If
Aristophanes is not entirely clear about this, the possible relationships between love, sex and intellectual growth are further developed by Socrates and his twentieth century partner, Russell.

Socrates presents his view of love by recollecting various conversations he had with Diotima, a woman of Mantinea, focusing on the nature of Eros, the personification of love. In all of the speeches prior to Socrates’, Eros is considered to be a god and the speakers treat him as such. Socrates rejects his godly status, and this becomes a key part of his view.

According to Socrates, Eros is a being caught between the immortal nature of the gods and the mortal nature of humans. Eros, and by extension, love, is defined as a desire for the good and beautiful. Because Eros desires things that are good and beautiful he cannot be them or have them; gods possess these things, so it is impossible for Eros to be a god if he desires the things that the gods inherently possess. And, because of his parents Poros (the personification of resourcefulness) and Penia (the personification of poverty), Eros is always in flux between poverty and resourcefulness, between godliness and the mortality. According to Diotima and Socrates, the philosopher is also between being completely wise and completely unknowing. In fact, Eros is precisely a philosopher. He desires the beautiful and good; one of the most beautiful things is knowledge, thus Eros desires knowledge. Eros does not have complete knowledge, only a love of knowledge, which is exactly what philosophy is.

The second portion of the speech develops the foundation of this doctrine of the in-between. Humans are lovers in so much as they desire what is good. The gods possess what is good; additionally they are immortal. Diotima makes the connection between the good, the immortal, and the mortal by saying that “the mortal nature seeks as far as possible to be forever immortal.” What Diotima implies as she continues is that because humans desire what is good, they have an inevitable connection with the immortal; it is what they desire because the immortal
possess what is all good. Humans are naturally driven to sexually reproduce because it is beautiful and everlasting in the sense that birth keeps human beings immortal; by creating generations and generations of humans, humans are seemingly immortal. Birth is the means by which humans get a small taste of the good the gods possess.

However, sexual reproduction is not the only way in which mortal humans may reproduce; it is possible for the soul to become pregnant. According to Diotima, “prudence and the rest of virtue” are the appropriate things to conceive and bear. The overall doctrine Diotima preaches at this point is that young men, who harbor undeveloped ideas, should engage in relationships with older men, who are more acquainted with wisdom. This is the “correct practice of pederasty.” This type of relationship fosters a respect for wisdom, which is beautiful. The soul is searching for what is truly good and truly beautiful; wisdom fits these criteria. Thus, it is appropriate and correct for men to engage in a mentor style relationship with young boys. With this relationship, better understanding will be achieved through a sort of cognitive intercourse.

Both Socrates (with Diotima) and Aristophanes assert that the sexual relationship—and the act of reproduction that only men and women can partake in—is less valuable than the kind of love a man and a boy can experience. Both conclude that the desires of the soul outweigh the biological urges of the body. Both also make an appeal to the intellect; Aristophanes suggests that pederasts are successful in politics, and Socrates asserts that only these men are capable of attaining wisdom. It is also within this realm of thought that Russell’s ideas about the social practice of love should come to the forefront of the discussion.

Russell begins by asserting that society places too many limits on sexual behavior. He argues that conventional morality has made sexual freedom a taboo and that several social institutions have perpetuated this taboo so that those who dare to advocate sexual freedom are
publicly chastised. He suggests that “fierce morality is generally a reaction against lustful emotions, and the man who gives expression to it is generally filled with indecent thoughts—thoughts which are rendered indecent, not by the mere fact that they have sexual content, but by the fact that morality has incapacitated the thinker from thinking cleanly and wholesomely on this topic.”

Those who wish to speak on the topic are generally thought of as perverted. Russell finds that it is humanity’s strict morality that is to blame for this view. Morality is also at fault for those who become corrupted by excessive sexual thought. He holds that the church’s way of handling sex, attempting to ban the topic by making it a point of shame, has been a mistake because it makes people wish to avoid sex in all forms. That wish is ill-founded because sex is a natural impulse, which he compares to eating. The person who hoards food experiences symptoms similar to a person who harbors or hoards sexual thoughts; in either case, that person is being denied their natural impulses. To this Russell suggests that “healthy, outward looking men and women are not to be produced by the thwarting of natural impulse, but by the equal and balanced development of all the impulses essential to a happy life.” In other words, Russell prescribes sexual freedom with some limitations. A balance must be achieved so that people are neither denying themselves sexual freedom because of social constraints nor abusing that freedom so that sexual activities and thoughts consume them.

Another point Russell makes is that the underlying idea of sexual freedom is the ability to freely choose a lover. He suggests that free love has benefits for society as a whole; his most concrete example is the artist. Art, for Russell, is a field that is inexorably connected with the freedom to love. He suggests that “societies that have been conventionally virtuous have not produced great art” and suggests that contemporary America is such a place; Americans are
among the most religious or conventionally virtuous of the industrialized nations and, at least during Russell’s lifetime, were importing much of their art. What Russell suggests is that creativity goes hand in hand with being able to love who one chooses. Other fields seem to benefit from it as well, though most not as directly as art. In any case, the main idea is that being able to love frees the mind from perversion and allows it to function better, which coheres well with Socrates’ notion that the intellect functions best in the context of a close mentoring relationship between a man and a boy.

As with Sartre, balance is an issue that concerns Russell. But whereas Sartre is concerned with lovers finding a balance between freedom and objectification, Russell is concerned with lovers finding a balance between freedom and sexual obsession. Too much interference from society will disrupt lovers, but a total disregard for social convention will have a similarly damaging effect. The problem is that an unchecked focus on love, especially of sexual nature, has the potential to similarly crush the intellect. Repression and unchecked obsession are two sides of the same coin. Thus, a lover must neither give in to the kinds of repression society has offered nor let love (or sex) become be all consuming.

Russell, along with Socrates and Aristophanes, stress the intellectual benefits of loving relationships. Russell’s view of sexual freedom suggests that those who love freely would be, undoubtedly, more creative. This, he argues, would be the case if society rethought their moral positions in relation to sex and love. Restriction breeds obsession, and this is detrimental to other modes of thinking. In the absence of a repressive morality, lovers can set out to use their intellect in more meaningful ways. And, just as we see in Aristophanes’ and Socrates’ speeches, liberation of the intellect, rather than physical pleasures, are at the core of Russell’s message. Aristophanes argues that societal conventions like marriage and procreation are ignored by the
best of lovers. For Aristophanes, companionship and intellectual growth are the essential traits of a loving relationship, not sexual pleasures. It is much the same in Socrates’ view. Lovers are focused on that which the soul is seeking—wisdom and beauty. These things are not found in sexual desire, but rather through intellectual channels. The combined efforts of lovers to seek that which is good and beautiful defines what love is for Socrates. In all three accounts, lust takes the back seat to the intellect and is a core concept of love that has stretched through the ages.

All of these philosophers make clear that love is not simply lust and reproduction—it is something greater. Certainly, the drive to procreate must be considered and Plato accounts for it, but he quickly places it below the intellectual aspect of love, as does Russell. And just as Aristophanes views love as a drive to reunite with one’s severed half, Sartre views love as a desire for completion and stable self-identity. If this desire is not futile, the key is for lovers to properly balance freedom and objectification. So the central theme common to all of the philosophers discussed above, is that love can be a beautiful thing if practiced in the best way. It can lead to a life of balance where one’s identity is intact and reinforced through great friendships; with a lover, one can enhance the functionality of the intellect and improve the human condition.
Notes

1. Plato, *Symposium*, 189 D.
2. Ibid., 190 A–E.
3. Ibid., 191 D.
5. Ibid., 475.
6. Ibid., 475–76.
8. Ibid., 193 B.
11. Ibid., 192 A–B.
12. Ibid., 202 D.
13. Socrates is famous for asserting that one can only know that they know nothing. That is that the certainty of our knowledge is highly questionable, despite our readiness to claim certainty. Philosophers, according to Socrates, realize that certainty is hard to attain, thus they are caught between the certain (completely wise) and the uncertain (completely unknowing).
15. Ibid., 207 D.
16. Ibid., 206 C–E.
17. Ibid., 211 B.
20. Ibid., 329.
21. Ibid., 330.

Bibliography


The Massacre at Acre – Mark of a Blood-thirsty King?

Jared Stroik, author
Dr. Kimberly Rivers, History, faculty adviser

Senior Jared Stroik is a history major at UW Oshkosh. His research was conducted for a course on the history of the Crusades in fall 2009. During spring 2010 he was a research assistant for Dr. Kimberly Rivers for her work on the Devotio moderna. Jared is a member of the University Honors Program, and he will graduate in spring 2011.

Dr. Kimberly Rivers is currently associate professor and chair of the Department of History at UW Oshkosh. She received her Ph.D. from the University of Toronto, and her research interests include late-medieval intellectual history, memory, and mnemonics in late-medieval preaching, and religious devotion.

Abstract

The Crusades began in 1095 as an effort to resist the spread of Muslim forces into Asia Minor, present-day Turkey, and to prevent Muslims from moving into Christian Europe. The Third Crusade, during the end of the 12th century, was also known as the Kings’ Crusade because the Christian forces were led by some of the most important and powerful kings of the time. One of these was Richard I, King of England. In 1191, Christian forces successfully took the city of Acre, in present-day northern Israel, after a long siege. Following the siege, however, many unarmed Muslim prisoners were killed. Some modern scholars contend that the massacre of these prisoners was ordered by Richard I as a blood-thirsty and ruthless act. This study draws on primary sources and the analysis of modern scholars to determine the validity of these claims against Richard I. Through a synthesis of primary sources, I argue that the massacre, although unfortunate, was not the act of a blood-thirsty killer, but rather a strategic last resort.
The Christian forces in the Holy Land during the mid- to late-1100s had, for many years, requested assistance to maintain their dwindling and increasingly challenged control in the Holy Land, but no help came.\(^1\) The tenuous rule of Guy of Lusignan, King of Jerusalem, in the mid-1180s, led to further internal conflict. The lack of military support, however, would soon change.

The Third Crusade was called in 1187 by Pope Gregory VIII after the disaster of Hattin earlier that year. At Hattin, Saladin, the now famous Muslim leader and military commander, lured the Christian forces led by King Guy out through the desert and to battle in the area known as the Horns of Hattin. There Saladin surrounded and attacked the Christians and essentially destroyed the Christians’ military forces. According to Thomas Madden, “the Horns of Hattin marked the greatest defeat in crusading history.”\(^2\) Subsequent victories by Saladin led to an almost total reclamation of the Holy Land by the Muslims, including the city of Jerusalem. The news of the defeat was so powerful that Pope Urban II, the leader of the Roman Catholic Church, died of grief on October 20, 1187.\(^3\) His successor, Gregory VIII, issued *Audita tremendi*, a papal bull that created a seven-year-long truce throughout Europe so that the Christians of Europe could focus on contributing to the crusades.\(^4\) The Third Crusade, which was intended to re-conquer the Holy Land from Saladin, was the height of the Crusading Movement. Many important figures took the cross, the donning of a cloth cross on one’s clothing or some other method of signifying that one intended to make the pilgrimage to the Holy Land. A few notable individuals included King William II of Sicily, Holy Roman Emperor Frederick Barbarossa, King Henry II of England, and King Philip II of France. William II, Frederick, and Henry II died, however, before making the pilgrimage to the Holy Land. After Henry II’s death, his son Richard I became king of England.\(^5\)
Richard I of England is one of the most recognizable characters in medieval history. Even today, his life is marked by legend and prestige. Richard I’s reputation as a gallant knight and effective military commander often precedes him, and his exploits in the Holy Land against the great Saladin have essentially solidified his legendary status. During his time in the Holy Land, Richard I’s campaigns against Saladin made the Third Crusade one of the more successful forays by Christians in the Levant, the region around the Holy Land. There is, however, a great cloud that hangs over this legacy. While on crusade, Richard I was accused of a blood-thirsty and heinous act, namely, the massacre of Muslim prisoners after the siege of Acre in 1191. This massacre has been viewed as a malicious act by the generally praiseworthy king.

For modern historians, however, the massacre at Acre does not seem to have had a definitive impact on Richard I’s reputation. Little consideration of the Third Crusade has been made to this point, and no single work exists that is written in study of the Third Crusade. Subsequently, little, if any, consideration of Richard I’s actions at Acre outside a few passing paragraphs or pages has been made. Steven Runciman, in his three-volume *A History of the Crusades*, asserts that it was a cold-blooded act against the roughly 2,700 prisoners that took place after an attempted ransom payment in exchange for the prisoners on August 11, 1191. The number of prisoners is confirmed in the *Itinerarium Peregrinorum et Gesta Regis Ricardi*, an anonymous account of Richard I’s deeds on Crusade. Runciman further explains that the attempted exchange on August 11 did not meet the standards expected by Richard I, and the negotiations soon fell apart. On August 20, Richard I determined that Saladin had not met the terms of the bargain and subsequently ordered the prisoners to be executed.

In contrast, Jonathan Riley-Smith believes that “the negotiations with Saladin broke down when the first installment of the ransom became due,” implying that Saladin had made no
payment. Christopher Tyerman contends that this was indeed an atrocious act but that it was “not uncommon in war.”9 He does allow that this action could have been in response to Saladin’s massacre of the Templars and Hospitallers after Hattin in 1187, but he eventually concludes that Richard I’s actions were “a deliberate act of policy,”10 i.e. that Richard I’s goal was never to take prisoners.

Finally, John Gillingham, arguably the leading scholar on Richard I, states that the massacre at Acre “has been called both barbarous and stupid and has been cited to show that there were no depths to which he could not sink in order to relieve his frustrations.”11 Gillingham places the events at Acre in context with those four years prior at Hattin and ultimately wonders what other recourse Richard I could have taken.12 There are two questions that surround Richard I’s actions at Acre: Did Richard I have justification as a military commander to kill these prisoners? And, depending on the answer to that question, how should the events after the siege of Acre be incorporated and integrated into Richard I’s history and legacy? To answer these questions, a comparison of the sources is necessary.

This examination of the massacre at Acre will draw on five important accounts of the events in the summer of 1191 beginning with the chronicle by Richard of Devizes. Little is known about Richard of Devizes outside the information provided in his chronicle of Richard I. Early in life he was a monk at St. Swithin’s Priory in Winchester and later became a Carthusian of Witham.13 Next I will examine the chronicle by Geoffrey de Vinsauf, who is believed to be an Englishman of Norman descent, living during the time of Richard I and the Third Crusade. He wrote an important eye-witness chronicle “of those furious assaults which the army of Saladin made upon the Christians, and of the firmness with which the lion-hearted Richard I withstood and repulsed them.”14 “The Old French Continuation of William of Tyre, 1184–97” is my third
source. As Peter Edbury explains in his introduction to *The Conquest of Jerusalem and the Third Crusade: Sources in Translation*, William of Tyre’s account ended in 1184, and in the early thirteenth century Tyre’s work was “translated into French, and many of the manuscripts of the French translation have continuations tacked on to the end,”15 of which “The Continuation” is one. The fourth source is a letter from Richard I to Garnier of Rochefort, who was then abbot of Clairvaux. Lastly is the account of Baha ad-Din, a Muslim eye-witness to the Third Crusade. He entered the service of Saladin in 1188 and is best known for his biography of the great Muslim leader.

Before determining why the Muslims were killed or if the killings were justified, a timeline of events must be established. From all the accounts it is clear that the siege of Acre ended through a negotiated surrender. The terms of this surrender were that the Muslim defenders of Acre would be set free if a ransom was paid and the True Cross relic, a piece of what was believed to be the cross upon which Jesus was crucified, returned to the Christians. The sources are unclear as to the extent of Saladin’s involvement in the negotiations. Geoffrey de Vinsauf’s account claims that the negotiations began on the advisement of Saladin,16 whereas “The Continuation of William of Tyre,” Baha ad-Din, Richard I’s letter, and Richard of Devizes say that the negotiations were made in Saladin’s name but that he was unaware of the terms until afterward. “The Continuation,” Richard of Devizes, and Richard I agree that Saladin eventually approved the terms. Conversely, Baha ad-Din tells of Saladin’s unwillingness to agree to the conditions and of his attempt to write to the leaders of the city to disapprove of them, but by that time the Christians had already taken the city’s walls.17 After the peace terms were made, the sources reveal that a date was set for Saladin to pay the ransom and turn over the True Cross.
The sources also show that, once the date came, the ransom was not paid. It is that twist of events which best explains why the prisoners were executed.

Although it is clear that the exchange of prisoners for the ransom was not made, the immediate circumstances are unknown. Richard I’s account merely says that “the time-limit expired, and … the pact which he had agreed was entirely made void.”

“The Continuation” says that “on the day that he [Saladin] had promised he did not come. He sent word requesting another day, saying that he had a good reason why he had been unable to come on the date he had promised. The kings had a great desire to recover the Holy Cross. They took counsel and agreed another day.” After the additional day, the Christians came out in great anticipation of regaining the True Cross but were once again disappointed when “[Saladin] withdrew and reneged on the agreement and the promise that he had made.”

According to Geoffrey de Vinsauf, Saladin not only failed to provide the True Cross, he “sent constant presents and messengers to King Richard I to gain delay by artful and deceptive words.”

Richard of Devizes states that “the heathen could by no entreaty be moved to restore the Holy Cross.” The most important account, however, with regard to the payment of the ransom and fulfillment of the terms of surrender, is that of Baha ad-Din.

In his account, Baha ad-Din explains how, after the Christians moved into the city, Saladin ordered maneuvers to draw the Christians out to attack him with the hope of gaining a more favorable position. It is crucial to note that these movements came after the terms of the treaty had been negotiated, and, according to Baha ad-Din, it was these delays that caused Richard I to “[break] his word to the Muslim prisoners.” From the sources, several details are clear. First, there was a treaty made for the exchange of Muslim prisoners for ransom to be paid to the Christians. Second, the deadline established for payment was not met due to Saladin’s
delays. The sources agree that the missed deadline was the justification used for the execution of prisoners.

The next factor in the sequence of events sheds light on the overall character of Richard I—how soon after the deadline was missed were the prisoners executed? Unfortunately, the sources present great ambiguity. Richard of Devizes, Geoffrey de Vinsauf, “The Continuation,” and the letter of Richard I are all unclear in their presentation of when it was determined that Saladin was not going to pay and when the execution occurred. According to Baha-ad-Din, the date of the execution was August 20. The only date given prior to this is July 14, after Saladin’s delaying maneuvers. If it is correct that these delays were the ones that caused the execution of the Muslims, the gap of time is roughly a month. The *Itinerarium Peregrinorum* reconfirms the month-long gap of time and states that “as the time limit had expired long before, King Richard was certain that Saladin had hardened his heart and had no concern about ransoming the hostages.” Overall, it is not clear how quickly the decision to execute the prisoners was made after it was determined that the terms of the ransom would not be met. Frankly, once it became evident to the Christians that the terms would not be met, the time between became irrelevant.

This irrelevancy came from a general standpoint of military strategy. Once it was clear that the payment was not to be received, the Christian leaders, including Richard I, needed to determine how to proceed in order to continue on their campaign. According to J. O. Prestwich, Richard I, although often reckless, was highly adept at medieval military strategy. Because he was such a military expert, Richard I would, without a doubt, have known that staying indefinitely at Acre to wait for the True Cross and ransom would be wasteful. This sentiment is even offered by Baha-ad-Din, who says that, “many reasons were given to explain the slaughter. One was that they [the Christians] had killed them [the prisoners] as a reprisal for their own
prisoners killed before then by the Muslims. Another was that the King of England had decided to march on Ascalon and take it, and he did not want to leave behind him in the city a large number (of enemy soldiers). God knows best.”

Although it may have been a terrible experience to see comrades killed, Baha ad-Din understands that sound military strategy would not have left thousands of enemies at Acre. Overall, Richard I would have had, at best, four other options: (1) leave the prisoners at Acre and men to guard them; (2) wait for Saladin to pay the ransom; (3) take the prisoners with him on the march south; or (4) sell the prisoners into slavery. The first scenario could be ruled out because leaving men behind to guard prisoners would put the army at a disadvantage on an offensive campaign. The second, it soon became clear, would not happen. The third would also put the army at a disadvantage having to feed several thousand more people. The fourth option would have been possible, and probably acceptable, but in all likelihood would have taken more time than the Christian forces were willing to spare.

Ultimately, when it became clear that the True Cross and ransoms were not forthcoming, Richard I was forced to make a military decision.

One important, final point must be made. Two of the sources raise the question of whether or not Richard I was in fact the one who ordered the execution. In his letter to the abbot of Clairvaux, Richard I states that “as the pact which he [Saladin] had agreed was entirely made void, we quite properly had the Saracens that we had in custody…put to death.” Arguably, this “we” could merely be the proverbial “royal we.” Interestingly enough the account of Geoffrey de Vinsauf, which is, as previously noted, an eye-witness account of the actions of Richard I, states that Richard I “called together a council of the chiefs of the people, by whom it was resolved that the hostages should all be hanged, except a few nobles of the higher classes.”

Although the other accounts do not mention this council, it must be taken into consideration that
none of the other accounts were written by eye-witnesses. The only exception is the account of Baha ad-Din, and he would clearly not have been present at a council on the execution of Muslim prisoners.

Overall, the two accounts that stand out as the most accurate portrayals of Richard I’s actions after Acre are those of Geoffrey de Vinsauf and Baha ad-Din. Geoffrey de Vinsauf’s appeal comes not only from being an eye-witness account, but most of the events portrayed match those written by Baha ad-Din, the other eye-witness. Baha ad-Din’s appeal lies in his ability to understand the enemy’s view, no matter how much he disliked it. Additionally, be it intentional or not, Baha ad-Din’s account of Saladin’s delay places blame onto Saladin for the execution of prisoners, which an acutely biased author would have avoided. Conversely, “The Continuation” cannot be seen as an entirely reliable source because it was not written during the time the events were occurring but many years later. Additionally, Richard I’s mention of the massacre at Acre cannot be trusted outright either because, although it may be the most intimate window into the thoughts of the king, it is also the easiest way for Richard I to have included any biases he may have had, or to present himself in a better light. Ultimately, the fact that the two eye-witness accounts have various similarities and that one of the accounts is from an enemy’s chronicle suggest that Baha ad-Din’s and Geoffrey de Vinsauf’s accounts are most trustworthy and accurate.

In regard to Richard I’s reputation, it cannot be said that this was a blood-thirsty act or that this was a deliberate act of policy. It is very likely that, had Saladin paid the ransom and returned the True Cross, the prisoners would have been exchanged. The sources make clear that the Christian forces eagerly anticipated the ransom—and especially the return of the True Cross—and allowed Saladin to delay several times before taking action. Although there was
likely an emotional motivation behind the massacre, it cannot be said that the decision to execute the prisoners was any more than a last resort and strategic decision.
Notes

2. Ibid., 76.
3. Ibid., 79.
4. Ibid., 79.
5. Ibid., 79–85.
10. Ibid., 456–57.
12. Ibid., 184.
20. Ibid., 107.
27. Baha ad-Din, “Massacre of the Muslim Prisoners,” 224.
Bibliography


Human Rights as Presidential Success: The Truman Era

Hope Schuhart, author
Dr. David J. Siemers, Political Science, faculty adviser

Hope Schuhart will graduate from UW Oshkosh in May 2011 with a degree in political science.

Dr. David J. Siemers is a professor in the Department of Political Science. He received his Ph.D. from UW Madison and has taught at UW Oshkosh since 2001. Siemers’ most recent book is Presidents and Political Thought, published by the University of Missouri Press.

Abstract

Political success has traditionally been defined in terms of glory in battle and control over access to resources. This definition continues to be reflected in modern rankings of American presidents, which often measure executive success by personality traits, partisan influence, and attempts at increasing power while in office. However, the core purpose of American government, as stated in the Constitution and Declaration of Independence, is to safeguard the human rights of American citizens and protect them from rights abuses. It follows that as the official defender of the Constitution, a president’s human rights record should be the standard and primary criterion for measuring executive “greatness” or success. Because other evaluations have thus far neglected to employ such a criterion, this paper uses Harry Truman, who was president at the time of the United States’ ratification of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, as a beginning example of evaluating presidential greatness based on contributions to human rights.
Introduction

Throughout human history, political leaders have striven to achieve glory and greatness by leading armies into battle, conquering vast tracts of land through violence, subjugating and enslaving the people who lived there, usurping other leaders, looting the coffers, and monopolizing resources to maintain control. After being subjected to unwarranted searches and seizures and being denied fair trials by the British, political figures in colonial America created a list of human rights and defined them as inalienable. These leaders then placed their new government under the law in case it tried to take those rights away. The result was a constitution which, despite certain flaws, gave citizens fundamental assurance of the prevention of human rights abuses. Consequently, when a president of the United States, upon their inauguration into the executive office, takes the oath to preserve, protect, and defend the Constitution, they are vowing to protect human rights. The president’s activities—such as proposing legislation to Congress, commanding the military, and nominating officials to federal positions—must therefore be evaluated in terms of this humanistic model. The president has a legal duty to protect the human rights of Americans and, as the figure who makes treaties and manages international affairs, a moral duty to use their relationships with foreign diplomats to encourage the protection of people’s rights around the world.

Despite the enormous amount of literature on the presidency, little has been written about human rights as a particular measure of executive performance. Related works describe presidential involvement in the Civil Rights movement of the 1960s, while others detail Jimmy Carter’s policies or the fate of civil liberties in the aftermath of the attacks of September 11, 2001. But comparative studies of presidential performance seem to ignore human rights as central to “greatness,” preferring instead to measure strategy, power expansion, and personality. In the revised edition of Presidential Power and the Modern Presidents, Richard Neustadt wrote that an executive needs four main things for success: a historically relevant purpose, an understanding of power, the ability to withstand pressure, and a lasting legacy within policies and party (1991, 167). Marc Landy and Sidney M. Milkis echoed similar
sentiments in their book *Presidential Greatness* (2000). They defined presidential success as bringing about bold regime change, leaving behind a legacy, revolutionizing a political party, and bearing “a large share of responsibility for the public’s civic education” (3–4). They selected five presidents (Washington, Jefferson, Jackson, Lincoln, and Franklin Roosevelt) who “have already been deemed worthy of such enduring respect and reverence” by the American people and “hope to find some common thread” (2) among them. Clinton Rossiter claimed in his book *The American Presidency* (1956) that greatness is measured by activity and initiative during crises as well as a taste for using power, while Charles F. Faber and Richard B. Faber in their work *The American Presidents Ranked by Performance* (2000) returned to traditional measures of success: administrative accomplishments and personal qualities.

The criteria used by previous scholars are undoubtedly important considerations, but none address human rights as any kind of measure at all. This oversight could be compared to analyzing an employee’s adherence to their job description without assessing their contribution to the company’s underlying purpose, its *raison d’être*. If human rights protections are the core purpose of American government, as stated in the Constitution and the Declaration of Independence, it seems a president’s human rights record should be the primary consideration when determining their success in office. But mysteriously, this is not the case.

Numerous quantitative studies and polls on the topic have made the same error. The first landmark study to do so occurred in 1948 and was repeated in 1962, when Arthur M. Schlesinger Sr. distributed surveys to professional historians asking them to rank presidents according to their performance in office. The process was reproduced by his son Arthur M. Schlesinger Jr. in 1996, and similar surveys of experts were conducted by Gary M. Maranell in 1968, David L. Porter in 1981, Steve Neal in 1982, Robert K. Murray, and Tim H. Blessing in 1982, William J. Ridings Jr. and Stuart B. McIver in 1989, and the Siena Research Institute in 1982, 1990, 1994, 2002, and 2010. Some polls did not use specific criteria to measure performance and relied only on the overall opinion of historians
and political scientists, while others used categories such as charisma, intelligence, decisiveness, and administrative achievements. Like the qualitative studies, the polls excluded human rights as a specific marker of success. The pattern in previous literature is a repetitive review of presidents’ personal glories, political maneuverings, and attempts at increasing executive power. They have so far ignored the bedrock of modern democratic leadership—human rights.

One can only guess as to why human rights is not a standard measure of “greatness” or success in the history of the American presidency. Perhaps the concept of human rights is considered naïve and too idealistic. If that is the reason, it is certainly not a valid one. Principles, though one may never meet them perfectly at all times, still serve as a moral North Star to keep one on course and are still legitimate even when violated. Or perhaps human rights is not on the scoreboard because it seems too faddish, too abstract or vague. That too is a weak argument. The United States is a signatory to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), which spells out in no less than 30 articles exactly what human rights entail, and the content of the document is as relevant now as it was in 1948. The point of this paper, then, is to make the case for adding human rights as a standard measure of presidential effectiveness, as a screen from which to filter the behavior of our presidents. The focus will be on the major activities of Harry Truman, who was president at the time of the American ratification of the UDHR.

*New in the History of Nations*

One of Harry Truman’s most significant human rights successes was the implementation of the Marshall Plan. In the spring of 1945, the United States was working with other Allied forces to determine the next steps for Germany, which had not only twice disrupted all of Europe with its practice of traditional methods of conquering but also had organized and implemented an unprecedented system of human rights abuses. While Truman believed that the German military should be dismantled and its industry tightly controlled, he also believed, on the advice of Secretary of War
Henry Stimson, that punishing Germans to the point of starvation and deprivation would do little but redirect them into a “non-democratic and necessarily predatory habit of life” (Truman 1955, 236–7).

By the summer of 1947, under Joint Chief of Staff Directive 1779, American forces permitted German civilians a standard of living similar to the rest of Europe. Additionally, in June of that year, Secretary of State George Marshall said in a speech at Harvard that American foreign policy “is directed not against any country or doctrine but against hunger, poverty, desperation and chaos. Its purpose should be the revival of a working economy in the world so as to permit the emergence of political and social conditions in which free institutions can exist” (Marshall 1947, par. 7). Truman stated that he and Marshall “were in perfect agreement” and immediately made Marshall’s plan part of his legislative agenda (Truman 1956, 113). Congress passed the European Recovery Act in the spring of 1948, and it continued as planned until 1952. As Truman explained in his memoir Years of Trial and Hope:

> We set up the means to feed and clothe and take care of the physical needs of the people. We rehabilitated the conquered nations instead of attempting to keep them conquered and prostrate. We asked for no reparations. This was something new in the history of nations. The traditional practice had always been for the conqueror to strip the defeated countries and to make off with whatever spoils were available. Our idea has been to restore the conquered nations of Germany, Italy, and Japan to prosperity in the hope that they would understand the futility of aggression as a means of expansion and progress. We had to refute the historic claim that a nation must use aggression and military means to gain markets. . . . No neighbor of ours is afraid of us, and they like to do business with us because we accept their competition instead of demand their subjection. (1956, 238)

This humanistic, cooperative approach gained momentum when the United Nations conference met in San Francisco on April 25, 1945, as Franklin D. Roosevelt had planned before his death. Its Charter was officially ratified that October, and, in his first speech before Congress, Truman summarized the mission of the United Nations, stating, “While these great states have a special responsibility to enforce the peace, their responsibility is based upon the obligations resting upon all states, large and small, not to use force in international relations except in the defense of law. The responsibility of the great states is to serve and not to dominate the world” (Truman 1945, par. 42).

Truman’s use of the atom bombs in Japan may seem completely contradictory to his calls for
global service and responsibility. Their detonation on civilian targets may seem like the worst violation of human rights possible. However, the war itself was perpetuating rights abuses in addition to draining precious resources for all countries involved. Truman was facing immense domestic pressure to end the fighting immediately, but that required even more destruction. If the president continued using traditional firepower on Japan, the fighting may have dragged on for many more months or even years, costing billions more in taxes and causing innumerable deaths on both sides. Russian troops were anticipated to have been advancing into Japan to assist Allied forces, but again, a traditional invasion would likely have extended the war. Indeed, there seemed to be no right answer, no conceivable way to humanely end the war, but, of all the options, quickly seemed the least cruel. And in order to end the war for good, Truman insisted on total and unconditional Japanese surrender but explained, “unconditional surrender does not mean extermination or enslavement of the Japanese people” (McCoy 1984, 22). After the bombing, Japan saw complete demilitarization but increased voting rights and other civil protections set down by occupying American forces; the restructuring of the Japanese economic and legal system paved the way for the island nation to adopt modern human rights practices.

In January 1949, Truman outlined humanitarian policies for the rest of the world as well. He created the Point IV program, which transported sanitation and food production technologies to “backward” areas that had long suffered under the “curse of colonialism,” a travesty that Truman had “always hoped to see . . . disappear” (Truman 1956, 232). The plan received its name from the fourth of four legislative requests Truman had outlined in his inaugural address, and when asked by the press to explain his idea in January 1949, the president explained that he did not know the details yet but that he had spent much of his time “going over to that globe back there, trying to figure out ways to make peace in the world” (231). To sort out the details, that year he gathered officials to begin planning the program’s proposal, which was approved by Congress in October 1950. Because the program focused on technological training to “any country that wanted it” (239), Truman touted Point IV as having “nothing in common with either the old imperialism of the last century or the new imperialism of the
Communists” (234). By 1951, the program was underway in 33 countries, and it provided the inspiration to newly elected Senator John F. Kennedy, who would later use the program’s concepts for his Peace Corps (McCoy 1984, 210).

**Containment**

Truman’s containment policies were mostly out of line with human rights principles, with a few small exceptions. By 1946 the United States had already developed a mistrust of Russia, which was intensified by American Ambassador to the Soviet Union George Kennan’s now-famous “Long Telegram,” sent to Truman that same year. The telegram described Russian authorities as understanding force better than logic and calling Communism “a malignant parasite which feeds only on diseased tissue” (Kennan 1946, 19). Truman also increasingly believed that Communism was contrary to human rights, condemning it as “slavery” and “a false philosophy” that “purports to offer freedom, security, and greater opportunity to mankind. Misled by this philosophy, many peoples have sacrificed their liberties only to learn to their sorrow that deceit and mockery, poverty and tyranny, are their reward” (Truman 1949, par. 11). These beliefs formed the foundation of his war policy. In 1950, Truman approved National Security Council Report 68, which called for a militaristic containment of Communism. This report would serve as a manual for U. S. foreign relations until it was declassified in 1975.

In 1949, after trumping the Soviet blockade in Germany with the Berlin Airlift and sending economic assistance to Greece and Turkey to quell Communist rebellions there, the United States entered into the North Atlantic Treaty Organization, a military alliance with 11 other countries, to fortify their resistance to Communist aggression. When news broke that the relatively large North Korean army, backed by the Soviet Union and newly Communist China, had invaded United States–supported South Korea in 1950, the Soviet Union had already obtained and tested nuclear weapons of its own. Truman responded quickly, but, to calm fears of nuclear warfare, he told Americans “we are
not at war” and privately stated “I do not want any implication . . . that we are going to war with Russia at this time” (Hess 2001, 27–8). He described the army-to-army battles in Korea as a “police action” and referred to the North Korean army, which was well over twice the size of the South Korean army, as “bandits” who were on a “raid” (27). Truman had been advised that Congressional approval was unnecessary because of the initially widespread public and bipartisan support for the war and so never requested such approval at all (31–6). Instead, the conflict seemed the perfect opportunity for the West to show a united front against Communism. Truman therefore relied on approval from the United Nations, so the conflict came to be viewed more as a United Nations war than an American one. This and other aspects of the conflict were murky and strange—was the United States really at war or not? What was the objective of the counter-offensive? What role was the United Nations supposed to be playing, exactly? And was the conflict causing a state of domestic emergency?

Unfortunately, murky areas are often where human rights are violated, where principles are fudged to achieve a different goal. When private steel mill strikes interfered with domestic prices and military equipment production, Truman ordered the mills to be seized. But unlike his abuse of war powers, the seizures were laid before the Supreme Court in the Youngstown Sheet and Tube Company v. Sawyer case and declared unconstitutional. Truman ordered that the mills be returned but threatened to use the Selective Service Act to draft the workers who continued to strike. This was a damaging move for a democrat who had claimed to be pro-labor and not consistent with human rights ideals about fair labor practices.

Truman permitted other rights abuses on American soil as well. The constant rhetoric over containment created a ripe environment for politicians like Joseph McCarthy and Richard Nixon to use fear and suspicion to advance their own careers. Truman had detested both men but did not publicly speak against them so as not to appear “soft” on Communism. Instead, he allowed Nixon, McCarthy, and others to perpetuate the hysteria, which led many innocent people to be ostracized, blacklisted, and fired from their jobs. In 1947, the president even signed Executive Order 9835, which created the
Federal Employees Loyalty Program to investigate and fire hundreds of people for perceived Communist activity. This violated many employees’ civil liberties and was clearly against human rights principles of protection from preemptive persecution and unwarranted searches. And while Truman did not allow the House Un-American Activities Committee to force loyalty oaths on its members, he only later condemned McCarthy as a sensationalist demagogue (Truman 1956, 284). In this case, he submitted to public frenzy instead of attempting to tame it, as the framers of the Constitution had recommended.

The Middle East

Unlike Truman’s use of the atom bombs, his recognition of Israel first appears to be a major human rights success, but, upon further inspection, the issue is similarly complex and controversial. In 1945, the British had reneged on their Balfour Declaration promise of granting entrance into Palestine to Jewish concentration camp survivors, so 100,000 Jews remained globally homeless, waiting in squalid refugee camps while most Western countries, including the United States, claimed to have reached their Jewish immigrant quotas. Truman, however, wrote in his first memoir, *Year of Decisions*, “It was my feeling that it would be possible for us to watch out for the long-range interests of our country while at the same time helping these unfortunate victims of persecution to find a home” (1955, 69).

The president began the diplomatic process by meeting and corresponding with the British many times in an attempt to work out an agreement for Palestine. An Anglo-American Committee of Inquiry, composed of six British and six American scholars and statesmen, examined policies and conducted interviews in the United States, Great Britain, Egypt, Austria, and Palestine to fully investigate the issue. Their report recommended that Palestine become neither an Arab state nor a Jewish one but a neutral, internationally protected area, a safe haven for all peoples. They wrote, “We, therefore, emphatically declare that Palestine is a Holy Land, sacred to Christian, to Jew and to Moslem
alike; and because it is a Holy Land, Palestine is not, and can never become, a land which any race or religion can justly claim as its very own” (Anglo-American Committee of Inquiry 1946, chap. 1). The Committee predicted that conflict would result if a non-neutral state was attempted, saying, “We have reached the conclusion that the hostility between Jews and Arabs and, in particular, the determination of each to achieve domination, if necessary by violence, make it almost certain that, now and for some time to come, any attempt to establish either an independent Palestinian State or independent Palestinian States would result in civil strife such as might threaten the peace of the world” (Anglo-American Committee of Inquiry 1946, chap. 1). Truman believed the report was “fair” (Beschloss 2007, 201) but noted that the Joint Chiefs of Staff were against a Jewish state because they “were primarily concerned about Middle East oil and in long-range terms about the danger that the Arabs, antagonized by Western action in Palestine, would make common cause with Russia” (Truman 1956, 149).

The issue had also been turned over to the United Nations Special Committee on Palestine, which recommended a partition plan of a half-Arab, half-Jewish Palestine, with Jerusalem as an international city. Jews had mixed feelings about this proposal while the Arabs completely opposed it. Truman “instructed the State Department to support the partition plan” believing that “a great industrial system could be set up under the Jews, and the productive potential of this region could be used to the mutual benefit of the Jews and Arabs” (1956, 155–6).

The president was also swarmed with public pleas to support a Jewish state; he received thousands of letters, telegrams, and phone calls from Zionist constituents and transnationals insisting that he was anti-Semitic for any considerations he gave to the Arabs. Truman had been notified that the Negev Desert in southern Palestine was specially important for nomadic Arab Bedouin tribes who had used the area for centuries for seasonal grazing and subsistence (Beschloss 2007, 214), so he initially resisted public pressures but eventually submitted to them. George Marshall accused the president of meddling with the Middle East merely to gain the Jewish American vote (198). On May 14, 1948,
Britain pulled out of the Palestine. The new country would be called Israel, and Truman gave it de facto recognition within minutes of the change. Later he would add de jure recognition.

Although Truman cannot be held entirely responsible for the decades of violent fallout from the establishment of a Jewish state (he had warned Israel that the United States would not give monetary or military support at that time), he planted a seed of relations with Israel against the recommendations of all his advisers and all the people who had investigated the situation in depth. He had been advised that a Jewish state would lead to further conflict and thus further human rights violations, but he dismissed this advice as well as alternative solutions to the problem. As the Committee pointed out, he could have supported a neutral (non-Arab, non-Jewish) state while pushing for higher immigration quotas in the United States. If Congress had refused, then Truman could have, as Eleanor Roosevelt suggested, negotiated to help settle them in “one of the Allied nations that won the war” (Beschloss 2007, 200). The Jewish people certainly deserved special protection from further abuses, but the formation and recognition of Israel was not the recommended alternative, and human rights abuses continue to plague the area. Despite decades of assistance from some of the world’s richest countries, Israel is still under frequent attack from their Arab neighbors and are sometimes even aggressors of such attacks. The tragic irony is that in an attempt to resolve a particular human rights situation, Truman perpetuated the trade of one set of rights violations for another.

**Domestic Agenda**

On the domestic front, Truman had more solid ideas for human rights-centric proposals but was unable to pass many of them through Congress. As a New Deal Democrat, the president made numerous legislative recommendations that promised all Americans a “Fair Deal.” However, the Republican 80th Congress was simultaneously trying to disassemble Roosevelt’s New Deal. Truman despised these Congress members, claiming that “The real threat of Communism in this country grows out of the submission of the Republican policies of the 80th Congress—policies which threaten to put
an end to American prosperity” (Wallace 2004, 306). After the Wagner-Murray-Dingell Bill for national health care was rejected by Congress, Truman proposed his own plan for a public health insurance option, which he stressed was nothing like “socialized medicine,” a term “some people were bandying about” (Truman 1956, 19). He called the general sickness of the American population the “blot” and “disgrace for the greatest republic in the history of the world; first in everything but the basic responsibility of making healthful individuals” (18). In 1952, the President’s Commission on the Health Needs of the Nation reported that more money was spent on tombstones and monuments than on medical research in the United States each year, but these and other findings did not influence the 80th Congress as much as the intense lobbying by the American Medical Association. During this time, other Western countries like Great Britain and France were adopting national health care or similar insurance programs and even beginning to establish norms of health as a human rights issue and not a luxury while the United States remained under the thumb of medical lobbyists. Truman concluded, “Democracy thrives on debate and political differences. But I had no patience with the reactionary selfish people and politicians who fought year after year every proposal we made to improve the people’s health. I have had some bitter disappointments as President, but the one that has troubled me most, in a personal way, has been the failure to defeat the organized opposition to a national compulsory health-insurance program. But this opposition has only delayed and cannot stop the adoption of an indispensable federal health-insurance plan” (Truman 1956, 23).

In fairness, some legislative failures were due to the Treasury’s depletion by the Korean Conflict, but Truman did have some success with other rights-related legislation, such as the Fair Labor Standards Act Amendment of 1949, which increased the minimum wage; the Housing Act of 1949; and the Social Security Act of 1950. Additionally, he was able to increase military capabilities while decreasing spending with the National Security Act of 1947, which also created the Air Force, CIA, and other departments (McCoy 1984, 116).

Truman’s greatest contribution to human rights were his initiatives towards racial equality. A
veteran himself, Truman had a deep respect for all Americans who had served in the armed forces (Gardner 2002, 21–2). He was particularly repulsed to discover that African American veterans of World War II, who had fought alongside whites in defeating the racism and human rights abuses of the Axis powers, were welcomed home with savage beatings and even lynchings by racist white mobs who almost always went unpunished. The discord between American principles and practices, then, became painfully obvious as the United States attempted to endorse justice and equality worldwide while millions of its own people were being, and had been for centuries, systematically oppressed, harassed, beaten, tortured, and terrorized.

Truman had first pledged to work for the end of racial violence when he ran as a senator in 1940, but at the end of World War II, with a long, complicated list of urgent domestic and international concerns, mainstream American society was hardly concerned with civil rights. In fact, 82 percent of Americans in a nationwide Gallup poll said they were against civil rights reform (Gardner 2002, 106). Despite a lack of support, on December 5, 1946, Truman issued Executive Order 9808, which created the first Presidential Civil Rights Committee to obtain a full factual picture of the state of racial affairs in the United States. Their report, submitted several months later, detailed the extensive inequalities and miserable treatment of blacks in all aspects of American life. In response, Southern members of Congress threatened to withdraw support for Truman’s international programs if he did not back down from civil rights. Truman refused. In a letter to a friend, the president wrote, “I can’t approve of such goings on [segregation and racist violence] and I shall never approve of it, as long as I am here, as I told you before. I am going to try to remedy it and if that ends up in my failure to be reelected, that failure will be for a good cause” (131).

On June 20, 1947, Truman became the first sitting president to address the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP). In his speech, he explained, “We must make the Federal Government a friendly, vigilant defender of the rights and equalities of all Americans. And again I mean all Americans. . . . We cannot wait another decade or another generation to remedy these
evils” (Truman 1947, par. 15). In his special address to Congress on February 2, 1948, Truman made numerous recommendations to enforce civil rights laws that already existed and to create new legislation for the creation of permanent civil rights committees and their extension into U. S.
territories and possessions. On July 26, 1948, Truman signed Executive Orders 9980 and 9981, which desegregated the federal workplace and the military, respectively. Prior to Executive Order 9981, black troops were assigned to the dirtiest, lowest-paying jobs in the military, most often cleaning and food service. After the orders went into effect, African Americans were granted access to higher positions. This allowed them some degree of economic advancement and stability, which then enabled a growing black middle class to be instrumental in the larger civil rights movements of the 1960s. Executive Order 9981 also created the President’s Committee on Equality of Treatment and Opportunity in the Armed Services to investigate the effects of the Order. Additionally, Executive Orders 10210 and 10308 of 1951 prohibited military contractors and vendors from discriminating based on race, color, creed, or national origin.

By using his presidential power to enforce civil rights, Truman set up the American legal system to accept full protections of human rights. And unlike his successors Lyndon B. Johnson and John F. Kennedy, Truman did not wait for public pressure to do so. NAACP administrator Roy Wilkins wrote to Truman:

> We have had in the White House great men—great diplomats, great politicians, great scholars, great humanitarians, great administrators. Some of these have recognized inequality as undesirable, as being at variance with the democratic principles of our country; but none has had the courage, either personal or political, to speak out or act in the Truman manner . . . As you leave the White House you carry with you the gratitude and affectionate regard of millions of your Negro fellow citizens who in less than a decade of your leadership, inspiration and determination, have seen the old order change right before their eyes. (Gardner 2002, 223)

The National Association of Human Rights Workers agreed. For Truman’s civil rights work, in 1972 they granted him an award with the inscription, “In tribute to President Harry S. Truman who turned the nation’s conscience to the task of making equality a reality. Nothing he did aroused more
controversy or did him greater honor” (228). Retired Supreme Court Justice Tom Clark, who accepted
the award in Truman’s place (the president was in ill health and near the end of his life at that time),
said the Human Rights Association “regarded Harry Truman as the greatest president since Abraham
Lincoln that this country has ever had” (228).

The TNT that Truman had implanted into the folds of segregation were indeed exciting, but he
also had some significant missteps in regards to human rights. Previous scholarly assessments have
often rated Truman near the top 10 “greatest” presidents because of his decisiveness and his “glories”
with political maneuverings like the Berlin Airlift. But if he were to be judged on his human rights
record alone, he would still do fairly well because of his implementation of the Marshall Plan, his Civil
Rights initiatives, his health care proposals, and his Point IV program. If one were to systematically
apply the human rights filter to all previous presidents, many of them would have similarly mixed
records, others would emerge as surprise winners, and others may slip a notch or two in their rankings.
We already know that Franklin Roosevelt’s record was sullied by his internment of Japanese
Americans, that Woodrow Wilson’s international peace efforts were blotted by his promotion of
segregationist policies within the federal government, that Washington and Jefferson were slave owners
until their deaths, and that Jackson was responsible for the forced dislocation of thousands of Native
Americans. But if we were to judge our heroes in a more detailed way using the human rights
measurement, other deeds towards humanity, both appalling and admirable, would likely emerge in
importance and push traditionally valued traits like “charisma” into the shadows. If the rights category
were to become popular in polls and surveys, it could possibly influence future presidents (who are no
doubt conscious of how they will be recorded into the history books) to consider human rights as a
distinct and common section of their policy agenda. In the opposite case, continued neglect of a human
rights measurement both by academics and the general public would be not only a deep insult to our
humanity but would also run the risk of discarding the fundamental principles that have made the
United States truly glorious and great.
Bibliography


1955.


The Benefits and Limitations of Pet Therapy for People with Dementia

Audrey Cowling, author
Dr. Susan McFadden, Psychology, faculty adviser

Audrey Cowling is a senior at UW Oshkosh majoring in psychology and Spanish. Her research on animal-assisted therapy was completed as part of an honors seminar class on dementia taught by Dr. Susan McFadden. Audrey will be graduating in May 2011, and she plans to attend graduate school in the field of counseling.

Dr. Susan McFadden received her Ph.D. from Drew University (Madison, NJ) and has taught at UW Oshkosh since 1985. Her area of specialization is the psychology of aging, with particular interest in people living with dementia. She has conducted research on this topic for many years. In spring 2010, she taught the University Honors Senior Seminar and spent the semester exploring dementia from a variety of perspectives with her students. She has just completed a book about friendship with people who have progressive memory loss.

Abstract

Evidence of a human-animal bond goes back to the origins of man. More recently, therapy that utilizes animals has been implemented in long-term care facilities to aid in the well-being of people with dementia. Pet therapy, or animal-assisted therapy, increases engagement with the environment, decreases agitation and depression, and promotes social interaction. Advances in technology have led to alternatives to using live animals. For example, both robotics and video technology have shown promising results. However, several factors limit the ability to evaluate animal-assisted therapy including a lack of controlled studies, the impact of clients’ previous relationships with animals, and the use of by-proxy measures. Addressing these factors
will allow for a clearer picture of the benefits of animal-assisted therapy for people with dementia.

Novelist George Eliot once said, “Animals are such agreeable friends—they ask no questions, they pass no criticisms” (The Quotations Page). The nonjudgmental manner of animals makes them the ideal therapists for people in need of a companion, especially those with physical and mental disabilities. According to the American Veterinary Medical Association, 60 percent of households in the United States have at least one pet (ASPCA 2010). This statistic—along with studies on the human-animal bond—shows that pets are often an important part of a family. In particular, animals can provide a source of social support. This conclusion is supported by the number of Americans who “talk to their pet as they would a person, or consider their pet a confidant” (Beck and Katcher 2003). For older adults facing memory loss, animals supply unconditional love and companionship.

More than five million people in the United States are currently living with Alzheimer’s disease, and this figure is projected to increase dramatically in the coming years (Alzheimer’s Association 2010). Alzheimer’s is a specific type of dementia, which is a general term for the progressive loss of cognitive ability. While there are many forms of dementia, Alzheimer’s is the most common. There is no cure for this disease, so various types of therapy are employed to improve individuals’ quality of life. Some of the behavioral symptoms of Alzheimer’s include depression, apathy, irritability, anxiety, restlessness, and difficulty engaging in social activities (Motomura, Yagi, and Ohyama 2004). One form of treatment that addresses many of these symptoms is animal-assisted therapy (AAT).
When used with people who have been diagnosed with dementia, AAT takes advantage of the human-animal bond to decrease behavioral and emotional problems and to increase social engagement and communication. People with Alzheimer’s may experience difficulty finding the right words or forget what they wanted to say. Increased communication, both verbal and nonverbal, is an important benefit of AAT because it allows people with dementia to express their emotions and ideas and to relate to others. The ability to communicate can decrease the isolation and depression felt by those who have been diagnosed with dementia.

Many people assume that interacting with animals is advantageous, but what does the research indicate, especially with regard to people with dementia? There has been little empirical data to demonstrate who benefits the most from AAT and under what conditions these benefits can be maximized. In addition, the quality of the present research needs to be examined, along with questions that have not yet been addressed. It is important to explore these questions in order to understand whether or not AAT is effective for people with dementia.

**A Brief History of AAT**

American child psychiatrist Boris Levinson is considered the father of pet-facilitated therapy. In the 1960s, he began to use dogs in his sessions with children suffering from emotional or psychological disorders. He found that when a dog was present, the child’s communication increased and he or she was more likely to open up about his or her feelings (Knight and Edwards 2008). Levinson was not the first to use animals as therapists, but he generated interest in the human-animal bond and paved the way for research to be conducted on the possible benefits of AAT, not just for children, but also for the terminally or chronically ill, the elderly, and the depressed.
AAT became widespread in the 1960s and 1970s when the use of complementary and alternative medicine gained popularity in the United States. People wanted to explore different forms of therapy like music or art instead of relying solely on a biomedical approach to treatment.

However, despite its increased use in hospitals and nursing homes around the world, AAT has never been well-regulated. It has always relied on volunteers who are willing to take the time to train their animals and themselves to become practitioners of this form of therapy. There is no governing body that controls the certification of animal-assisted therapists or determines the criteria for training people and their pets to work with vulnerable groups. While AAT has come a long way in achieving its status as a respectable form of treatment for various populations, there is still the question of whether the training of animal handlers and their pets is rigorous and effective.

Training Guidelines and Procedures

To become an animal-assisted therapist, an animal and owner undergo some sort of training to be able to visit people in a health-care setting. Various training programs are available. For example, the Delta Society is a non-profit organization whose mission is to “help lead the world in advancing human health and well-being through positive interactions with animals” (Delta Society 2009). Through their Pet Partners® Program, people can train to visit a variety of facilities such as hospitals, nursing homes, schools, and rehabilitation centers. This program is the only national registry that requires training and screening of animals and their handlers.
Training is provided either through hands-on workshops with licensed instructors or through a home study course. Then the volunteer and his or her pet are evaluated by licensed professionals from Delta Society. For example, the visiting animal must pass a health screening and behavioral tests that show competence in interacting with vulnerable populations. Not every pet has the proper temperament to be around people whose behavior might be unpredictable, as can occur in people with dementia. When people complete the Pet Partners® Program, they are registered as having met the minimum requirements of the Delta Society, but they are not certified.

There are other programs like the Delta Society Pet Partners® Program. Many communities offer obedience classes for dogs, and there are various ways to become registered or certified in AAT. Unfortunately, there is no national organization that oversees the training of animals and their owners. This can make it difficult for someone interested in AAT to find the information they need. A standardized curriculum and evaluation would ensure that every owner and pet that visits a facility had met the minimum requirements to be certified by a central organization.

The Benefits of AAT for People with Dementia

Increased Communication and Social Interaction

One of the benefits most commonly seen with AAT is an increase in social behavior including increased verbal and nonverbal communication. Nancy E. Richeson (2003) conducted a study with 15 nursing home residents who had been diagnosed with dementia. She found that after daily AAT sessions over a period of three weeks participants showed a statistically significant increase in their level of social interaction between the first week and the last week of
the intervention. To determine whether social interaction increased after a therapy session, Richeson used a flow sheet that rated nine items, some of which included “looked at dog”, “spoke to dog”, “reminisced about own dog”, “spoke to handler”, and “remembered handler’s name”.

Richeson added that during the experiment the nursing staff would “engage the participants in conversation regarding the dogs that were about to visit” (2003, 357). It seems that the dogs created a common thread that connected the residents to the staff and gave them something positive to communicate and reminisce about together.

The residents were not just interacting with the dog, but also with the handler, other residents, and staff members. This brings up the question of whether the AAT itself increased the social behavior of the residents or whether it was confounded by the staff’s positive reactions to the therapy. Richeson stated that “the intervention seemed to create an atmosphere of excitement and camaraderie for everyone involved” (2003, 357). Perhaps the residents were simply picking up on the anticipation that the caregivers felt when a dog was brought into the facility, and this led them to increase their social behaviors.

In Holly A. Draeger Chronis’s study of the effects of pet therapy on social interactions and communication among residents of a long-term care facility, she found that 100 percent of participants talked either to the dog, the handler, or a staff member if one was present. Data were gathered via a questionnaire read to participants called “Client Pet Therapy Research Tool.” The questionnaire included yes or no items such as “I reach out to touch people and/or animals” and open-ended questions like “When the animal is here, how do you feel?” A “Pet Therapy Direct Observation Research Tool” was also utilized by the researcher, who observed the participant
during the session and marked any incidences of verbal and nonverbal communication, such as talking, smiling, touching, looking, laughing, and leaning (Chronis 1997).

After the data were collected, each participant response from the questionnaire was coded as either positive (for example, “I love dogs” and “happy”) or negative (“I don’t like them” or “no different”). More than 85 percent of the responses were positive. The researcher also noted the percentage of participants who engaged in each of the social behaviors described in the direct observation portion of the study. For example, it was found that smiling was observed 92 percent of the time and looking at the dog occurred 83 percent of the time (Chronis 2007, 46–47). Overall, these results show a positive correlation between pet therapy and elderly social interaction.

However, there is the possibility that the interpretations of the data were biased, especially since observations of clients’ behaviors were made by the researchers. For example, while it is easy to observe a smile, it is more difficult to figure out the motivation behind the person’s expression and whether or not it has any connection with the therapy dog. This particular study was descriptive instead of experimental, so it cannot give a definitive answer about the effects of AAT on elderly residents. It also did not include people with dementia, which likely would have affected the verbal communication aspect of the study.

The results of these studies suggest that AAT can increase communication and social behavior in people who have been diagnosed with dementia. Social interactions are not only directed toward the animal, but also toward the handler and staff members. While these findings seem promising, it is unclear whether it is the presence of the animal itself that causes the increase in social behavior or whether it is confounded by the presence of the animal’s handler...
and the reactions of the caregivers toward the animal. Further studies should address this issue by controlling for outside factors.

**Decreased Agitation**

In addition to its effect on communication and social interactions, AAT has also been shown to reduce agitation levels in patients with dementia. Mara M. Baun and Barbara W. McCabe (2003) found that the presence of a therapy dog decreased agitation in people with Alzheimer’s who resided in a special care unit. They also found that these effects were most prominent during the late afternoon/early evening, a time that is associated with sundown syndrome, which refers to an increase in confusion and agitation that occurs at this specific time of day. It is possible that the dog had a calming or stress-relieving effect on the patients, which decreased the likelihood that they would exhibit agitated behaviors such as screaming or biting.

Richeson (2003) also studied the effects of AAT on agitation in nursing home residents who had been diagnosed with dementia. The participants in her study were selected based on several criteria including having at least three documented agitated behaviors in the previous two months and needing an intervention for agitation. Results showed a statistically significant decrease in agitated behavior immediately after the intervention and an increase in these behaviors during the follow-up phase. These results indicate that, while the therapy was effective in the dog’s presence, it did not have long-lasting effects on agitation levels. In this study, the therapy sessions were conducted over a nine-week period, but Richeson concluded that “it is not known what is needed to maintain levels of functioning reached after the initial intervention phase” (2003, 357). Few studies have addressed the issue of how often AAT should be implemented (for example, daily vs. weekly) and for how long of a period.
**Decreased Stress**

While increased social behavior and decreased agitation seem to be the most commonly studied benefits of AAT, other effects have also been evaluated. For example, researchers have looked at the link between pet therapy and stress levels. Mary M. DeSchriver and Carol Cutler Riddick (1990) examined the effect of watching an aquarium on the stress levels of people in a publicly subsidized housing unit for the elderly.

In the study, participants watched either a fish aquarium or a fish videotape. Their stress levels were measured before and after the intervention using pulse rate, skin temperature, and muscle tension. Elevated pulse rates, decreased temperature, and high muscle tension are signs of stress, so researchers monitored changes in these three areas. While there were no significant results based on these physiological measures of stress, self-reports by the participants indicated that they found the activity to be enjoyable and relaxing.

DeSchriver and Riddick (1990) also suggested that if a live aquarium is used in a long-term care facility, the residents will benefit more if they are able to make decisions about tank decorations or the types of fish in the tank. In their study, the researchers found that each of the residents who observed the live aquarium took a special interest in one or two fish, and they often gave names to these fish. This bond increased the likelihood that the resident would talk about their favorite fish with other residents and staff.

**Decreased Depression**

Few studies have examined the relationship between AAT and depression, but there is evidence that attachment to a pet has a positive effect on depressive symptoms. Thomas F.
Garrity, Lorann Stallones, Martin B. Marx, and Timothy P. Johnson found that pet attachment in elderly adults was linked to lower levels of depression under certain circumstances. Bereaved elderly who did not have any confidants were less likely to experience depression if they owned a pet. Also, when an elderly person has a low level of social support, a strong pet attachment is associated with less reported illness. Pet ownership and attachment do not seem to have an effect on depression when an elderly person has three or more confidants (Garrity et al. 1989). These findings suggest that in the absence of social support, pets can serve as substitutes for human confidants.

This line of research is useful for AAT because it shows that a lack of human connection can make people vulnerable to depression and illness. Sarah Knight and Victoria Edwards found evidence that “stroking, petting, or being in the presence of an animal can reduce physiological and psychological reactions to stressful situations” (2008, 439). Using AAT to enhance the social interactions of residents—especially those with few confidants and those who have recently lost a loved one—can be beneficial in combating negative psychological affect.

**Alternatives to Using a Live Animal**

Sometimes it is not practical to use a live animal for therapy. If residents have allergies to pet dander, it is unwise to expose them to animals such as dogs and cats. In this case, a fish aquarium might be a good substitute because fish should not aggravate any allergies. However, it can be difficult to interact with fish because they do not provide the same tactile stimulation as other animals. For this reason, it might be more beneficial to utilize other options for AAT including robotic animals and stuffed animals.
Another benefit of using an alternative to the live animal model is that substitutes do not require a trained handler to be present during the therapy. When a live animal is involved, there is always a chance that a resident or the animal itself might be injured or otherwise negatively affected. With a live animal substitute, there is little concern of injury or psychological distress. Several studies have explored the efficacy of using alternatives to live animals, and the findings have generally been positive. This indicates that in cases where it is not feasible to bring a live animal to a facility a substitute can be used to similar effect.

One of the most recent alternatives is the robotic dog AIBO that was first developed by Sony in 1999. Stephen C. Kramer, Erica Friedmann, and Penny L. Bernstein (2009) conducted a study that compared the effects of traditional AAT with AIBO-assisted therapy for people with dementia living in a long-term care facility. AIBO is able to look around, turn, dance, and wave its front legs. It also plays music and has colored lights that flash on its back and head.

It was found that the residents initiated more conversation when the AIBO was present than when the live dog was present. Most of the conversation was either directed at the AIBO itself or at the person who brought the AIBO to the room. When the residents talked to the AIBO handler, most of their questions were about the AIBO, indicating that their attention was focused on the robotic dog.

The researchers also looked at the number of times residents touched the social object (either the live dog or the AIBO) and did not find a significant difference between the two stimuli. This finding is particularly interesting because the AIBO has a plastic covering—a sharp contrast to the soft fur of a live dog. However, it seems that residents were just as willing to touch the AIBO as they were to touch the live animal. Kramer and his colleagues concluded that “interaction between residents suffering from dementia and an AIBO were not only similar to
those with a live dog, but, in some cases, were even more effective” (Kramer, Friedmann, and Bernstein 2009, 56). However, it could be that the novelty of the AIBO had an effect on the results of the study. None of the participants had come in contact with an AIBO before the intervention, while all of them had had at least some exposure to live dogs. It could be that participants spent more time engaging with the AIBO because it was different from what they had previously experienced. It would be interesting to do a long-term study with the AIBO to determine if the positive effects balance out over time as residents become used to the robot.

Another study that explored live animal alternatives used both a plush, non-robotic cat and a robotic cat to determine whether an artificial animal could provide benefits similar to that of a live animal. Alexander Libin and Jiska Cohen-Mansfield used the robotic cat NeCoRo, made by the Omron Corporation in Japan. The plush cat was chosen because it looked similar to the NeCoRo. The robotic cat is covered in synthetic fur and can “adjust to the level of interactivity maintained by its human partner” (Libin and Cohen-Mansfield 2004, 112). Unlike the AIBO, it does not play music or light up.

The researchers measured agitation, affect, and engagement before and after the intervention. They found that the non-robotic cat lowered the level of physical agitation more significantly than the robotic cat did. Affect had the opposite outcome, with the robotic cat yielding more significant results. Levels of engagement did not seem to differ from pre-test to post-test, but it was noted that 78 percent of the participants held the non-robotic cat, while only 22 percent held the NeCoRo cat (Libin and Cohen-Mansfield 2004, 113).

The overall conclusion of the study was that artificial animals can provide benefits comparable to those of live animals. However, this was only a preliminary study, and, while the robotic and non-robotic cats seemed to have positive outcomes for agitation and affect, they did
not appear to affect communication and environmental engagement as well as traditional pet therapy. Robotic animals cannot discern nonverbal cues as well as live animals, which could explain why residents do not engage with these artificial creatures as much as they do with a real animal.

There are other substitutes for traditional AAT besides robots and stuffed toys. Marcia S. Marx and her colleagues (2010) examined the impacts of different dog-related stimuli on the engagement of people with dementia. Researchers used large, medium, and small live dogs, a robotic dog, a plush dog, a puppy video, and a dog-coloring activity. Results showed that, on average, participants engaged with the puppy video longer than any of the other stimuli. The lowest engagement was with the dog-coloring activity. The highest number of responses by residents occurred in the presence of the live dogs, and the fewest responses occurred in the plush dog and coloring groups.

The researchers also found that the participants had predominantly positive attitudes toward all of the stimuli except the coloring activity. This suggests that while live animals produce more communication than the alternatives, residents were still interested in the robotic, plush, and video dogs and that recorded material can engage people with dementia.

However, it was noted that real dogs are “more adept at reading subtle body language and responding appropriately…and show genuine affection and pleasure during interactions” (Marx et al. 2010, 44). Despite improvements in technology, robotic animals are still not able to provide the type of unconditional positive regard that live animals can. For example, while an AIBO can be programmed to make certain responses, it is not as adaptable as an actual dog. It cannot reciprocate the fondness that a person with dementia feels or offer the same spiritual connection
that a living, breathing creature can. Non-robotic, plush animals and videos might engage a person with dementia, but they do not offer much in the way of interaction and communication. Despite these drawbacks, in cases where it is not feasible to bring a live animal into a facility, substitutes are at least an alternative that can provide some benefit.

Limitations of AAT Studies

Lack of Controlled Studies

Many of the studies on the benefits of AAT have been observational or correlational, meaning that they cannot provide cause-and-effect data. Of the experimental studies that have been conducted, few have included a control group. Those that do utilize a separate control group tend to overlook certain important factors including the use of behavior-modifying medication, which is commonly used in the dementia population (Perkins et al. 2008). Medication can have an effect on mood and overall functioning, which could impact the way participants in these studies react to the therapy.

Another factor that is often not controlled for in AAT studies is the severity of participants’ dementia. A person’s level of cognitive functioning could have a significant impact on the results of an AAT session. The type of connection with the therapy animal might need to be adjusted based on the progression of a person’s symptoms. Without controlling for this aspect, it can be difficult to get a clear picture of the benefits that animals bring to residents living with dementia. More research involving this component will bring us closer to understanding how the severity of dementia affects a person’s interaction with animals.

An additional limitation is how the results of the study are measured. Often, a person with dementia cannot directly communicate whether a pet therapy session was beneficial to him
or her. There have not been self-report instruments designed to allow people with dementia to report on their own feelings about animal contact (Perkins et al. 2008). This means that proxy measures are commonly used to gauge whether a resident had any tangible improvements because of AAT. Caregivers and family members might be asked to report any changes in a person’s behavior or affect that could be a result of the intervention. This method of measurement is prone to bias because simply being exposed to the therapy animal might influence caregivers to project their feelings about the pet on the person receiving the therapy.

More objective forms of measurement should be used to determine the outcome of a study. For example, the “Apathy and Irritability Scale” can be used to assess changes in levels of agitation, and the “Social Behaviour Observation Checklist” can be used to examine social behaviors during a session (Perkins et al. 2008).

**Previous Experience with Animals**

It is likely that a person’s previous engagement with animals affects their reaction to AAT. Researchers often recruit participants based on past relationships with animals and may exclude those who dislike or fear the animal to be used in the study. This method of selecting participants leads to biased results because it does not control for this important aspect of a person’s experience.

Susan Filan and Robert H. Llewellyn-Jones examined the literature on AAT for dementia and concluded that “most visiting pet-study participants have a prior history of positive interaction with animals and their results are restricted to such individuals” (2006, 606). It is important to determine under what circumstances and for which patients AAT is the most beneficial form of therapy and how it compares to other forms of therapy for elderly people.
(Beck and Katcher, 2003). To accomplish this, more controlled studies need to be conducted that include a wider diversity of residents with dementia and that examine aspects of the environment and the participant’s past that may affect results.

**Duration of Program**

Studies on the benefits of AAT have used various approaches to implement the therapy. They differ in the length of each session (generally ranging from 10 minutes to several hours) and the duration of the program (often between 1 and 12 weeks). There is no consensus on how long an AAT program should last for a person to achieve optimal benefits. More sessions may not necessarily equal better results, as participants may become used to interacting with the animal and no longer respond as positively as they did in the first few sessions.

Another concern has to do with the duration of the impact of AAT. Richeson (2003) measured participants’ behavior two weeks post-intervention and found that behavior had returned to baseline levels, suggesting that the positive effects of the therapy were not long lasting. Few other studies have followed up on participants after the AAT sessions ended. This leaves us with a limited understanding of the stability of improvements in behavior and affect due to AAT.

**Conclusion**

A variety of studies suggest that AAT can be beneficial for people with dementia living in long-term care facilities. Increases in social behavior and communication and decreases in stress, agitation, and depression have all been observed during AAT sessions. AAT can provide
people with dementia the chance to positively interact with another living creature. This can be especially beneficial for those who have a history of previous engagement with animals.

However, there are many problems with the way that AAT is currently implemented and evaluated. Training programs for animal handlers are not standardized; there is no national or international organization setting core requirements for obtaining certification in AAT. People who bring their animals to long-term care facilities do so on a volunteer basis, so it can be difficult to establish a consistent schedule for AAT in a facility. A lack of controlled studies and little understanding about the conditions in which people with dementia would most benefit from AAT have led to criticism that pet therapy is not a good alternative to more established forms of therapy such as occupational or music therapy.

It is difficult to weigh the benefits of AAT against the limitations without further study on various aspects of this relatively new form of intervention. Further research should focus on determining the characteristics of people who benefit the most from AAT and the best way to implement sessions in long-term care facilities. Better statistical methods for measuring changes in participants’ behavior and affect coupled with the use of control groups will improve the reliability and validity of future studies.

Finally, it is necessary to review the programs that offer training and certification in AAT to ensure that they are upholding ethical standards and providing volunteers with enough practice in working with vulnerable populations. Having one organization that oversees all these programs would be a big step toward standardizing curriculum and implementation of AAT. There is a special bond between humans and animals; AAT is a way to utilize that bond to enrich the lives of people with dementia.
Bibliography


